

Theology on the Web.org.uk

Making Biblical Scholarship Accessible

This document was supplied for free educational purposes. Unless it is in the public domain, it may not be sold for profit or hosted on a webserver without the permission of the copyright holder.

If you find it of help to you and would like to support the ministry of Theology on the Web, please consider using the links below:



Buy me a coffee

<https://www.buymeacoffee.com/theology>



PATREON

<https://patreon.com/theologyontheweb>

PayPal

<https://paypal.me/robbradshaw>

A table of contents for *Scottish Bulletin of Evangelical Theology* can be found here:

https://biblicalstudies.org.uk/articles_sbct-01.php

GOD WITH MEN IN THE PROPHETS AND THE WRITINGS: AN EXAMINATION OF THE NATURE OF GOD'S PRESENCE

JAMES HAMILTON, SOUTHWESTERN BAPTIST THEOLOGICAL SEMINARY,
HOUSTON, TEXAS

I. INTRODUCTION

Evangelical biblical theologians have the joyful task of seeking to incorporate everything the Bible says into our expositions of the theology contained in the Bible. Unlike our more critical counterparts, we do not (intentionally) excise texts that do not fit into our paradigms. It is clear from the NT that the New Covenant faithful become and remain believers because they are regenerated and indwelt by God's Spirit (e.g. Gal. 3:3; Rom. 8:9-11). Some infer that, 'Since He keeps the NT saint by indwelling... it seems reasonable to believe that He kept the Old Testament saint in the same way.'¹ One of the working hypotheses of the present study is that John 7:39 forbids this inference.² The thesis of this study is that God's presence *with*, not *in*, his people is the OT's way of describing how believers were kept. In order to establish this thesis, I will seek to show that there is no evidence in the material in the OT from Joshua

¹ Leon J. Wood, *The Holy Spirit in the Old Testament* (Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 1976), p. 70.

² John 7:39 bars the path to the conclusion that Old Covenant believers were indwelt. See chapter 4 of my dissertation, 'He Is with You and He Will Be in You' (Ph.D. diss., The Southern Baptist Theological Seminary, 2003), a revised version of which will appear from Broadman & Holman. John 7:39 does not say that the Spirit did not exist prior to the glorification of Jesus, nor that the Spirit was not giving spiritual life to believers. John 7:39 does say that *those who had believed were about to receive* the Spirit. In view of the 'reception' language in John 14:17 and 20:22 (7:39; 14:17; and 20:22 all employ forms of *lambano* ('I receive')), it seems that the reception of the indwelling Spirit is in view in John 7:39.

through to Malachi that OT saints were continually indwelt by the Spirit on an individual basis.³

John 7:39 indicates that the Holy Spirit would not be received by believers until after the cross.⁴ This study seeks to establish what the OT does and does not say about the presence of God with regard to its faithful. The aims of this study are two: first, to draw attention to the pervasive reality of God's presence with his people in the Prophets and the Writings;⁵ second, to argue that God maintains his Old Covenant remnant by abiding with his people.

These two points are significant because in the OT there is a direct correlation between the favourable presence of God and the well-being of his people, physical as well as spiritual. The OT, however, does not present God creating and keeping his believing remnant by granting his Spirit to continually dwell in each individual member of the remnant. God's dwelling place in the OT is in the midst of his people, but in the midst of them means in the tabernacle and later the temple, not in their individual bodies.

This investigation will follow the salvation historical timeline reflected in the OT, paying attention to the relationship between the presence of God and the faithfulness of the Old Covenant remnant.⁶ There are a number

³ For a similar study of the Pentateuch, see James M. Hamilton, 'God with Men in the Torah', *WTJ* 65 (2003), pp. 113-33.

⁴ Cf. also John 14:17 and 16:7. Pace W. C. Kaiser, *Toward Rediscovering the Old Testament* (Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 1987), pp. 139-40; B. B. Warfield, 'The Spirit of God in the Old Testament,' in *Biblical Doctrines* (1929; reprint, Edinburgh: Banner of Truth Trust, 1988), esp. pp. 128-9; Wood, *The Holy Spirit in the Old Testament*. See further James M. Hamilton, 'Old Covenant Believers and the Indwelling Spirit: A Survey of the Spectrum of Opinion', *TJ* 24 (2003), pp. 37-54. For a whole Bible treatment of these issues, see Hamilton (note 2). For a summary, see James Hamilton, 'Were Old Covenant Believers Indwelt by the Holy Spirit?' *Them* 30 (2004), pp. 12-22.

⁵ Samuel Terrien argues that this motif, God's presence, is central for biblical theology (*The Elusive Presence: Toward a New Biblical Theology*, Religious Perspectives 26 [New York: Harper & Row, 1978], pp. 3-4).

⁶ The title of this study reflects the approach mandated by W. J. Dumbrell, 'any theology of the Old Testament had best adhere to the Hebrew canonical sequence of Law, Prophets, and Writings' (Dumbrell, *The Faith of Israel* [Grand Rapids: Baker, 1988], p. 11). The rabbis seem to have followed this arrangement (cf. *b. B. Bat.* 14b), and it was articulated by Jesus himself (Luke 24:44). Because this study is concerned with the elucidation of salvation-history, it will proceed through the material chronologically.

of ways in which God's presence is communicated in the OT. Perhaps the two most prominent are the direct statements that 'God was with him'⁷ and the many references to God's dwelling place.⁸ Beginning from the period of the conquest and the reign of the judges, continuing through the period of the monarchy with the construction of the temple and the pre-exilic prophets, then through the period of the exile and the return, and finally in the writings that accompany these events, it will be argued here that the faithful remnant in the OT were maintained by God's presence *with* them. We begin with the conquest and the judges.

II. THE CONQUEST AND THE JUDGES

There is no evidence in the Pentateuch that each individual member of the believing remnant was continually indwelt by the Holy Spirit of Yahweh. There is, on the other hand, plenty of evidence to indicate that God's presence remained *with* his people. Indeed, God took up residence in the tabernacle (Exod. 40:34), not in each individual believer.⁹ The picture sketched in Torah receives yet more detail in the narratives that recount the conquest of the land and the period of the judges. As the period before the monarchy is described, no more evidence is given to indicate that all believing Israelites were indwelt by the Holy Spirit for the duration of their walk with God. On the other hand, the pentateuchal notes that ring God's presence *with* his people continue to be sounded.

We read of God *with* his people, of Yahweh *in the midst of* and *among* the people. The nation *meets* with God, and continues to conceive of life as being lived *before* and *in the presence of* Yahweh. The best explanation for all of these expressions is Israel's conviction that their God inhabits the

⁷ This can take the form of Yahweh stating, 'I will be with you', or of the narrator observing, 'Yahweh was with him (them)', or of one character stating to another, 'May Yahweh be with you' or 'Yahweh is with you'. See the column 'God with Men' on the five charts at the end of this study. Cf. M. A. Grisanti, *NIDOTTE*, 1:1024.

⁸ See the five charts at the end of this study for various ways in which God's dwelling place is designated; the multitude of references shows that this theme pervades the OT.

⁹ Hamilton, 'God with Men in the Torah'.

tabernacle he instructed them to build.¹⁰ This section will discuss these themes in Joshua, Judges, Ruth, and 1 Samuel 1:1–7:17.¹¹

A. God was with him

God was *with* the fathers, he was *with* the people to bring them out of Egypt and sustain them in the wilderness, and once again he promises to be *with* Joshua (Josh. 1:5).¹² Joshua then commands the people, 'Do not tremble and do not be dismayed, because Yahweh your God is with you wherever you go' (1:9).¹³ The people then respond to Joshua's charge with the words, 'May Yahweh your God be with you just as he was with Moses' (1:17). The threefold stress on Yahweh's presence *with* the people at the outset of the conquest demonstrates the significance of the reality for the nation's well-being.¹⁴

When the capture of territories by individual tribes is related, we read, 'And Yahweh was with Judah, and they took the hill country' (Judg. 1:19). Similarly, 'And the house of Joseph went up also to Bethel, and Yahweh was with them' (1:22). As the period of the judges is summarized, the writer notes, 'And when Yahweh raised up judges for them, Yahweh would be with the judge in order to save them from the hand of their enemies all the days of the judge' (2:18).¹⁵ Yahweh's presence with the judge is not only for physical protection, it also had a sanctifying effect upon the nation, for we read, 'And when the judge died they would return and cause more corruption than their fathers' (2:19).

The pattern established by this early summary is carried through the narratives found in Judges. Only with Gideon is the phrase, 'Yahweh is with you' explicitly stated (6:12, 16). But when the judges were raised up

¹⁰ C. R. Koester, *The Dwelling of God: The Tabernacle in the Old Testament, Intertestamental Jewish Literature, and the New Testament* (Washington: Catholic Biblical Association of America, 1989), p. 8.

¹¹ 1 Samuel 8 and following will be discussed below with the monarchy. Representative passages will be given here. For more references, see Chart 1: 'God's Presence in the Conquest – the Judges.'

¹² T. C. Butler, *Joshua* (Waco: Word, 1983), p. 12.

¹³ Unless otherwise noted all translations of biblical texts are my own.

¹⁴ Butler calls this 'one of the basic roots of Israelite faith' (*Joshua*, p. 12).

¹⁵ The summarizing nature of this verse can be seen in the frequentative *w-qatalti* forms continuing the temporal *kī* (cf. Joüon §119 u–v; §166 n–o; GKC §112 e; §164 d).

and 'the Spirit of Yahweh' came upon them, Yahweh was with his people.¹⁶

One of the emphases of the book of Ruth is that while the nation is largely degenerate in the period of the judges, the faithful of the land are those who seem to be insignificant. The book of Ruth testifies to the presence of a remnant, however small, within the nation. Significantly, this remnant is preserving the line of the Messiah (Ruth 4:18-22).¹⁷ It is no accident that Boaz greets the reapers with the words, 'May Yahweh be with you' (2:4). The statement demonstrates that even in the midst of everyday life Boaz has pious desires for the people with whom he deals. Expressions of this nature are rare in these accounts of the days when the judges ruled Israel. The only other instance of such a phrase I have located occurs in a description of Samuel, 'And Yahweh was with him' (1 Sam. 3:19). Indications that each individual member of the faithful remnant was continually indwelt by the Spirit are not to be found in these narratives.

B. God in the midst of the people

Just as Yahweh was in the midst of the camp as the Israelites journeyed in the wilderness, Yahweh was in the midst of the community during the days of the conquest and the rule of the judges. Joshua tells the people that, 'In this you shall know that the living God is in your midst, when he indeed dispossesses from before you the Canaanite, the Hittite, the Hivite, the Perizzite, the Girgashite, the Amorite, and the Jebusite' (3:10).

Later in Joshua, when civil war is narrowly averted (22:10-30), Phineas comments upon the reconciliation, 'Today we know that Yahweh is among

¹⁶ Cf. D. I. Block, 'The rulers functioned as agents of the divine presence' (*Judges, Ruth* [Nashville: Broadman & Holman, 1999], p. 131). The Spirit 'came upon' Kenaz (3:9-10), 'clothed' Gideon (6:34), 'came upon' Jephthah (11:29), 'began to impel' Samson (13:25), 'rushed upon him' (14:6, 19; 15:14), and then 'departed from upon him' (16:20). None of these expressions indicate that the Spirit dwelt in these people continually, nor do they show that the remnant of this time period (e.g. Ruth, Boaz, Naomi) were indwelt by the Spirit. What Kenaz, Gideon, Jephthah, and Samson experienced is similar to what Bezalel (Exod. 31:2-3; 35:31), Oholiab (31:6), Saul (1 Sam. 10:9; 11:6; 16:14), and David (16:13) experienced. OT saints can be regenerate and occasionally empowered, while NT saints are regenerate, continually indwelt, and sometimes empowered.

¹⁷ C. F. Keil, *Joshua, Judges, Ruth, 1 and 2 Samuel*, vol. 2 of *Commentary on the Old Testament*, by C. F. Keil and F. Delitzsch (1866-91; reprint, Peabody: Hendrickson, 2001), p. 339.

us' (22:31). This comment arises because the tribes who had built the altar that occasioned the conflict had not intended to be unfaithful to Yahweh (22:31). Phineas is confident that the nation's assurance of Yahweh's presence has not been threatened because he is satisfied that those who had built the altar had not meant rebellion (22:29). When the nation is later unsuccessful in battle, and in the process loses possession of the ark, dejection is expressed with the words, 'The glory has departed from Israel' (1 Sam. 4:21). Again, God is *with*, but not *in*, his people, and here the loss of his presence is symbolized by the loss of the ark.

C. Before Yahweh

The biblical authors describe life as lived 'before Yahweh', thus communicating their conviction that Yahweh is present with Israel.¹⁸ The Jordan is crossed 'before Yahweh' (Josh. 4:13). Lots are cast for land 'before Yahweh' (18:8, 10). Joshua gives the people a final charge prior to his death 'before Yahweh' (24:1). Both acts of piety (1 Sam. 1:12) and acts of wickedness (2:17) are committed 'before Yahweh'. This seems to be another pointer in the direction of God being with, but not in, his people.

D. The dwelling of God

God's dwelling place is described in a number of ways in the narratives being considered. Identifying an omnipresent being (cf. Ps. 139:7-12) with a particular location is always an analogical oversimplification.¹⁹ Nevertheless, when reference is made to the tent of meeting (Josh. 18:1; 19:51), the tabernacle (22:19, 29), the ark of God (Judg. 20:26-27; 1 Sam. 4:4; 6:7),²⁰ or the temple (1 Sam. 3:3), it is always with the understanding that God is there.²¹

E. Summary

As in the period of the wilderness wanderings,²² in the period of the conquest through to the regency of the judges there is no evidence that God's Spirit continually indwelt each individual member of the remnant. Also, as before, there is evidence that Yahweh had enabled (i.e. circumcised

¹⁸ Ian Wilson, *Out of the Midst of the Fire: Divine Presence in Deuteronomy* (Atlanta: Scholars Press, 1995). For a catalogue of references to this reality in the Prophets and the Writings, see the relevant column on the charts at the end of this study.

¹⁹ Cf. B. E. Baloian, 'Anthropomorphisms,' *NIDOTTE*, 4:391-4.

²⁰ S. T. Hague, *NIDOTTE*, 1:503, cf. also p. 506.

²¹ Wilson, *Out of the Midst of the Fire*, p. 217.

²² Hamilton, 'God with Men in the Torah'.

the hearts of/regenerated) some to believe and live by faith. These are sustained in faith by God's promises and presence in the midst of the nation, which they experience when they appear before him (cf. 1 Sam. 1:1-18). These narratives give no evidence that God's Spirit continuously indwelt the faithful of this time period.

III. THE MONARCHY AND THE TEMPLE

Because this examination of the OT is treating the material historically, this section will examine both the narratives that record the period of the monarchy and the writing prophets who were active in the pre-exilic period. It will again be seen that God is *with* – but not *in* – his people. It is also necessary to note that there is evidence in these narratives that believers understood their need to be enabled by Yahweh to obey, and that they thought of God dwelling in their midst in the temple, not in each of them as individuals. For example, David prays,

O Yahweh, God of Abraham, Isaac, and Israel, our fathers, preserve this [willingness (29:17)] forever in the intentions of the plans of the heart of your people, and make their hearts firm toward you. As for Solomon my son, give to him a complete heart to keep your commandments, your testimonies, your statutes, in order to do all of them and to build the temple for which I have made provision (1 Chr. 29:18-19).

David clearly thinks that the people need Yahweh to sustain them in their good intentions, that if Solomon is going to have the necessary heart Yahweh must give it to him, and that Yahweh is going to dwell in the temple. This seems to warrant the conclusion that there were some whose hearts God had inclined toward obedience. In the OT's terms, they had circumcised hearts (cf. Deut. 10:16; 30:6), but there is nothing in the text to support the conclusion that God's Spirit took up residence within them. The Lord's dwelling place was the temple (cf. 1 Kgs 8:57-58).²³ When God's Spirit does take up residence within people, worship at specific locations will end (cf. John 2:16-21; 4:21-24).²⁴

A. Narratives of Israel's monarchy

Beginning in 1 Samuel 8 and continuing through 2 Samuel and 1–2 Kings, the reader finds accounts of the nation from roughly 1,000 BC down

²³ W. Hildebrandt, *An Old Testament Theology of the Spirit of God* (Peabody: Hendrickson, 1995), p. 47.

²⁴ R. E. Averbeck, 'Tabernacle', in *DOTP*, p. 826.

to the destruction of Jerusalem (586 BC) and the Babylonian captivity. The Chronicles were written after the exile, but they deal with the period of the monarchy and will be included at this point in the discussion. These accounts deal with the state of the nation from the beginning of the monarchy until the nation is taken into exile.²⁵

So far in the narratives under consideration, we have seen a plenitude of evidence that Yahweh was *with* his Old Covenant remnant, and his presence has been communicated in a variety of ways. What we have not seen is any direct evidence that the biblical authors meant to communicate that the Holy Spirit indwelt each member of the faithful remnant.²⁶ As before, so here: direct statements that, 'Yahweh was with him', continue to be made. The biblical authors continue to conceive of life 'in the presence of' or 'before Yahweh'. The tent of meeting, the tabernacle, and the ark continue to figure significantly, and God's presence among his people is dramatically reinforced when Yahweh comes to dwell in the temple. Each of these themes will be briefly considered here.²⁷

1. *God with his people.* Samuel assures Saul with the words, 'For God is with you' (1 Sam. 10:7).²⁸ Samuel assures the nation, 'For Yahweh

²⁵ Space constraints require that the Chronicles be included here, but the different needs that the Chronicler wrote to meet are not being ignored.

²⁶ It might be objected that the indwelling of the Spirit was yet to be revealed, and, because revelation is progressive, the fact that the Bible does not speak in those terms is no indication that the reality was not being experienced. One would think that those who wish to read the OT 'on its own terms' (i.e. no reading the NT into the Old) would not make recourse to this argument. Ironically, however, some of the most insistent that the NT not be read into the OT are inclined to this position. There are at least two responses to this argument from progressive revelation. First, the OT passages that indicate that a day will come when the Spirit will be poured out are always passages that point to the age to come. Second, the argument from progressive revelation is an argument from silence that flies in the face of John 7:39, which dictates that the Spirit will not be received until Jesus is glorified.

²⁷ As in the foregoing discussions, representative passages will be cited. For a fuller list of passages on each theme, see Chart 2: 'God's Presence in the Monarchy' below. Note the frequency of these expressions.

²⁸ It seems that when Samuel tells Saul that the Spirit will come upon him, the reader is not intended to conceive of the Spirit 'indwelling' Saul. Samuel says to Saul, 'the Spirit of Yahweh will rush upon you with the result that you will prophesy with them, and you will be turned to another man. And it shall be when these signs come to you, do for yourself whatever your hand finds, for God is with you' (1 Sam. 10:6-7). The Spirit will *come upon* Saul

will not abandon his people on account of his great name' (12:22). David is routinely characterized as one whom God is with (16:18; 17:37; 18:12-13).²⁹ On one occasion Yahweh indicates that he has been with Israel throughout their history since the Exodus (1 Sam. 7:7). For Israel to succeed she must 'be strong and act, and may Yahweh be with the good' (2 Chr. 19:11).³⁰ At the dedication of the temple it becomes clear that Solomon regards Yahweh's presence with his people as having a sanctifying effect upon them. Solomon prays, 'May Yahweh our God be with us as he was with our fathers! May he neither forsake us nor abandon us, that he may incline our hearts to himself, to walk in all his ways, to keep his commandments and statutes and judgments just as he commanded our fathers' (1 Kgs 8:57-58).

The significance of 1 Kgs 8:57-58 cannot be overstated. The dedication of the temple is the apex of Israel's national history. Her wisest king reigns; her territory is expansive; her economy thrives; her enemies are subdued; and her God has been pleased to dwell in her midst. Solomon knows that God's presence with the people via his dwelling in the temple is the key to national sanctification, so at the dedication he asks Yahweh to

and God will be *with* him. Later we read, 'Now the Spirit of Yahweh had departed from being with Saul' (16:14). It is difficult to be sure whether or not we are meant to understand from this passage that Saul was enabled to believe (i.e. regenerated). The fact that he was 'turned to another man' (10:6) is countered by the fruit he later bore – he tried to kill David (e.g. 19:1, 10) and Jonathan (20:33), consulted with a witch (28:8-19), and does not appear to have died in faith (31:4). We cannot be sure of Saul's status before God, but we can say that the Bible does not tell us that Saul was indwelt by the Spirit for the duration of his earthly sojourn, for the Spirit left him (1 Sam. 16:14). There does seem to be an indication that the Spirit being upon Saul was a special anointing for kingship: Samuel says to him, 'And Yahweh has departed from upon you.... and Yahweh has torn the kingdom from your hand' (28:16-17).

²⁹ For the many references of this nature, see Chart 2 below. With regard to David and the Spirit, as with Saul we read, 'And the Spirit of Yahweh rushed to David from that day forward' (1 Sam. 16:13). Because the next verse recounts the Spirit leaving Saul, the author probably intended to contrast Saul's experience with the Spirit with that enjoyed by David. In my view, this contrast should inform our understanding of Ps. 51:13 [ET 11], 'Do not take your Holy Spirit from me.' If David knew that the Spirit of anointing for kingship had been taken from Saul upon his sin, would he not have expected that the same could happen to him?

³⁰ This verse captures the biblical balance between divine sovereignty and human responsibility. Both are necessary and affirmed.

dwell in the temple and thereby incline the hearts of the people to obedience (1 Kgs 8:57-58). This text demonstrates that Yahweh did indeed operate upon the hearts of his people. He enabled them to believe. But as has been seen above, their maintenance in faith is not effected by God's Spirit dwelling in them. Solomon understands the sanctification of the remnant not as coming through God dwelling in each of them, but as coming through God dwelling in the midst of them – in the temple.

When the nation first took a king, Samuel promised that Yahweh would not abandon his people (1 Sam. 12:22). But as the nation's sin under the monarchy neared its completion, in faithful fulfilment of the covenant curses (cf. Deut. 27-28), Yahweh declared his intention to abandon his people (2 Kgs 21:14). As will be seen below, though he abandoned the city to be plundered and the temple to be burned (25:9), believers were nevertheless preserved through the exile (e.g. Daniel, Shadrach, Meshach, and Abednego).

2. *In the presence of God.* As we have seen above, because God is present in the midst of the people, he sees what the people do, hears what they say, and they live before him. On special occasions, such as the selection and anointing of a king, the people appear before God (1 Sam. 10:19; 11:15; 1 Chr. 11:3). When Saul disobeys, Samuel rebukes him for doing 'the evil in the sight of Yahweh' (15:19). Similarly, when David sins the narrator comments, 'The matter which David had done was evil in the sight of Yahweh' (2 Sam. 11:27). At the dedication of the temple Solomon makes reference in his prayer to Yahweh's servants 'who walk before you with all their hearts' (1 Kgs 8:23).³¹ Kings are evaluated on the basis of whether they do good or evil 'in the sight of Yahweh' (e.g. 15:5, 8; 16:7, 25).

When the evil of the nation had reached its completion, 'Yahweh was exceedingly angry with Israel, and he removed them from his presence.... he cast them out of his sight.... he removed them from his presence' (2 Kgs 17:18, 20, 23). Judah remained (17:18) but not for much longer. Yahweh soon proclaimed, 'I will also remove Judah from my presence just as I removed Israel. And I will reject this city which I have chosen, Jerusalem, and the house of which I said, my name shall be there' (23:27). In some real sense, living before Yahweh in the Old Covenant was bound

³¹ Solomon's reference to those who walk before Yahweh with a whole heart (1 Kgs 8:23) and Hanani the seer's dictum that, 'As for Yahweh, his eyes are roaming in all the land that he may strengthen the hearts of those who are complete toward him' (2 Chr. 16:9), hint at the presence of a remnant whose hearts are circumcised.

up with living in Israel, particularly in Jerusalem near the temple. More of this will be seen when Israel's other writings are considered, but for now it suffices to mention that this mindset explains the many places where the Psalmists long to be in Jerusalem at the temple. For example, 'I rejoiced when they said to me, "Let us go up to the house of Yahweh!"' (Ps. 122:1).

3. *The tabernacle.* Before David brought the ark into Jerusalem (2 Sam. 6:12-17), and before the ark's sojourn among the Philistines and various sites in Israel, it had apparently been in Shiloh (1 Sam. 4:3-4). Meanwhile the tabernacle and its altar seem to have been located in Gibeon (2 Chr. 1:3-5).³² Prior to the building of the temple, when Yahweh put his name in Jerusalem to be worshiped only there, worship at Gibeon was acceptable. After all, Solomon sacrificed there (1 Kgs 3:3-4), and that night Yahweh appeared to him in a dream granting his request for wisdom (3:5-14). Solomon responded by going to Jerusalem to sacrifice before the ark, but this does not appear to be in repentance for having sacrificed at the tabernacle in Gibeon.³³

God's presence with the ark is stated when the narrator describes it. We read, 'The ark of God which is called by the name, the name of Yahweh Sabaoth, who sits with respect to the cherubim³⁴ upon it' (2 Sam. 6:2; cf. 1 Chr. 13:6). The ark was eventually placed in the holy of holies (1 Kgs 8:1-11).

God's presence with the tabernacle is seen in his response to David's desire to build the temple, 'But I have been going about in a tent, even in

³² Prior to the construction of the tabernacle Moses would meet with God in the 'tent of meeting' (Exod. 33:7-11). After the tabernacle was constructed, the tabernacle was alternately referred to as the tent of meeting (cf. e.g. 1 Chr. 6:31-32). When David brought the ark into Jerusalem he apparently felt no compulsion to bring the tabernacle to Jerusalem as well, for he pitched a tent for the ark in Zion (1 Chr. 15:1), while the tabernacle Moses built remained at Gibeon (1 Chr. 21:29; 2 Chr. 1:3).

³³ P. House, *1, 2 Kings* (Nashville: Broadman & Holman, 1995), pp. 109, 111-12.

³⁴ Translation of the phrase *yoshev hakeruvim* (2 Sam. 6:2; 1 Chr. 13:6) is difficult. *hakeruvim* is an 'indirect accusative of local determination' (Jouön §126h; cf. also GKC §118q). The NASB renders this phrase, 'who is enthroned *above* the cherubim'. KJV, NKJV, and NIV read, 'who is enthroned *between* the cherubim'. ESV and NRSV read, 'enthroned on the cherubim'. The lack of consensus arises from the vagueness of the Hebrew phrase – we are not told precisely where (above, on, or between?) with respect to the cherubim Yahweh sits, but he is there.

the tabernacle' (2 Sam. 7:6). God had dwelt in the midst of his people in the tabernacle, and the people had lived in his presence before him. The ark represented God's presence with his people. David's desire to build the temple was answered by God's promise to build David's house, and his promise that David's seed would indeed build the temple (7:12-13).

4. *The temple.* Since he was not allowed to build the temple himself, David commenced gathering necessary materials for the house of cedar Solomon would build. In God's providence, the threshing floor of Araunah the Jebusite in the mountains of Moriah was chosen as the site for the temple (2 Sam. 24).³⁵ Once Solomon's kingdom was established (1 Kgs 1-5), he began building the temple (6:1) and was seven years in building it (6:38).

Just as select individuals were 'filled with the Spirit of wisdom' (Exod. 28:3; cf. also 31:2-3; 35:31) for the work on the tabernacle, Hiram of Tyre was 'filled with wisdom and understanding and knowledge to do all work with bronze' (1 Kgs 7:14).³⁶ Just as 'the cloud covered the tent of meeting and the glory of Yahweh filled the tabernacle' (Exod. 40:34), 'the glory of Yahweh filled the house of Yahweh' (1 Kgs 8:11). Just as 'Moses was not able to enter the tent of meeting because the cloud settled upon it' (Exod. 40:35), 'the priests were not able to stand in order to minister from the presence of the cloud' (1 Kgs 8:11). Just as Yahweh demonstrated his acceptance of the nation by taking up residence in the tabernacle, he took up residence in the temple. Walther Eichrodt points out that all the places

³⁵ Terrien's explanation of why this site was chosen appears to reject the reasons given in 2 Samuel 24 (*Elusive Presence*, pp. 187-8).

³⁶ This 'filling' was not normative for all Israelites. Phrases such as 'filled with the Spirit of wisdom' do not reflect the way that the Israelites referred to all 'giftings' or 'talents', for talented singers are not described as 'filled with the Spirit of wisdom for making song'. Ezra is not described as 'filled with the Spirit of wisdom for teaching Torah'. David's talent with the harp results in him being described as 'knowing how to play' (1 Sam. 16:18). In this same context, as David's blessed life is described, we read, 'And Yahweh is with him' (16:18), but not that he was 'filled with the Spirit of wisdom for making music'. Other descriptions of facility in various arts include 'wise' (1 Chr. 22:15), 'learned/trained' (25:7), 'discerning/skillful' (25:7). The descriptions of people being 'filled' with skill for a task are rare and come on highly significant occasions – the building of the tabernacle and the temple, respectively. The only places in the OT where *ruach* (spirit) is used with *mal'e* (fill) are Exod. 28:3; 31:3; 35:31; Deut. 34:9; Mic. 3:8. Those who experienced this 'filling' in the OT were equipped for particular tasks.

from which Israel could approach her God 'are ultimately superseded by the Temple of Zion'.³⁷

There are a few observations regarding Solomon's prayer of dedication that will prove important for the present inquiry. First, though it is true that Yahweh has just filled the temple (8:10-11), Solomon acknowledges from the outset that Yahweh is not contained by the temple (8:27). Further, Solomon pleads no fewer than eight times for Yahweh to hear *from heaven* when his people pray *toward this place* (8:30, 31-32, 33-34, 35-36, 38-39, 42-43, 44-45, 48-49). Neither aspect is insignificant.³⁸ On the one hand Solomon asks Yahweh to hear from heaven, 'your dwelling place' (8:30, 39, 43, 49). On the other hand, there is a real sense in which Yahweh is to be addressed from the temple in Jerusalem – so after the inevitable sin of the people (8:46) they are to repent by seeking God in Jerusalem at the temple. This explains why it matters that Daniel, in exile, has windows opened toward Jerusalem as he prays three times a day (Dan. 6:10). Again, Yahweh's presence in the temple is presented as enabling the nation to obey (cf. 1 Kgs 8:57-58; 1 Chr. 29:18-19).

After Solomon's death the nation begins a slow but persistent decline. Remarkably, no mention of the temple is made between 1 Kings 14 and 2 Kings 10. As Israel spirals into the likeness of her neighbours, as the kings induce the people to increase transgression, the place Yahweh has chosen to put his name is not part of the story. Eighteen chapters with no mention of the temple is all the more startling when we recognize that the dedication of the temple, with the glory of God filling the temple just as it had done the tabernacle, was the apex of Israel's national prowess. The author takes the reader to the summit of a great mountain at the dedication of the temple, only to drop the reader down the sheer precipice of Israel's plummet into idolatry. It seems that the author wants Elisha's question, 'Where is Yahweh, the God of Elijah?' (2 Kgs 2:14) to echo through these sad pages of Israel's sin where the temple is not mentioned.³⁹

³⁷ Walther Eichrodt, *Theology of the Old Testament* (Philadelphia: Westminster, 1961, 1967), 1:103.

³⁸ Pace H. D. Preuss, *Old Testament Theology* (Philadelphia: Westminster John Knox, 1995, 1996), 2:45. Agreeing with Averbeck, 'Tabernacle', 825; G. J. Wenham, 'Deuteronomy and the Central Sanctuary,' in D. L. Christensen (ed.) *A Song of Power and the Power of Song* (Winona Lake: Eisenbrauns, 1993), p. 103; T. N. D. Mettinger, *The Dethronement of Sabaoth* (CWK Gleerup, 1982), p. 31; cf. also p. 37.

³⁹ Cf. 2 Kgs 1:3, 6, 16, 'Is it because there is no God in Israel?' The answer is provided in the words of a non-Israelite, Naaman, in 5:15, 'Behold, I know that there is no God in all of the earth except in Israel.'

In the latter half of 2 Kings, one of the factors by which Israel's rulers are evaluated is how they posture themselves with regard to the Deuteronomic demand for centralization of national worship.⁴⁰ In other words, the kings are evaluated by their attitude toward the temple. Moses had declared that Yahweh would choose one place to set his name and that he was to be worshiped only there (e.g. Deut. 12:5, 13-14).⁴¹ That the kings are evaluated by this standard is most apparent in the statements about a king's attitude toward (1) the high places and (2) the temple.

First, the references to high places that were or were not destroyed are not in every case high places where other gods were worshiped, but places *other than the temple in Jerusalem where the people sought to worship Yahweh*. Thus, the narrator of Kings is commenting upon each king's adherence to Moses through these references to high places. This explains how a king could do what was right in the eyes of Yahweh even though the high places were not taken away (cf. 2 Kgs 12:2-3; 14:3-4; 15:3-4, 34-35). It also explains Rabshakeh's taunt to the people on the wall that Yahweh will not help them since Hezekiah had taken away Yahweh's high places and altars (2 Kgs 18:22).

Second, the pious kings are concerned with the temple and its repair. Jehoash is righteous to collect money for the maintenance of the temple (12:4-16). The reader is struck by so much attention paid to the temple after it had not been mentioned for so long. In the eighteen chapters prior to the beginning of Jehoash's story (2 Kgs 11:1), the closest one comes to finding a reference to God's dwelling place, or the place he has chosen to set his name, is Naaman's request. He wants two mule-loads of holy ground to take back to Aram that he may worship Yahweh (5:17). After Jehoash, the good king Josiah is also concerned with the temple's repair (2 Kgs 22:4-7).

Solomon had achieved a delicate balance. He recognized that while God chose to dwell in the temple, he simultaneously dwelt in heaven and could by no means be contained or manipulated through a house made with human hands. As piety came to be associated with the upkeep of the temple, it is not surprising that in some cases the balance was lost. This results in the need for Jeremiah to rebuke the people for the superstition

⁴⁰ Cf. G. von Rad, *Old Testament Theology* (Philadelphia: Westminster John Knox, 1962, 1965), 1:336.

⁴¹ Cf. J. G. McConville, *Grace in the End* (Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 1993); S. Westerholm, 'Temple', in *ISBE*, 4:759; G. E. Wright, H. H. Nelson, and L. Oppenheim, 'The Significance of the Temple in the Ancient Near East', *BA* 7 (1944), pp. 41-88.

that the temple of Yahweh would somehow magically protect them from their enemies (cf. Jer. 7:4). They are correct that the temple is central to their well-being as a nation, but incorrect to assume that the temple guarantees Yahweh's presence.

Chronicles was written for the encouragement of the remnant that had returned to the land from exile. One of the chief objectives of this remnant was to rebuild the temple, so it is not surprising that both books of Chronicles are replete with references to the temple. Even after the exile, the dwelling of God is in the midst of the people, in the temple. When we get to the Gospels in the NT, Jesus himself is often shown referring to the temple as the house of his father (e.g. Luke 2:49; John 2:16).

It seems to have been generally held that Yahweh was enthroned in heaven, somewhere above the cherubim who guarded each end of the ark, which was perhaps his footstool, and that the train of his robe filled the temple.⁴² In the midst of all these references to God's presence *with* his people, one simply does not come away with the impression that each member of the believing remnant was indwelt by God's Spirit. Apart from the NT, one might not even suspect that such a thing would be possible.

B. The pre-exilic prophets

Yahweh did not leave his people without a witness.⁴³ He graciously sent emissaries to his chosen nation. The prophets who delivered God's word during the monarchy assured the people and the kings that Yahweh would be *with* them. They continued to affirm that life is lived *before God* because God dwells *among* the people as he resides *in the temple*. The city Yahweh chose for himself, *Jerusalem*, would be the capital of the globe. The emphasis on God's presence *with* rather than *in* his people matches what has been seen thus far. Each of these themes will be briefly discussed.⁴⁴

1. *God with his people*. As Isaiah urges King Ahaz to trust Yahweh instead of Egypt, he announces Yahweh's intention to be with his people. The very name of the child whose birth will be a sign to Ahaz, Immanuel, means 'God with us' (Isa. 7:14). Much could be said about this theme in

⁴² For passages giving this impression see 1 Sam. 4:4; 2 Sam. 6:2; 2 Kgs 19:15; 1 Chr. 13:6; Pss 80:1; 99:1; Isa. 6:1; 37:16; Matt. 5:34-35.

⁴³ Contrast A. Malamat, 'Prophecy at Mari', in R. Gordon (ed.) *The Place Is Too Small for Us*, (Winona Lake: Eisenbrauns, 1995), p. 53.

⁴⁴ Once again, representative passages will be given in this discussion. For more passages of this nature see Chart 3: 'God's Presence in the Pre-Exilic Prophets'.

Isaiah 7–12, but here it suffices to note that what is hoped for, and what provides assurance and motivation not to fear but to trust Yahweh (cf. 41:10), is the presence of God *with* his people (cf. Isa. 8:8, 10). Yahweh even promises to the remnant that he will bring them back from exile, ‘When you cross over the waters I will be with you.... Do not fear, for I am with you’ (43:2, 5).

When Yahweh calls Jeremiah to prophesy he too is told, ‘Do not fear their presence, for I am with you’ (Jer. 1:8, cf. 1:19). Jeremiah also communicates to the people that they should not fear, for God will be with them and redeem them from Babylon (30:11; 42:11; 46:28). Amos too expresses his desire that Yahweh be with the people (Amos 5:14).

2. *In the presence of God.* The prophets speak of life as though it is lived before God. Isaiah refers to trips Israelites made to the temple courts for sacrifice as times when they would appear before Yahweh (Isa. 1:12). The sins of the nation are regarded as defiance in his glorious eyes, which see all that takes place (3:8). Rejoicing also takes place in God’s presence (9:2 [ET 9:3]).

Jeremiah regards the nation’s detested things as things which cannot be tolerated if the nation is to enjoy God’s presence (Jer. 4:1). He marvels that the people do not tremble at the fact that they live in the presence of God (5:22). The nation is threatened that if it does not repent it will be cast out of God’s presence (7:15). Like Isaiah, Jeremiah regards the nation’s sins as having been committed before the eyes of Yahweh (7:30; 32:30-31). To be rejected is to be cast out of Yahweh’s presence (23:39). Tellingly, Jonah leaves Israel to flee the presence of Yahweh (Jonah 1:3).

The ethical appeals to God’s presence *with* the people – defiance in his eyes (Isa. 3:8), wonder that they do not fear God (Jer. 5:22) – are reminiscent of the ethical appeals that Paul makes to the indwelling Spirit experienced by the believers he addressed (cf. e.g. Rom. 8:9-11; 1 Cor. 6:19). The pre-exilic prophets regard God as dwelling among the people in the temple, with the result that they speak of life as being lived before Yahweh. They do not give us evidence that they regarded individual members of the remnant as continually indwelt by God’s Spirit.

3. *God among the people.* Isaiah proclaimed what would be true of a future day, but was no less true when he announced it, ‘Great in your midst is the holy one of Israel’ (Isa. 12:6). Statements that refer to the people drawing near to God, or to Yahweh’s nearness, assume that Yahweh dwells in the midst of his people (29:13; 58:2). Recounting Yahweh’s mercies to his people, Isaiah claims that the people ‘rebelled and grieved his Holy Spirit’ (63:10). In the previous verse Isaiah had referred to ‘the angel of his

presence'⁴⁵ who had saved the people (63:9). Then as the people remember the days of old, Isaiah asks, 'Where is the one who brought them up from the sea with the shepherds of his flock? Where is the one who put in the midst of it [the flock] his Holy Spirit?' (63:11). The reference to the angel of Yahweh's presence, the Holy Spirit whom the people grieved, and the Holy Spirit 'among' the people are all ways of referring to God's presence with his people in the wilderness.⁴⁶

The OT has given no indication that God's Spirit indwelt each individual member of the remnant, but it has given every indication that God was always present with his people.⁴⁷ It would therefore seem misguided to take this as a reference to the indwelling ministry of the Holy Spirit seen in the NT,⁴⁸ particularly when John 7:39 indicates that the Spirit had not been given before Jesus was glorified.

In summarizing the expressions of God's presence *with* his people by dwelling *among* them in the pre-exilic prophets, we see that Jeremiah gives voice to a question that is very similar to the one asked by Isaiah (63:11). He says, 'Is Yahweh not in Zion? Is her King not in her?' (Jer 8:19). Jeremiah later affirms, 'But you are in our midst, O Yahweh!' (14:9). Through Hosea Yahweh proclaims, 'For I am God and not man, the holy one in your midst' (11:9). Similarly, Amos declares, 'For I shall pass through the midst of you, says Yahweh' (5:17). Through Joel Yahweh promises, 'And you shall know that I myself am in the midst of Israel' (2:27). This passage in Joel is informative because Yahweh has just proclaimed his presence (2:27), and in each of the next two verses he declares his intention to 'pour out' his Spirit on all flesh (3:1-2 [ET 2:28-29]),⁴⁹ Micah denounces the people's false confidence, mocking the way that they assure themselves saying, 'Is not Yahweh in our midst? Evil will not come upon us' (3:11). Speaking of the city collectively, Zephaniah declares, 'Yahweh is righteous in her midst' (3:5; cf. 3:15, 17).

Direct evidence from the OT that each individual member of the Old Covenant remnant was permanently indwelt by the Spirit of God has not

⁴⁵ B. S. Childs, *Isaiah* (Philadelphia: Westminster John Knox, 2001), p. 523; F. Delitzsch, *Isaiah*, vol. 7 of *Commentary on the Old Testament*, p. 599.

⁴⁶ Delitzsch writes, 'we have here an unmistakable indication of the mystery of the triune nature of God the One' (*Isaiah*, p. 601).

⁴⁷ Childs, *Isaiah*, p. 524.

⁴⁸ Pace Warfield, 'The Spirit of God in the Old Testament', pp. 121-2.

⁴⁹ The 'outpouring' prophesied by Joel does not result in people being continually indwelt by God's Spirit, but in people prophesying (cf. Joel 3:1 [ET 2:28]).

been found in the pre-exilic prophets.⁵⁰ What has been found is in harmony with what was seen in the patriarchal narratives, in the narratives of the exodus and the wanderings in the wilderness,⁵¹ in the narratives of the conquest through the period of the judges, and in the period of the monarchy. Namely, that God was *with* the people he had chosen. God also chose a place to set his name, and we turn now to the many references to localities in the prophets under consideration.

4. *The temple and Jerusalem.* There are countless references to the temple, the house of Yahweh, Jerusalem, and Mount Zion in the pre-exilic prophets (see chart 3). The holy city is central for the nation's piety – for instance, Jonah's prayer comes to Yahweh in his temple (Jonah 2:7). The city is also linked with the eschatological hope, and when Yahweh reigns over the earth all nations will stream to his capital city to worship and learn his ways (Isa. 2:1-4; cf. Mic. 4:1-3). The importance of this location is such that it is not surprising that some began to trust in the location rather than in Yahweh, incurring Jeremiah's rebuke (Jer. 7:4). Israel's deepest woe is that Yahweh's sanctuary would be defiled (Lam. 1:10), worse yet that this would mean that Yahweh had in fact rejected it (2:6-7). Zephaniah states that those who defile Yahweh's house will be held accountable for their actions (Zeph. 1:9).

C. Summary

Throughout the period of Israel's monarchy locations are significant. From the holy high places before centralization was accomplished (e.g. 1 Sam. 9:14) to the glory of Yahweh filling the temple to abide there (1 Kgs 8), no Israelite would have questioned the significance of worshiping God from particular locations. Further, once the temple was built, if any faithful Israelite had been asked where the Spirit of Yahweh remained, he would surely have said something like, 'He is enthroned above the cherubim over the ark' (cf. 2 Sam. 6:2). Dwelling in the midst of his people, Yahweh was *with* them. His people lived their lives *before* him. Their God was in their midst, and once Jerusalem was chosen and the temple was built it was *wrong* to attempt to worship Yahweh from any other place. This much the texts clearly tell us. The texts give us no indication that believing Israelites were themselves inhabited by the Holy Spirit.⁵²

⁵⁰ So also L. Neve, *The Spirit of God in the Old Testament* (Tokyo: Seibunsha, 1972), p. 57.

⁵¹ Hamilton, 'God with Men in the Torah'.

⁵² Walther Zimmerli, *Old Testament Theology in Outline* (Atlanta: John Knox, 1978), pp. 70–81.

IV. THE EXILE AND THE RETURN

By now it is clear that locations are important in the OT, and also that God's presence *with* his people is a prominent theme in these Scriptures. The books of the OT that are concerned with the time of the exile and the return from exile continue to communicate God's nearness in a way that corresponds with what has been seen thus far. References to the temple and Jerusalem are by far the most common, but we also see statements that God's hand is upon people, that he is with people, that life is conducted in the presence of God, and that God is among the people. Chart 4: 'God's Presence in the Exile and the Return' below, will suffice to show that these writings are of a piece with what has been seen to this point. Rather than illustrate these themes in a manner similar to what has been done above, we will consider here whether there is evidence that God's Spirit continually indwelt each individual member of the believing remnant.

Two lines of evidence in this literature might suggest that Old Covenant believers were indwelt, but it will be seen that the indwelling of Old Covenant believers cannot be established on these passages. On the one hand, certain individuals are said to have the Spirit *in* them. On the other hand, certain statements might suggest that believers in general are indwelt. We will look first at particular individuals, and then at believers more generally.

When Yahweh commands Ezekiel to rise to his feet that he might be addressed, Ezekiel reports, 'And the Spirit entered me while he spoke to me, and he stood me on my feet' (Ezek. 2:2). Several observations are relevant here. First, Ezekiel is clearly a believer before this happens to him – the prophet has seen God's glory and responded appropriately thereto in chapter 1. Second, this same thing (the Spirit entering him) happens to Ezekiel on at least one other occasion, Ezekiel 3:24 (cf. also 11:5), which indicates that the Spirit did not *remain* within Ezekiel after he entered him the first time. Third, 1 Peter 1:11 declares that the Spirit of Christ in the prophets was bearing witness beforehand to the sufferings of Christ and the glories to follow, which caused them to search into when or what kind of time he was indicating. It is therefore clear that those who prophesied had the Spirit of Christ in them.⁵³

It is not clear, however, that the Spirit of Christ was in the prophets even when they were not prophesying. Ezekiel seems to have been specially empowered each time he was to prophesy, and because the Spirit

⁵³ Cf. R. R. Wilson, 'Prophecy and Ecstasy,' in C. E. Carter and C. L. Meyers (eds) *Community, Identity, and Ideology* (Eisenbrauns, 1996), p. 409; Eichrodt, *Theology of the Old Testament*, pp. 319-28.

entered him anew it does not seem that his experience of the Spirit was continual. We read of David that, 'Samuel took the horn of oil and anointed him in the midst of his brothers, and the Spirit rushed to David from that day forward' (1 Sam. 16:13). This could mean that the Spirit was continually upon David, or it could mean that the Spirit continued to 'rush to' him and inspire him at significant moments.⁵⁴ In any case, the Spirit comes upon David when he is anointed as king, so neither David's experience nor Ezekiel's appears to be normative for Israelites who are not prophets or anointed kings.⁵⁵

The same applies to what Daniel and Micah experienced. When Nebuchadnezzar demands that his seers not only interpret his dream but divine its contents on their own, they are exasperated and claim, 'No one can declare it before the king except gods, whose dwelling place is not with flesh' (Dan. 2:11). The king's advisers are incorrect; the one true God had made a dwelling among flesh. He dwells among the nation he chose, Israel. Daniel is later referred to as one, 'in whom is a spirit of the holy gods' (Dan. 4:8). The spirit of the plurality of holy gods referred to by Belteshazzar hardly reflects the theology of the OT. Nevertheless, as a prophet, Daniel fits the description offered by Peter (1 Pet. 1:11). The same can be said for Micah (Mic. 3:8).

In response to the unfaithfulness of his people, Yahweh abandoned the temple (Ezek. 10:4, 18-19; 11:23; cf. Jer. 12:7). Read in their OT context, the promises from Yahweh to the people that he would put a new Spirit 'in the midst of you' (Ezek. 11:19; 36:26-27) look like a promise from Yahweh that his presence will once again dwell in the temple in the midst of the people.⁵⁶ In fact, he goes on to promise this very thing (37:26-28;

⁵⁴ Against D. I. Block, 'Empowered by the Spirit of God: The Holy Spirit in the Hystographic Writings of the Old Testament', *SBJT* 1 (1997), pp. 52-3. With M. Dreytza, *Der theologische Gebrauch von RUAH im Alten Testament* (Giessen: Brunnen Verlag, 1990), p. 170.

⁵⁵ Similarly Wood, *The Holy Spirit in the Old Testament*, p. 64; Hildebrandt, *An Old Testament Theology of the Spirit of God*, p. 61.

⁵⁶ *Beqirbechem* is synonymous with *betocham*. On *betocham* S. S. Tuell writes, 'with more than two, it means among (e.g., [Exod] 25:8, of the Lord living "among" the people Israel; the NRSV uses the more traditional reading "in the midst of them" in this context)' (*NIDOTTE*, 4:280). BDB is similar on *beqirbechem*, 'of a number of persons, in the midst, among' (p. 899, 1f.). Cf. also the ten uses of *betok* (s.v.) that are listed as synonymous with *beqerev* in A. Even-Shoshan (ed.) *A New Concordance of the Old Testament* (Jerusalem: Kiryat Sefer, 1997), pp. 1221-2. Cf. also *ibid.*, s.v. *qerev* for the listing of *betok* as synonymous with *beqirbo*, *beqerev* (pp.

43:7). Because the OT material that precedes Ezekiel does not indicate that the indwelling ministry of the Spirit was a known phenomenon, and because the evidence in the OT after Ezekiel does not indicate that those who followed him developed the idea,⁵⁷ the burden of proof would seem to be on those who would interpret Ezekiel 36:26-27 as a direct promise that God's Spirit would dwell in each individual believer.

It could be that Ezekiel 36:27 ('I will put my Spirit within you') has indwelling in view, while 36:26 ('I will give you a new heart') speaks of regeneration. If that is the case, my argument here is not affected because this prophecy is eschatological. It can be granted that 36:26 (new heart) was experienced by Old Covenant believers, but 36:27 (Spirit among/within) predicts an eschatological reality that will only obtain after the cross. In support of this, in John 3, where Jesus speaks of regeneration to Nicodemus, there are no temporal indicators that regeneration cannot happen until after the cross. By contrast, the reception of the (indwelling) Spirit by the disciples awaits the glorification of Jesus (John 7:39).

V. ISRAEL'S OTHER WRITINGS

It is difficult to place Israel's writings that have not been considered to this point at particular times in Israel's history. Generally speaking, these writings run parallel to the nation's experience with her God, and they reflect upon life with the almighty, free, sovereign Yahweh. In these writings (Job, Psalms, Proverbs, Ecclesiastes, Song of Songs, and Esther), God's presence is seen most clearly in Psalms. For various reasons the

1032-3). This point receives support from Ezekiel 37:1-14. In the vision of the dry bones the vivifying Spirit/breath does not go *into the midst* of the bones, but enters as many individual sets of skeletal remains as come to life. Thus, throughout this passage Ezekiel does not say that the Spirit will be put 'among you' or 'in your midst' (both reflecting *beqirbechem*). Instead Ezekiel says, 'Thus says the Lord Yahweh to these bones, "Behold I am about to cause breath/Spirit to go *into you (bachem)* that you may live"' (Ezek. 37:5 [emphasis mine]). Perhaps, then, when Ezekiel wants to describe the Spirit/breath entering each individual he uses *bachem* (cf. 37:5-6, 14; also *bahem* in 37:10). By contrast, when Ezekiel wants to speak of the Spirit returning to dwell among the people and re-inhabit the temple he uses *beqirbechem*.

⁵⁷ Cf. J. Day, 'Inner-biblical Interpretation in the Prophets', in *The Place Is Too Small for Us*, pp. 230-46.

other books are relatively silent on the theme.⁵⁸ Because Psalms has so much to say, only a brief sampling will be given here.⁵⁹

The Psalmist fears no evil because Yahweh, his shepherd, is *with* him (Ps. 23:4). Nor will Yahweh abandon his people (94:14). The Psalmist desires that God be near and not far off (38:21), for Yahweh is a shield for his people (3:3). The Psalmist petitions Yahweh to make him live (119:25),⁶⁰ and life is lived in the presence of God (41:12). References to Jerusalem, Mount Zion, and the temple are so prominent in the Psalter that some have spoken of a 'theology of Jerusalem'.⁶¹ Yahweh dwells in Zion (9:12 [ET 9:11]), he is in his holy temple, and his throne is in heaven (11:4). Help comes from the sanctuary, even from Zion (20:3 [ET 20:4]). Entering the sanctuary means entering God's presence, and doing so has a sanctifying effect upon Old Covenant believers (73:17). Because Yahweh dwells there, one day in the temple courts is better than thousands elsewhere (84:11 [ET 84:10]). Because Zion is the place where Yahweh dwells, members of the remnant are said to have been born there (87:1-7). Yahweh is enthroned upon the praises of Israel (22:4 [ET 22:3]) because they praise him in his sanctuary (150:1). Indeed, the Psalmist considers himself blessed because he will dwell in the house of Yahweh forever (23:6).⁶²

VI. CONCLUSION

I have argued that in these stages of Israel's history, God's presence *with* his people results in their faithfulness. This does not mean that God had no

⁵⁸ In Esther God is the unseen actor. In Proverbs the fear of Yahweh is much more prominent than his presence, though awareness of his presence causes the fear of him. The Song of Songs is a love poem, and though it does not present love apart from God, it does not overtly articulate his presence. Job is a series of discourses with God manifesting himself in glory at the end. Cf. Terrien's discussion of the wisdom literature, *Elusive Presence*, pp. 350-89.

⁵⁹ As with the previous, for more references see Chart 5 below: 'God's Presence in Israel's Other Writings'. Cf. also Terrien's discussion, 'The Psalmody of Presence', ch. 6 of *Elusive Presence*, pp. 278-349.

⁶⁰ The Piel imperative of *chaya* is often translated as 'revive' (cf. NASB), but the Piel can have causative force (cf. GKC §52g) resulting in the translation, 'Cause me to live' (cf. BDB, 311).

⁶¹ Cf. T. L. Brensinger, 'Jerusalem,' *NIDOTTE*, 4:772-6; J. T. Strong, 'Zion, Theology of', *NIDOTTE*, 4:1314-21.

⁶² See further Hermann Spieckermann, *Heilsgegenwart: Eine Theologie der Psalmen* (Göttingen: Vandenhoeck and Ruprecht, 1989).

interior ministry to his people by his Spirit; he clearly did. It does mean that the OT does not speak of the Spirit of God dwelling *in* individual believers on a permanent basis.

This study has seen that the OT has three categories for God's presence. These categories are not mutually exclusive. First, Yahweh is everywhere and cannot be limited to a particular location (1 Kgs 8:27; Ps. 139). Nevertheless, the very people who make such observations (e.g. Solomon) acknowledge that, second, Yahweh indwells the temple in Jerusalem by his Spirit (1 Kgs 8:12-13). Third, Yahweh dwells in heaven (1 Kgs 8:30). That Yahweh is everywhere is akin to his being in heaven, but his dwelling among his chosen people indicates his commitment to set them apart for himself. In the OT God dwells *with* his people corporately, but not *in* them individually.⁶³

God's presence with his people is seen in a variety of ways through the OT. It seems that the OT presents Yahweh's creation of a people for himself through his self-revelation to Israel. Further, the OT presents Yahweh maintaining his people by remaining with them. From this investigation it seems that we have warrant to speak of Old Covenant believers as having been regenerated but not indwelt. A day is prophesied when Yahweh's Spirit will be poured out on his people, and it is gently intimated that his Spirit will dwell in his people. The OT, however, does not give clear evidence that its believers were continually indwelt by the Spirit of Yahweh in the way that the NT does. The words of Jesus in John 14:17, 'He is with you, and he will be in you', seem aptly descriptive of this aspect of OT theology.

⁶³ Terrien, *Elusive Presence*, p. 408.

Chart 1: God's Presence in the Conquest—the Judges

	God with Men <i>I will be with you/Yahweh is with you/May Yahweh be with you (the contrary in italics)</i>	God in the midst of/among the people <i>(the contrary in italics)</i>	Meeting God	Before/in the Presence of God; God hears/sees	Tent of Meeting; Tabernacle#; Ark*	Temple; House of God#; Dwelling of God*
Joshua	1:5, 9, 17; 3:7; 6:27; 14:12; 7:12	3:10; 22:31	5:14–15	4:13; 7:23; 18:8, 10; 19:51; 24:1	18:1; 19:51; 22:19#, 29#	
Judges	1:19, 22; 2:18; 6:12, 13, 16; 16:20	(4:14)	2:1; 6:11–26; 7:2, 4, 9; 13:3–5, 9–22	5:5; 20:23, 26; 21:2	20:26–27*	18:31#
Ruth	2:4					
1 Samuel 1:1–7:17	3:19	<i>4:21</i>	3:4–14, 21	1:12, 15, 19, 22; 2:17, 18, 21, 28; 6:20	3:3*; 4:3–4*; 6:7*	1:7#, 9, 24#; 2:29*, 32*; 3:3, 15#

Chart 2: God's Presence in the Monarchy

	God with Men I will be with you/Yahweh is with you/May Yahweh be with you (the contrary in italics, similar statements in parentheses)	Before/in the Presence of God; God hears/sees (the contrary in italics, similar statements in parentheses)	Tent of Meeting; Tabernacle; Ark	Temple; House of God; Dwelling of God
1 Samuel 8:1-31:13	10:7; (12:22) 16:18; 17:37; 18:12, 14, 28; 20:13; <i>28:15, 16</i>	10:19, 25; 11:15; 12:3, 7, 17; 14:6; 15:19, 33; 16:7; 21:6, 7; (22:10); 23:18; (24:6); 26:20		
2 Samuel	5:10; 7:3, 7, 9; (8:6, 14); 14:17	3:28; 5:3; 6:14, 16, 17; 7:29; 11:27; 15:25; 21:1, 9	6:2, 17; 7:2, 6; 15:25	7:5-7, 13; 12:20; (24:16, 18, 25)
1 Kings	1:37; 8:57-58; 11:38; (18:46)	2:4; 3:10; 8:23, 25, 28, 62, 64, 65; 9:3-4, 25; 15:5, 11; 16:7, 25, 30; 19:11; 21:20; 22:43; 22:52	2:28-30; 3:15; 6:19; 8:1-11	3:1-2; 5:3, 5; 6:1-38; 7:12, 40-51; 8:1-61; 9:1, 3, 7, 8, 15, 25; 10:5, 11; 12:27; 14:26, 28
2 Kings	(3:12, 15); 18:7; <i>(21:14)</i>	3:2, 14, 18; 5:16; 8:18, 27; 10:30; 12:2; 13:2, 4, 23; 14:3, 26; 15:3, 9, 18, 24, 28, 34; 16:2, 14; 17:2, 17, 18, 20, 23; 18:3; 19:14; 20:3, 21-2, 20; 22:2, 19; 23:3; <i>23:27, 32, 37; 24:9, 19-20</i>		11:3-4, 7, 10, 11, 13, 15, 18-19; 12:4, 5-16, 18, 14:14; 15:35; 16:8, 14, 18; 18:15-16; 19:1, 14; 20:5, 8; 21:4, 5, 7; 22:4-5, 8-9; 23:2, 4, 6, 7, 9, 11, 12, 27; 24:13; 25:9, 13, 16
1 Chronicles	9:20; 11:9; (15:26); 17:2, 6, 8; (18:6, 13); 22:11, 16, 18; 28:20	11:3, 19; 13:8, 10; 17:16, 27; 19:13; 23:13, 31; 28:8; 29:22	6:31-32, 48; 9:21, 23; 13:3, 5-14; 15:1-3, 12, 24, 26, 28-29; 16:1, 4, 6, 37, 39; 17:1; 21:29; 22:19; 23:26-32; 28:2	6:10, 31-32, 48; 9:2, 13, (19), 23, 26-27, (33); 17:4-5, 12, 14; 22:1-2, 5-11, 19; 23:4, 24-32; 24:5, 19; 25:6; 26:12, 20, 22, 27, 28:2-3, 6, 10-21; 29:1-3, 7-8, 16, 19
2 Chronicles	1:1; 15:2, 9; 17:3; 19:6; 19:11; 20:17; 32:7, 8; 35:21; 36:23; <i>12:5; 25:7</i>	1:6, 2:6, 7:4; 14:2; 16:9; 19:10; 20:9, 13, 18, 32; 22:4; 24:2; 25:2; 26:4; 27:2, 6; 28:1; 29:2, 11; 30:9; 31:20; 33:2, 12, 22-23; 34:2	1:3-5; 5:1-14; 6:41	2:1, 4-6, 12, 3:1-17; 4:1-22; 6:1-42, 7:1-22, 8:1, 16, 9:4; 12:9, 11, 15:18, 16:2, 20:5, 8-9, 28; 22:12, 23:3, 5, 6, 9, 12, 14, 18-20, 24:4-14, 16, 18, 21, 27; 25:24; 26:16, 18-19, 21; 27:2-3, 28:21, 24; 29:3, 5-7, 15-18, 20, 25, 35; 30:1, 8, 15, 19

Chart 3: God's Presence in the Pre-Exilic Prophets

	God with Men (similar statements in parentheses; the contrary in italics)	In the Presence of God (rejection in parentheses)	God among the People	Temple/House/Sanctuary/Dwelling	Jerusalem/Mount Zion
Isaiah	7:14; 8:8, 10; 41:10; 43:2, 5; 45:14; 57:15; (60:19-20)	1:12; 3:8; 9:3; 23:18; 48:19; 64:1-3; 65:12; 66:23	12:6; 63:11; (29:13; 58:2)	1:12; 2:2-3; 6:1, 4; 8:14; 18; 18:4; 26:21; 33:5; 37:1, 14; 38:20-21; 43:28; 44:28; 56:5, 7; 57:15; 60:13; 62:9; 63:15, 18; 64:11; 66:6	2:2; 4:3, 5; 8:18; 18:7; 24:23; 25:6, 10; 27:13; 28:16; 29:8; 30:29; 31:9; 33:20; 37:35; 38:6; 40:2, 9; 51:3; 57:13; 60:14; 65:11, 25; 66:20
Jeremiah	1:8, 19; 12:7; (15:17); 15:20; 20:11; 30:11; 42:11; 46:28	4:1; 5:22; 7:10; (7:15); 7:30; 12:11; (15:1); 15:8, 19; 17:16; 18:20; (23:39); 32:30-31; 35:19	8:19; 14:9	7:2, 4, 10-11, 14, 30; 11:15; 12:7; 17:12, 26; 19:14; 20:1-2; 24:1; 26:2, 6-7, 9-10, 18; 27:16; 18, 21; 28:1, 3, 5; 29:26; 32:34; 34:15; 35:2, 4; 36:5-6, 8, 10; 38:14; 41:5; 50:28; 51:11, 51; 52:13, 17-18, 20, 24	3:17; 8:19
Lamentations		2:19; 3:35; 4:16		1:10; 2:6-7; 2:20	(5:19)
Hosea	5:6		11:9	9:4, 15	
Amos	5:14		5:17	2:8	1:2
Joel			2:27	1:9, 13-14, 16; 2:17; 3:18	2:1, 15, 32; 3:15-18, 21
Obadiah					1:16, 17, 21
Jonah		1:3, 10		2:4, 7	
Micah			3:11	1:2-3; 3:12; 4:1-2	3:12; 4:1-2, 7
Nahum		1:5-6			
Habakkuk				2:20	
Zephaniah		1:7; (3:1)	3:5, 15, 17	1:9; 3:4	

Chart 4: God's Presence in the Exile and the Return

	God with/ Hand upon	In the Presence of God <i>(God departing in italics)</i>	God among the People	Temple/House/San ctuary/ Dwelling	Jerusalem/ Mount Zion
Ezekiel	1:3; 3:14, 22; 8:1; 34:30; 37:1; 40:1; (48:35)	<i>8:12; 9:9; 22:30; 38:20;</i> <i>(39:23); 40:46; 41:22;</i> <i>(42:13); 43:24; 44:15;</i> <i>46:9</i>	28:22 (Sidon); 37:26–28	5:11; 7:22; 8:6, 7, 16; 9:3, 6, 7; 10:3–4, 18–19; 11:1; 23:38–39; 24:21; 25:3; 37:26–28; <i>chs 40–48</i>	20:40; 28:16; 34:26
Daniel		6:10–11; 9:20		1:2; 5:1, 3, 23; 8:11; 9:17, 24, 26; 11:31	9:16–20; (11:16, 20, 41, 45)
Ezra	1:3; 7:6, 9, 28; 8:18, 22, 31	5:4		1:2–5, 7, 43, 58, 68; 3:6, 8–12; 4:1, 3, 24; 5:2–3, 8–9, 11–17; 6:3, 5, 7–8, 12, 15–17, 22; 7:7, 15–17, 19–20, 23–24, 27; 8:17, 19, 25, 29–30, 33, 36; 9:8–9, 10:1, 6, 9	1:3–4
Nehemiah	2:8, 18	1:6; 4:5; 9:8		1:9; 2:8; 3:26, 31; 6:10–11; 7:60, 73; 8:16; 10:28, 32–39; 11:11–12, 16, 20, 22; 12:40; 13:4, 7, 9, 11, 14	
Haggai	1:13; 2:4		2:5	1:2, 4, 8–9; 2:3, 7, 9, 15, 18	
Zechariah	8:23; 10:5	2:13; 3:1; 6:5; (9:14); 14:5	2:5, 10–11; 8:3	1:16; 2:13; 3:7; 4:9; 6:12–15; 7:3; 8:9; 9:8; 11:13; 14:20–21	1:17; 2:12; 3:2; 8:3; 14:16–21
Malachi				2:11; 3:1	

Chart 5: God's Presence in Israel's Other Writings

	God with Men (related statements in parentheses)	God near Men (contrary in italics; related statements in parentheses)	God a Shield (related statements in parentheses)	Before/In the Presence of God; God in midst	Temple/Mount Zion/Jerusalem (related statements in parentheses)
Job	29:5			29:4	
Psalms	14:5; 16:8; 23:4; (42:8); 46:7, 11; 73:23; (94:14); 108:11; (114:2); 139:18	(22:19); 34:18; <i>38:21; 71:12</i> ; 73:28; 75:1; 145:18; 148:14	3:3; 18:2; 28:7, (9); (34:7); (36:7); (46:1); (57:1); 59:11; (63:7); 84:9, 11; 144:2	16:11; 17:2; 21:6; 31:20; 32:7; 41:12; 42:5; 44:3; 51:4, 11; 84:7; 86:9; 88:1-2; 95:2; 96:13; 97:5; 98:9; 116:9; 139:7; 140:13	2:6; 3:4; 5:7; 9:11; 11:4; 15:1; 18:6; 20:2; (22:3); 23:6; 24:3; 26:8; 27:4-5; 28:2; 29:9; 36:8; 42:4; 43:3; 46:4; 48:1-2; 48:9; 50:2; 52:8; 55:14; (60:6); 61:4; 63:2; 65:4; 66:13; 68:5, 16, 18, 24, 29, 35; 69:9; 73:17; 74:2-4, 7-8; 76:2, 7; 78:60, 68-69; 79:1; 84:1-4, 10; 87:1-7; 92:13; 93:5; 96:6, 8; 99:1-2, 5, 9; 100:4; 102:16; 116:19; 118:26; 122:1, 9; 125:1; 128:5; 129:5; 132:5, 7, 8, 13; 134:1-2; 135:2, 21; 137:5-6; 138:2; 150:1
Proverbs		<i>15:29</i>		3:4; 15:2, 11; 24:18	
Ecclesiastes				5:2	5:1
Song of Songs					
Esther					