

The Indian Journal of Theology

- Lesslie Newbigin : The Quest for Unity through Religion
P. Chenchiah : The Vedanta Philosophy and the
Message of Christ
William Lash : Reflections on Indigenization

Book Reviews

- V. Paranjoti : Saiva Siddhanta
Dom Benedict Stuart : The Development of Christian
Worship
E. L. Mascall : Corpus Christi
R. S. Cripps : The Book of Amos
Geddes MacGregor : From a Christian Ghetto
G. A. F. Knight : Esther, Song of Songs,
Lamentations
-

Volume Four Number Two

October 1955

Book Reviews

ŚAIVA SIDDHĀNTA

Śaiva Siddhānta : by Dr. V. Paranjoti. Luzac & Co., Ltd., London, 1954. 10s. 6d. Rs.5. Sole Agents in India:—The Christian Literature Society, Post Box 501, Madras 3.

Dr. Paranjoti has done a great service to the religious world by her able and scholarly presentation of Śaiva Siddhānta, which claims to be the 'accomplished end', 'the final word' or 'end of ends' of Indian philosophy. This system remained practically unnoticed by Indian and Western scholars, primarily because the 'textbooks' are in Tamil, a Dravidian language of South India, which had not attracted the due notice of Sanskrit scholars either in India or outside. Apart from the fact that the Dravidian languages are generally more difficult for a foreigner to master than the Aryan tongues, Sanskrit has generally remained the language of theology in India. Even the great South Indian theologians like Sankara and Rāmānuja used Sanskrit as their medium in preference to their own native tongue. It was not till the advent of European scholars like Bishop Caldwell and Dr. U. G. Pope that the treasures of Tamil literature were made available to Western scholars. This good work has been ably furthered by Dr. Paranjoti's book on Śaiva Siddhānta.

This system is presented concisely in the twelve Sutras of *Śiva Jñānabodha*—a work consisting of 40 lines of Tamil poetry (by Meykaṇṭha Deva), and as Dr. J. H. Piet says, it is 'one of the most closely reasoned philosophies found anywhere in the world'. The first six Sutras deal with the proofs for the existence of Pati (Lord), Pāśa (bond), and Paśu (individual soul). The last six Sutras enunciate the method and benefits of Realization of Śiva. It is essentially a theology of salvation.

Śaiva Siddhānta accepts three *Pramāṇas*—*pratyakṣa* (perception), *anumāna* (inference) and *śabda* (scriptures, Vedas generally and Śaivāgamas particularly). Of these, the supreme place is given to the scriptures, as Śiva Himself is their author. The proof for the existence of God is based on these primarily. The attack on this position by the Sautrāntika school does not seem to be quite baseless, since the Siddhāntin appears to argue in a circle. He appeals to the scriptures to prove the existence of God, while the authority of the scriptures is based on the fact that God Himself is the author!

But according to the Siddhāntin, the scriptures should not be taken on blind faith and so he starts to give arguments for the existence of God. He states that the different entities of he, she and it, which are diverse and finite, are subject to the three processes of creation, preservation and destruction. So the whole world is also subject to the same processes. A pot implies a potter. Likewise, the world is a created product. As Dr. Paranjoti points out, the fallacy of taking for granted

that what is true of a part, is also true of the whole is apparent. But what Dr. Paranjoti does not clearly bring out in her discussion is that this argument suffers from the same defects as the classical cosmological argument of the West.

The scriptures are also the prime authority for positing three eternal substances—God, Soul and Matter. The question why there are three eternal substances and not one (Advaita) or two (Sāṅkhya) is not answered logically by the Siddhāntin. Sāṅkhya philosophy accepts the same three *pramāṇas* as Śaiva Siddhānta but comes to a totally different conclusion, which is atheistic and dualistic, partly because the Śaivāgamas do not bind him.

So also no logical reason is given by the Siddhāntin as to why Śiva should be the Supreme Lord and not Viṣṇu. The further question, how the souls are tainted by the *Malas* even before they are embodied, remains unanswered by the Siddhāntin, except by an appeal to the same scriptures. But if the major premises based on the three *pramāṇas* are accepted, then the rest follows in a chain of closely reasoned arguments. That is why the system gets into difficulties when confronted by others which do not acknowledge the same *pramāṇas*. These are some of the inherent weaknesses of the system and perhaps need clearer elucidation by Dr. Paranjoti.

The fact remains that all theology is an interpretation of human experience. To those who had the experience this system tries to give a rational explanation for their basic experience. As such, Śaiva Siddhānta is a system of philosophy which calls for one's close study. Further, it has many points of vital interest to a Christian, e.g. the doctrine of the love of God, its strong theistic emphasis, the idea of sin, doctrine of grace, etc.

The first three chapters of Dr. Paranjoti's book (The Cultural Background of Śaiva Siddhānta, Origin and Date of Śaivism and Śaiva Siddhānta Literature) are the result of careful study, research and sifting of facts by the author. The second edition of the book has been carefully revised in the light of subsequent research on the subject. It has a useful appendix. The monistic norm by which the system was evaluated in the first edition is now abandoned, which seems to be an improvement in the right direction, even if it is lamented by students of the Advaita school.

The author admits having not given more space to the logical aspect of Śaiva Siddhānta and its epistemology, since 'there are valuable books on these subjects'. This is true, but we hope that in the next edition this defect will be remedied.

There is no doubt that Dr. Paranjoti has done an excellent piece of pioneering work. The present edition is a definite improvement on the first one. It is readable and neatly got up. The references are carefully given. Dr. Paranjoti deserves our gratitude and congratulation on her lucid, scholarly and highly commendable exposition of the Tamil Śaiva Siddhānta.

Serampore

A. E. D. FREDERICK

CHRISTIAN WORSHIP

The Development of Christian Worship: by Dom Benedict Stuart, Longmans. 30s. (Available from Orient Longmans, Ltd., Calcutta.)

This book, written in lucid style, is the most important work on the history of the liturgy since the publication of Dom Gregory Dix's monumental work 'The Shape of the Liturgy'. In his discussion the author gives a summary of the opinions of several modern scholars in the field of liturgical studies. Special attention, however, is paid to the views of Dom Gregory Dix whom the writer quotes on numerous occasions with warm approval. Notice is also taken of the writings of Dr. Srawley and Dr. Dugmore. One would have expected to find at least passing reference to the views expressed in the recent conferences of Maria Laach, Lugano and Louvain on the study of the liturgy.

The plan of the book is set out in the introductory chapter wherein Dom Stuart explains the meaning of the two chief acts of the virtue of religion: Sacrifice and Prayer. The major portion of the book is devoted to the consideration of the sacrificial worship of the Church, i.e., the Holy Eucharist. In the section on Prayer the author describes the origin and growth of the public prayer of the Church, i.e., the Divine Office. There is a very useful chapter on the evolution of the Liturgical year. The appendices deal with diverse subjects of Roman Catholic interest.

This is primarily a Roman Catholic book whose main preoccupation is with the Roman mass and its development. In tracing the history of the Eucharistic worship the author covers the familiar ground with rather a cursory treatment of the Eastern Liturgies. The treatment of the problems of the Roman Canon is objective, though the discussion of the place of the *Epiclesis* in the Canon is as usual inconclusive. But the author summarizes the opinions of a recent Benedictine scholar Dom Gassner who admits the presence originally of an *Epiclesis* in the Roman Canon, for consecration, and places it after the narrative of the Institution. What then is the author's verdict on the Canon of the mass? It is given on p. 184: 'As Dix says . . . the history of the Roman Canon does not seem very difficult to make out in its main outlines, once we discard the theories about "dislocation and diptychs" and the "primitive Roman *epiclesis*".'

This is a valuable book for the student of liturgical studies, but its usefulness is severely limited by its excessively high cost.

Calcutta

E. SAMBAYYA

CHURCH AND SACRAMENT

Corpus Christi: Essays on the Church and the Eucharist: by Dr. E. L. Mascall. Longmans. 15s.

This collection of essays is 'dominated by one over-arching conception, the conception of the Church as a reality of the sacramental order, the Mystical Body of Christ, preserved and nourished by the Sacrament of the Lord's Body and Blood.'

Dr. Mascall re-examines and re-states this conception in the light of modern trends in theological and liturgical scholarship. He believes (with

the report 'Catholicity') that Christendom is now in a better position than ever before to recover something of that wholeness of outlook which, however imperfectly, characterized primitive Christianity. And if we are to make this attempt we must be more ready than we have commonly been to call in question the attitudes and formulations that have become habitual among both Catholics and Protestants as a result of the disputes of the sixteenth century.

The great tragedy of the Reformation lay in the fact that, while the great majority of the Reformers were desperately anxious to return, for both their ecclesiastical order and their liturgical forms, to the practices of primitive Christianity, neither they nor anyone else at the time had any adequate knowledge of what primitive Christianity was. A good many features were rejected as mediaeval accretions which were in fact primitive, and a good many features were retained as primitive which were in fact merely mediaeval. Further, there were a number of highly questionable assumptions which had become so deeply engrained in the minds of mediaeval Christians that they never rose to the level of consciousness at all and in consequence became the implicit premises of the arguments of Catholics and Protestants alike. When, in addition to this, religious persecutions and wars had hardened prejudices into inhibitions, the climate was ideal for that condition of deadlock and mutual incomprehension which has continued in the West down to our own time. Perhaps the most hopeful feature of the theological situation today is the appearance in more than one quarter of a readiness to get behind the sixteenth-century alignments and confrontations, to unearth and examine our unconscious mediaeval inheritance, in the determination to escape from the stuffy and thundery atmosphere of post-Reformation theology into a fresher and serener clime.

Dr. Mascall believes that the Anglican Church is peculiarly fitted to perform this task of theological psychotherapy, for it is fettered neither by the late-mediaeval theological rigidity of the Council of Trent nor by the personal domination of the tremendous figures of the Continental reformers. Appealing as it does to Scripture and the Fathers, it is peculiarly fitted to grasp the opportunities of a situation in which the most vigorous movements in theology are in the realms of Biblical exegesis and patristic study. Free, as the dogmatic Protestant is not, to see the Bible steadily and to see it whole, and free, as the modern Roman Catholic is not, to see the Fathers as they are and not as recast in the mould of the Council of Trent, the Anglican theologian today is uniquely favoured for the task of recovering the lost unity of an integrally Catholic theology. It is this conviction that has inspired the writing of the essays which are collected in this book.

The first two chapters present an exposition of the nature of the Church and its unity, and of the relation between the Church and the Sacraments in general. The central chapters consist of a theological discussion of the development of the Eucharistic canon and of the nature of the Eucharistic sacrifice and the Eucharistic presence. This section contains a thorough and discerning appraisal of the teaching of De la Taille, Vonier and Masure. The concluding chapters deal with the Eucharistic theology of St. Thomas Aquinas and Bishop Charles Gore, and with certain modern developments in Eucharistic practice.

These studies, which are all penetrating and original, convey to the reader a clear understanding of the broad sweep of liturgical develop-

ment through the centuries, and they further enhance Dr. Mascall's reputation as a writer with exceptional qualities of insight and scholarship.

Calcutta

L. L. LANCASTER

THE BOOK OF AMOS

A Critical and Exegetical Commentary on the Book of Amos : by R. S. Cripps. Second Edition. S.P.C.K. London and Post Box 1585, Delhi 6. 25s.

The recent appearance of a second edition of Cripps's Commentary on Amos is a reminder of the vast amount of research that has been done in the field of Old Testament studies during the quarter of a century that has gone by since the first edition was issued. This detailed and learned commentary first appeared in 1929, and has for some time been out of print. Gratitude is due to the S.P.C.K. for once again making it possible to obtain what must certainly be the fullest commentary on Amos in the English language published during this century, and it is a matter for regret that the author died just before the publication of this revised edition of the work by which his name will be remembered.

In these days, when commentaries are so expensive, Rs.17 or so is not an excessive price to pay for a book which runs to over 400 pages. The cost would no doubt be much greater if the process of revision had been more complete, but the second edition consists of a reproduction by a photographic process of the whole of the first edition, together with a 'Preface to the Second Edition', consisting of 24 pages of new material, bringing the book up to date. The author was severely limited by accepting such a method, since there was no opportunity to alter the text so that it would conform with the conclusions reached in the new preface. Included in the new material is a useful list of commentaries on Amos published since the first edition, and in the footnotes to the preface many other recent books are mentioned which have a bearing on the interpretation of the book. Apart from a few verbal alterations to the chronological table on p. 110, the reviewer has not been able to discover any changes in the text of the original commentary.

The subjects treated in the new Preface are *Archaeology and the Book of Amos* ; *The Date of the Prophesying of Amos* ; *Literary Problems* ; *Sacrifices and the Sacrificial Cult in the Prophets with Special Reference to Amos* ; *Translation : Hebrew Poetry* ; and *Exegesis and Application*. As might be expected in view of recent trends in Old Testament studies, it is the section entitled *Literary Problems* which provides most of the new material. A brief sketch of the views of the Scandinavian scholars is given, so far as they affect the study of the prophetic books, and the author indicates that his sympathies lay with the traditional view regarding the transmission of the prophets' messages, rather than with that of the Scandinavians. In the next section, Cripps sets out his reasons for adhering to his former view that the prophets were not against sacrifice as such, but only against its abuse. He goes too far, however, in asserting (p. xxxii) that 'But for [Amos v : 25] perhaps the idea would never have arisen that Amos, Hosea, Isaiah and Micah were radically opposed to sacrifice.' Other

verses in the same chapter, as well as in chapter iv are just as outspoken, quite apart from statements by the other prophets.

It is unfortunate that the fifth section of the Preface: *Translation: Hebrew Poetry*, should have been set out in such a way as to obscure the few modifications which are made to the conclusions reached in the commentary itself. If the four sections discussed (i: 9, 10; ii: 13; iii: 12; vi: 10) had each been given a fresh paragraph, they could be more clearly seen and more easily found. Users of the commentary would do well to make marginal cross-references from the original commentary to the new material in the Preface, for which no index is provided; (the original index remains unchanged).

Despite the unavoidable drawbacks in the form of the book, its value, which was already great, has been enhanced by this new production. This is a book which all theological schools and colleges in India should have in their libraries, particularly if they have not yet obtained the first edition.

Serampore

B. F. PRICE

A.D. 2453

From a Christian Ghetto: by Geddes MacGregor. Longmans. 8s. 6d.

The year is A. D. 2453. The Christian Church, suppressed and persecuted by the World State, has been driven underground, where it still maintains a rich spiritual life. Here we have the letters of Paul, a tutor in the University of the Christian Underworld, to his pupil Timothy. Timothy is specializing in Church History, with special reference to the twentieth century. The letters offer a running commentary on the ecclesiastical life of our own day.

The letters make good reading, and are most refreshing, but are not for those who believe that any discussion of the Church must be shrouded in solemnity, nor for those who are afraid to laugh at themselves. Paul writes with engaging candour, and there is not much that escapes his eye. The piquancy of his comments may even offend some. 'Go to Anglican sources', he tells Timothy, 'where you will sometimes find the Church of England depicted as having been always stoutly protestant before the Reformation and devoutly Catholic ever afterwards.' In fashionable Presbyterian churches 'it was considered a mark of great homiletic genius and skill to be able to smuggle even the smallest pinch of religion into the inexpert weekly report on current affairs technically called the sermon.'

The writing is brilliant, but the book must not be dismissed as merely a clever satire. It has reality and depth, and for all its lightness and wit has a serious object. The Church that we know today is not the Church as it ought to be, or as God wills it to be. If this book helps to stimulate fresh thought about the Church and its task, it will have served a very salutary purpose.

Calcutta

H. J. TAYLOR

Esther, Song of Songs, Lamentations : by G. A. F. Knight : S.C.M. Press.
Available at Y.M.C.A. Publishing House, 5 Russell St., Calcutta 16.
Price Rs.6-1-6.

This recent volume on three of the lesser-known books of the Old Testament is a welcome addition to the expanding series of 'Torch Commentaries'. As the bibliography at the beginning of each section indicates, there is a scarcity of recent commentaries in English on these books, most of the better-known ones being upwards of 40 years old. It is perhaps an unfortunate necessity that the author has to use as the basis for his commentary the Authorized or King James Version of the Bible, that being the translation which the ordinary reader will possess, since it means that much of the commentary, particularly on the Song of Songs, consists merely of an improved translation.

This series of commentaries is a product of the growing tendency to read the Old Testament in the light of the New, and to stress the unity of the purpose of God which runs through both Testaments. Professor Knight is evidently at home in the realm of Biblical theology, but this commentary shows how its expression can sometimes be carried to extremes. We find a tendency to read into some passages things which were not in the mind of the writer, nor even warranted by the whole Biblical background or the New Testament interpretation of the passages in question.

Professor Knight has a difficult defence to make when he pleads for the validity of the inclusion of Esther in the Christian Canon. Once he has conceded, as he inevitably must, that the book is a work of fiction, he has undermined much of what he says in the section headed 'A Christian Book'. 'God's mighty acts', to which he refers there, are events *in history*, however much interpretation may be involved in the record we have about them. To apply the same language to what is palpably fictitious is to devalue the term when it is used with reference to the Exodus from Egypt and other events in history.

The author has undertaken a difficult task in writing a modern theological commentary on these books. He may have read too much into the Bible here and there, but the commentary on the text is on the whole admirably illuminating, though often too short to be satisfying.

Serampore

B. F. PRICE

★

According to the central, and on the whole, consistent, development of the Christian understanding of the relationship between revelation and reason, reason becomes fruitful and capable of reaching a relatively reliable view of the universe and the purpose of man's existence in it, when it is governed by the insights of the Christian faith. This does not mean that faith supplies the data of empirical knowledge; the search for and examination of the empirical data of knowledge remains the function of the empirical sciences, including theology. It means rather that faith supplies the 'clues' or categories of interpretation by which the empirical data of science and religion can be rightly understood.

A. RICHARDSON