

and when Pilate again remonstrated with them in favour of their king, they roared out (*ἐκραύγασαν*), ἄρον, ἄρον, as though saying in the vulgar slang of a modern mob : "Hurry up! we cannot wait here all the day; get rid of this fellow and let us go to prepare our Feast."

The textual alteration suggested is very slight, and only in words already doubtful in the MSS. The sentence as emended comes in much more appositely in the context. The whole narrative of St. John becomes self-consistent and consistent with the Synoptists.

H. G. GREY.

*THE PERMANENCE OF RELIGION AT HOLY
PLACES IN THE EAST.*

IN a recent number of the *EXPOSITOR* (June and August, 1905), this subject was briefly alluded to in describing the origin of the Ephesian cult of the Mother of God. In that cult we found a survival or revival of the old paganism of Ephesus, viz. the worship of the Virgin Mother of Artemis. The persistence of those ancient beliefs and rites at the chief centres of paganism exercised so profound an influence on the history of Christianity in Asia Minor, that it is well to give a more detailed account of the facts, though even this account can only be a brief survey of a few examples selected almost by chance out of the innumerable cases which occur in all parts of the country. I shall take as the foundation of this article a paper read to the Oriental Congress held at London in autumn, 1902, and buried in the *Transactions of the Congress*, developing and improving the ideas expressed in that paper, and enlarging the number of examples.

The strength of the old pagan beliefs did not escape the attention of the Apostle Paul; and his views on the subject

affected his action as a missionary in the cities of Asia Minor, and can be traced in his letters. On the one hand, as the present writer has several times tried to prove, he regarded the Anatolian superstition as a more direct and dangerous enemy than the Greek. Amid the many enemies against which he had to contend, some were less dangerous than others. Sophia, the Greek philosophy, seemed to Paul much less dangerous than Greek religion; it was rather, in a way, a rival erring on false lines than an enemy; and at first the outer world regarded the doctrine of Paul as simply one form of Graeco-Oriental philosophy, and listened to it with a certain degree of tolerance on that understanding. Greek religion, in its turn, hateful as was its careless polytheism, was not nearly so dangerous as the Anatolian devotion and enthusiasm.

On the other hand, Paul saw also that there was, or rather had originally been, even in this degraded superstition and detestable ritual, an element of truth and real perception of the Divine nature. On this point, it is needless to repeat what has been said in the *EXPOSITOR*, October, 1906, page 374 ff.

Before glancing at the effect of the old paganism on the development of the Christian Church, it is well to point out that the influence is still effective down to the present day. The spirit of Mohammedanism is quite as inconsistent with and hostile to the pagan localization of the Divine nature at particular places as Christianity is; but still it has been in practice very strongly influenced by that idea, and the ignorant Moslem peasantry are full of awe and respect both for Christian and for ancient pagan superstitions. A brief outline of the most striking classes of facts observable at the present day will set in a clearer light the strong pressure which popular ideas were continually exerting on the early Christian Church. In giving such an outline

I know that it is dangerous for one who is not an Orientalist to write on the subject. I can merely set down what I have seen and heard among the peasantry, and describe the impression made on me by their own statement of their vague ideas.

In regard to their religious ideas, we begin by setting aside all that belongs strictly to Mohammedanism, all that necessarily arises from the fact that a number of Mohammedans, who live together in a particular town or village, are bound to carry out in common the ritual of their religion, i.e., to erect a proper building, and to perform certain acts and prayers at regular intervals. Anything that can be sufficiently accounted for on that ground has no bearing on the present purpose. All that is beyond this is, strictly speaking, a deviation from, and even a violation of, the Mohammedan religion; and therein lies its interest for us. Mohammedanism admits only a very few sacred localities—Mecca, Medina, Jerusalem. Possibly even the Sunni Mohammedans may allow one or two others, as the Shiya do, but I do not remember to have heard of them. But the actual belief of the peasantry of Asia Minor attaches sanctity to a vast number of localities, and to these our attention is now directed. Without laying down any universal principle, it will appear easily that in many cases the attachment of religious veneration to particular localities in Asia Minor has continued through all changes in the dominant religion of the country.

In the cases where this permanence of religious awe is certain, the sanctity has, of course, taken some new form, or been transferred from its original bearer to some Mohammedan or Turkish personage. Four kinds of cases may be distinguished:—

1. The sanctity and awe gather round the person of some real character of Mohammedan history earlier than the

Turkish period. The typical example is Seidi Ghazi (the Arab general Sayyid al Battal al Ghazi, Seid the Wicked the Conqueror),¹ slain in the battle of Acroenos in A.D. 739, the first great victory which cheered the Byzantine emperors in their attempt to stem the tide of Arab conquest. How this defeated Arab should have become the Turkish hero of the conquest of Asia Minor, after the country had for two centuries been untrod by a Mohammedan foot, is not explained satisfactorily by any of the modern writers, French and German, who have translated or described the Turkish romance relating the adventures of this stolen hero.² He became one of the chief heroes of the Bektash dervishes, that sect to which, I believe, all the Janissaries belonged (I speak under correction in a matter that lies out of my own sphere of study). On Mount Argæus strange stories about him are told. He shares with others the awe attaching to this mountain, the loftiest in Asia Minor, and worshipped as divine by the ancient inhabitants. On the site of an old Hittite city, Ardistama, re-discovered in 1904 on the borders of Cappadocia and Lycaonia, he is

¹ I give the spelling and translation as a distinguished Semitic scholar gave them to me many years ago; but my friend Mr. Crowfoot, writes from Khartoum suggesting that the first epithet is not the word meaning "wicked," but a very similar cognate noun, meaning "hero." Seid, of course, is strictly a generic term—the Lord, given to all descendants of the Prophet; but it has in Turkey become a personal name. I find that in my notes formerly I appended a note by Professor Robertson Smith: "Battal, in old Arabic, denotes prowess rather than wickedness." Abd-Allah was the personal name of the Arab general.

² This romance has been translated by Ethé, *Fahrten des Sayyid Rattal* (Brockhaus, Leipzig, 1871): see also review by Mohl in *Journal Asiatique* 1874, p. 70 ff. In the romance it is said that the worship of Seid began under Sultan Alaeddin of Komà (1219–1236), when the place where he died was discovered by special revelation, and a tomb was built for him and a great establishment of Dervishes formed at Nakoleia, an ancient Phrygian city, which has henceforth been called Seidi-Ghazi, far north of the scene of the fatal battle. The Dervishes were all scattered, and the splendid building was going to ruin, when I passed that way in 1881 and 1883: on the reason, see below in the text.

known as Emir Ghazi, the Conqueror Emir. At Nakoleia, in Phrygia, once one of the greatest establishments of dervishes in Asia Minor, now passing rapidly into ruins, his tomb is shown, and that of the Christian princess, his supposed wife.

The mention of the Christian wife of the Moslem conqueror throws some light on the legend. The idea was not lost from the historical memory of the Mohammedans that they were interlopers, and that the legal right belonged to the Christians whom they had conquered. The representative hero of the Moslems must therefore make his possession legitimate by marrying the Princess, who carries with her the right of inheritance. This is a striking example of the persistence of the old Anatolian custom that inheritance passed in the female line. Greek law had superseded the old custom; Roman law had confirmed the principle that inheritance passed in the male line. Christian and Mohammedan custom agreed in that principle. Yet here in the Moslem legend we find the old custom of the land still effective. In Greek legend and Greek history the same tendency for the conquerors to seek some justification and legitimization of their violent seizure is frequently observed; so e.g. the Dorian conquest of the Peloponnesus is represented in legend as the Return of the Heracleidae: the foreign conquerors represent themselves as the supporters and champions of rightful heirs who had been dispossessed and expelled. In many of the old cities of the land (probably in all of them, if we only knew the Moslems better) there linger stories, beliefs and customs, showing that the Mohammedans recognize a certain priority and superiority of right as belonging to the Christian. In the Mosque of St. Sophia at Constantinople the closed door is pointed out through which the priest retired carrying the sacred elements when the capture of the city interrupted the celebra-

tion of the sacrament ; and every one acknowledges that, when the door is opened again, the priest will come back to continue the interrupted ritual of the Christians. In front of the walls of Constantinople is the sacred spring with the fish which shall never be caught until the Christians recover the city : they were taken from the gridiron and thrown into the spring by the priest who was cooking them when the city was stormed, and there they swim until the Christians return. At Damascus, Jerusalem, Thyatira, etc., similar tales are told. At Iconium, on the summit of the hill above the Palace, is a transformed church, once dedicated (as the Greeks say) to St. Amphiloehus, bishop of Iconium about 372-400. It was made into a mosque, but every Mohammedan who entered it to pray died (the tale does not specify whether they died at the moment or later), and it ceased to be used as a mosque. Thereafter a wooden clock-tower was built upon it, and the building is at the present day called " the Clock." Inside this is said to be the spring of Plato, which is now dry. In this absurd story we trace the degraded remnants of ancient sanctity ; and there is a mixture of old religious belief in a holy spring, and perhaps an Asylum, with the later Mohammedan idea that intrusion into a Christian shrine always was accompanied by a certain risk.

2. Some personage of Turkish history proper becomes the bearer of the religious awe attaching to certain spots, e.g. Hadji Bektash, who, I am told, led the Janissaries at the capture of Mudania, and from whom the chief seat of the Bektash dervishes derives its name. At this place, now called Mudjur, in Cappadocia, Hadji Bektash has succeeded to the dignity and awe which once belonged to the patron saint of the bishopric of Doara.

Another such character is Karaja Ahmed, who has his religious home in several parts of the country, sometimes,

at least, with tales of miraculous cures attaching to his grave.¹ I assume him to be a historical character, as he is found in several places, but I do not know whether any actual record of him survives.

Many other names might be quoted, which I assume to have belonged of old to real persons, often probably tribal ancestors unknown to fame: e.g. Sinan Pasha² and Hadji Omar or Omar Baba: the latter two names I suppose to belong to one personage, though they are used at different places.

3. The *dede* or nameless heroized ancestor is spoken of at various places. In many cases his name has been entirely lost, but in other cases inquiry elicits the fact that the *dede* belongs to Class 2, and that some of the villagers know his name, though the world in general knows him only as the nameless *dede*, father of the tribe or settlement.

4. The word *dede* is also used in a still less anthropomorphic sense to indicate the mere formless presence of divine power on the spot. Many cases hang doubtfully between this class and the preceding: it is not certain whether the *dede* once had a name and a human reality which has afterwards been lost, or whether from the beginning he was merely the rude expression of the vague idea that divine power dwelt on the spot.

As an example the following may be selected. In the corner beneath the vast wall of Taurus, where Lycaonia and Cappadocia meet, at the head of a narrow and pic-

¹ I have observed the veneration of Karaja Ahmed at a village six hours S.S.W. from Ushak and about three hours N.W. from Geubek; also at a village one hour from Liyen and two from Bey Keui (one of several spots which divide the religious inheritance of the ancient Metropolis). At the latter, sick persons sit in the Turbe all night with their feet in a sort of stocks, and thus are cured.

² Many persons in Turkish history were called Sinan Pasha, the oldest being a Persian Mollah, mystic and scholar in the fourteenth century, one of three learned men, who were given the title Pasha (von Hammer, *Geschichte des Osman. Reiches*, i. p. 141, iv. p. 896 f.).

turesque glen, there flows forth from many outlets in the main mass of Taurus a river—for a river full grown it issues from the rock. Rushing down the steep glen, it meets at its foot a quieter stream flowing from the east through a rich soil, and long after the junction the clear water from the glen refuses to mix with the muddy water from the rich soil of the valley. The stream flows on for a few miles to the west, turning this corner of the dry Lycaonian plain into a great orchard, and there it falls into the Ak Göl (White Lake). The lake is one of those which vary greatly in extent in different years. In 1879¹ it reached close up to the rock-wall of Taurus, and flowed with a steady stream into a great hole in the side of the mountain. In 1882 and in 1890 it did not reach within a mile of the mountain-side.

This remarkable river has always been recognized by the inhabitants of the glen as the special gift of God, and about 800 B.C. they carved on a rock near the source one of the most remarkable, and even beautiful, monuments of ancient days, figuring the god presenting his gifts of corn and wine—whose cultivation the river makes possible—to the king of the country. The king is dressed in gorgeous embroidered robes, the god is represented in the dress of a peasant; he is the husbandman who, by patience and toil, subdues Nature for the benefit of man. This old conception evinces imagination, insight, poetic sympathy with Nature, and artistic power to embody its ideas in forms that appeal directly to the spectator's eye.

The modern peasantry recognize as fully as the ancients that the divine power is manifested here; they express their belief differently. The tree nearest the spring is hung with patches of rag, fastened to it by modern devotees. In

¹ This I learned from the late Sir Charles Wilson. Recently the scene has been carefully described by an Austrian traveller, Dr. Schaffer, in *Ergänzungsheft*, No. 141, to Petermann's *Geogr. Mittheilungen*.

the contrast between the ancient sculpture and the modern tree you have, in miniature, the difference between Asia Minor as it was 2,700 years ago, and Asia Minor as it is under the Turk. The peasants' language is as poor as their ritual. If you ask them why they hang their rags on the tree, the one explanation is "*dede var*" (there is a *dede*).

There can be little doubt that the idea of the sacred tree here is older than the sculpture. A sacred tree hung with little offerings of the peasantry was no doubt there before the sculpture was made, and has in all probability never been wanting in the religious equipment of the place. It has survived the sculpture, which has now no nearer relation to the life and thoughts of the people than the gods in the British Museum have to us, while the tree is probably a more awful object to the peasants than the village mosque. The extreme simplicity of the peasants' way of expressing their religious idea is interesting; it is so contrasted with the manifold mythopoetic power of the Greek or Celtic races. It throws some light on their religious attitude to observe that in their topographical nomenclature there is the same dearth of imaginative interpretation of Nature. The nearest stream is commonly known as *Irmak*, the river, *Su*, the water, *Tchai*, the watercourse; half the population of a village know no other name for it, while the other half, more educated, know that it is distinguished from other streams as *Kizil Irmak* (red river), or *Ak Su* (white water), or *Gediz Tchai* (the stream that flows by the town of *Gediz*). The mountain beside the village is commonly termed simply "*dagh*"; if you ask more particularly, you learn that it is the "*dagh*" of such and such a village; if you ask more particularly still, you find that some one knows that it is *Ala Dagh* (the Spotted Mount), or *Ak Dagh*, or *Kara Dagh* (White or Black Mount). Very rarely does one find such a name as *Ai Doghmush*, the Moon Rising; a name that

admirably paints the distant view of a beautiful peak near Apamea-Celaenae, as it appears rising over some intervening ridge. The contrast between a name like this and the common Turkish names might suggest that it is a translation of an old pre-Turkish name. The same thought suggests itself for the Hadji-Baba, the Pilgrim Father, a lofty and beautiful mountain which overhangs the old city of Derbe.

Wherever the sacred building is connected with or directed by a regular body of dervishes, it is called a *teke*; where it is little more than a mausoleum, it is called a *turbe*. The most characteristic form of the *turbe* is a small round building with a sloping roof rising to a point in the centre and surmounted by the crescent; but it also occurs of various forms, degenerating into the meanest type of building. Often, however, there is no sacred building. The divine power resides in a tree or in a grove (as at Satala in Lydia, the modern Sandal), or in a rock, or in a hill. I cannot quote a specific case of a holy rock, though I have seen several; but of several holy hills the most remarkable occurs about two hours south-east from Kara Bunar, which probably is the modern representative of the ancient Hyde the Holy, Hiera Hyde. Here, within a deep circular depression, cup-shaped and about a quarter of a mile in diameter, there rises a pointed conical hill to the height of several hundred feet, having a well-marked crater in its summit. A small lake nearly surrounds the base of the hill. The ground all around is a mere mass of black cinders, without a blade of vegetation. I asked a native what this hill was called; he replied, "Mekke; Tuz-Mekkesi daiorlar" (Mecca; they call it the Salt-Mecca). Mecca is the only name by which the uneducated natives can signify the sacredness of a place.

In connexion with the maintenance of *tekes* and *turbes*,

we find an interesting case where the method of Roman law has survived through Byzantine times into Turkish usage. These religious institutions have been kept up by a rent charged on estates : the estates descended in private possession, according to the ordinary rules of inheritance, charged with the rent (*Vakuf*). The system is precisely the same as that whereby Pliny the younger provided a public school in his native city Novum Comum (Ep. vii. 18) ; he made over some of his property to the municipality, and took it back from them in permanent possession at a fixed rent (so far under its actual value as to provide for contingencies) ; and the possession remained with his heirs, and could be sold. This custom is the same as that which, according to Professor Mommsen, is called *avitum* in an inscription of Ferentinum (C.I.L. x. No. 5,853) and in one of the receipts found in the house of Caecilius Jucundus at Pompeii, and which is termed *avitum et patritum* in another of Cæcilius Jucundus's receipts (*Hermes*, xii. p. 123).

Much difficulty has been caused in Turkey owing to the rents having become insufficient to maintain the religious establishments. Many of the establishments, as, e.g., that of Seidi Ghazi at Nakoleia (now called Seidi Ghazi, after the hero), are rapidly going to ruin. The Government has made great efforts to cope with the difficulties of the case ; but its efforts have been only partially successful ; and many of the old establishments have fallen into ruins. It is only fair to remember and to estimate rightly the magnitude and difficulty of the task which the Government had to undertake. But the fact remains that the Evkaf Department is popularly believed to be very corrupt, and its administration has been far from good. It must, however, be acknowledged that in the last few years the traveller observes (at least in those districts where I have been wandering) a very marked improvement in this respect.

There appear to be cases in which the actual rites and forms, or at least the accompaniments, of a pre-Mohammedan and even pre-Christian worship are preserved and respected by Mohammedans. A few examples out of many may be given here :—

1. The Ayasma (any holy spring to which the Christians resort) is also respected by the Mohammedans, who have sometimes a holy tree in the neighbourhood. In general a Christian place of pilgrimage is much respected by the Turkish peasantry. At Hassa Keui, the old Sasima, in Cappadocia, the feast of St. Makrina on January 25 attracts not merely Christians from Konia, Adana, Caesarea, etc., but even Turks, who bring their sick animals to be cured.¹ Many great old Christian festivals are regarded with almost as much awe by the peasant Turks as by the Christians.

2. Iflatun Bunar ; springs with strange virtues and having legends and religious awe attached to them, are in some cases called by the name of the Greek philosopher Plato, which seems to imply some current belief in a magician Plato (like the mediaeval Virgil). One of these springs of Plato is in the acropolis of Iconium : the history of Iconium is not well enough known to enable us to assert that the spring was holy in former times, however probable this may be. Another is situated about fifty miles west of Iconium, and from the margin of the water rise the walls of a half-ruined little temple, built of very large stones and adorned with sculptures of a religious character, showing the sanctity that has attached to the spring from time immemorial. The sculptures belong to the primitive Anatolian period, which is generally called Hittite.

We may note in passing that Plato's Springs belong to the neighbourhood of Iconium, the capital of the Seljuk kingdom of Roum, where a high standard of art and civili-

¹ Carnoy et Nicolaides, *Traditions Populaires de l'Asie Mineure*, p. 204.

zation was maintained until the rise of the Ottoman Turks. The name of Plato probably was attached to the springs in the Seljuk period, when Greek philosophy was studied and perhaps Plato was popularly known as a wise man or magician (just as Virgil was the great magician of European mediaeval superstition and literature).

3. The Takhtaji, woodcutters and charcoal-burners, are not pure Mohammedans. Their strange customs have suggested to several independent observers the idea that they are aboriginal Anatolians, who retain traces of a religion older even than Christianity.¹ Nothing certain is known about their rites and the localities of their worship, except that cemeteries are their meeting-place and are by the credulous Turks believed to be the scene of hideous orgies.

The Takhtaji must be classed along with several other isolated peoples of the country, who retain old pre-Christian rites. They are all very obscure, poor and despised; and it is extremely difficult to get any information about them. A friend who has been on friendly terms with some of them from infancy told me that, however intimate he might be with individuals, it was impossible to get them to talk about their religious beliefs or rites. Two things, however, he had learned—one of which is, I think, unrecorded by other inquirers.² In the first place, there is a head or chief-priest of their religion, who resides somewhere in the Adana district, but makes visits occasionally to the outlying settlements—even as far as the neighbourhood of Smyrna (where my informant lives). This high-priest enters any house and

¹ See Humann and Puchstein, *Reisen in Kleinasien und Nordsyrien*. Mr. Hyde Clarke has long had this idea, which is, he says, fully proved by what he has seen and heard among the people. On their ethnological character see Von Luschan in Benndorf-Niemann, *Lykia*, vol. ii. My ideas were gained originally from Sir C. Wilson.

² E.g. Von Luschan in *Lykia* (Benndorf-Niemann, etc.), II., p. 186 ff., and Crowfoot, *Man*, Oct., 1901, p. 145 f.

takes up his abode in it as he pleases, while the owner concedes to him during his stay all rights over property, children and wives. This priest is evidently the old priest-king of the primitive Anatolian religion, who exercises in a vulgarized form the absolute authority of the god over all his people.

In the second place, my informant fully corroborated the usual statement about them, that their holy place—where they meet to celebrate the ritual of their cult—is the cemetery; but he had not been able to learn anything about the rites practised there. This again is a part of the primitive religion of the land. It is a probable theory,¹ that the early custom was “to bury the dead, not along the roads leading out from the city (as in Greece, and beside the great Hellenized cities of Anatolia), but in cemeteries beside or around the central Hieron.” “It may be doubted whether in old Phrygian custom there was any sacred place without a grave. Every place which was put under divine protection for the benefit of society was (as I believe) consecrated by a grave.” “The dead was merged in the deity, and the gravestone was in itself a dedication to the god.” In death the people of the Great Goddess returned to her, their mother and the mother of all life, and lay close to her holy place and home. “The old custom remains strong throughout Christian and Moslem time.” The grave of a martyr, real or supposed, gave Christian consecration to some of the old holy places. “Wherever a Moslem Turbe is built to express in Mohammedan form the religious awe with which the Moslem population still regards all the old holy places, there is always in or under it the grave of some old supposed Moslem hero, and a Moslem legend grows up, and divine power is manifested there with miraculous cures.”

4. The music and dancing of the Mevlevi dervishes have

¹ *Studies in [the] History and Art of the Eastern Provinces* (Hodder & Stoughton, 1906), p. 273 f.

much of the character of the old ritual of Cybele, toned down and regulated by the calmer spirit of the Mohammedan religion and of the Turkish character.

5. In the Hermus valley, in the neighbourhood of Sardis, are several villages in which dwell a strange people, who practise a mixed sort of religion.¹ In outward appearance they are Mohammedans. But the women do not veil their faces in the presence of men, and the two sexes associate freely together. This freedom is, of course, usual among many tribes of a nomadic character in Anatolia, Turkoman, Avshahr, Yuruk, etc., and is the perpetuation of primitive Turkish custom before the Turks came in contact with Semitic people and adopted the religion of Islam. But in the villages of the Hermus valley the freedom probably has a different origin, as the other characteristics of the people show. While the men bear only Mohammedan names, the women are said often to have such Christian names as Sophia, Anna, Miriam, etc. They do not observe the Moslem feast of Ramazan, but celebrate a fast of twelve days in spring. They drink wine, which is absolutely forbidden by the law of Mohammed; yet we were told that drunkenness is unknown among them and that they are singularly free from vice. They practise strict monogamy, and divorce is absolutely forbidden among them, which stands in the strongest contrast with the almost perfect freedom and ease of divorce among the Mohammedans. In the usual Turkish villages there is always a mosque of some sort, even if it be only a tumble-down mud hovel, between which and the ordinary houses of the villages the difference is hardly perceptible to the eye of the casual traveller; but in those villages of the Hermus valley there is no mosque

¹ The following sentences are quoted nearly *verbatim* from an account published by Mrs. Ramsay in the *British Monthly*, March, 1902, shortly after we had visited the place.

of any description. There is, however, a kind of religious official, called popularly "Kara-Bash," one who wears a black head-dress, who visits the people of the different villages at intervals, when they assemble in one of the houses. How these assemblies are conducted, our brief stay did not enable us to discover. Our informant, a Christian resident of Albanian origin, was quite convinced that these villagers were Christians with a thin veneer of Mohammedanism, and declared that "if there were no Sultan, missionaries could make them by the hundred come over to profess Christianity openly." He himself was in the habit of reading the New Testament to them privately, to their great satisfaction.

Some few of these details we were able to verify personally; but most of them rest on the authority of our informant, who is a perfectly trustworthy person.

The same situation for great religious centres has in many cases continued from a pre-Mohammedan, and even from a pre-Christian period. In some cases, as in great cities like Iconium, the mere continuity of historical importance might account for the continuity of religious importance; but in other cases only the local sanctity can explain it, for the political prominence has disappeared from many places which retain their religious eminence.

The fact which is most widely and clearly observable in connexion with the localities of modern religious feeling is that they are in so very many cases identical with the scenes of ancient life, and often of ancient worship. Every place which shows obvious traces of human skill and human handiwork is impressive to the ruder modern inhabitants. The commonest term to express the awe that such places rouse is *kara*. In actual usage *kara* (literally, *black*) is not much used to indicate mere colour. A black object is *siakh*; but *Kara Mehmet* means, not Mehmet with black complexion,

but big, or powerful, or strong, or dangerous Mehmet. Ancient sites are frequently called *kara*: thus we have Sanduklu, the modern town, and Kara Sanduklu, five miles distant, the site of the ancient Phrygian city Brouzos.

No village names are commoner in modern Turkey in Asia than Kara Euren, or Karadja Euren, and Kizil Euren. I have never known a case in which Kizil Euren marks an ancient site¹; whereas a Kara or Karaja Euren always, in my experience, contains remains of antiquity, and is often the site of an ancient city.

The awe that attaches to ancient places is almost invariably marked by the presence of a *dede* and his *turbe*, if not by some more imposing religious building; and a religious map of Asia Minor would be by far the best guide to the earlier history of the country. Even a junction of two important ancient roads has its *dede*: for example, the point where the road leading north from the Cilician Gates forks from the road that leads west is still marked by a little *turbe*, but by no habitation. It must, however, be added, as I have since found out, that the old village Halala was probably situated there.

The exceptions to this law are so rare, that in each case some remarkable fact of history will probably be found underlying and causing it, and these exceptions ought always to be carefully observed and scrutinized; some apparent exceptions turn out to be really strong old examples of the rule, as when some very insignificant mark of religious awe is absolutely the sole mark of modern life and interest existing upon an otherwise quite deserted site. Two ancient cities I have seen, and yet cannot actually

¹ The following quotations are from pp. 273 ff. of my *Studies in the Eastern Provinces of the Roman Empire* (Hodder & Stoughton, 1906).

² The name usually marks some obvious feature of the modern village, e.g., reddish stones.

testify to the existence of an unbroken religious history on their sites—Laodicea on the Lycus, and Comana in Cappadocia—but in the latter case the construction of a modern Armenian village on a site where fifty years ago no human being lived has made such a break in its history, that very close examination would be needed to discover the proof of continuity. Both these cases are, perhaps, not real exceptions, but I have never examined them with care for this special purpose, for it is only in very recent times that I have come to recognize this principle, and to make it a guide in discovery.

If we go back to an earlier point in history, no doubt can remain that the Christian religion in Asia Minor was in a similar way strongly affected in its forms by earlier religious facts, though the unity of the Universal Church did for a time contend strenuously and with a certain degree of success against local variations and local attachment.

1. The native Phrygian element in Montanism has been frequently alluded to, and need not be described in detail. The prophets and prophetesses, the intensity and enthusiasm of that most interesting phase of religion, are native to the soil, not merely springing from the character of the race, but bred in the race by the air and soil in which it was nurtured.

2. A woman, who prophesied, preached, baptized, walked in the snow with bare feet without feeling the cold, and wrought many wonders of the established type in Cappadocia in the beginning of the third century, is described by Firmilian, Bishop of Caesarea.¹ The local connexion did not interest Firmilian, and is lost to us.

3. Glycerius the deacon, who personated the patriarch at the festival of Venasa, in Cappadocia, in the fourth

¹ See Cyprian, Epist. 75, sec. 10.

century, was only maintaining the old ritual of Zeus of Venasa, as celebrated by the high-priest who represented the god on earth. The heathen god made his annual progress through his country at the same festival in which Glycerius led a ceremonial essentially similar in type to the older ritual. See my *Church in the Roman Empire*, ch. xviii.

4. The Virgin Mother at the Lakes replaced the Virgin Artemis of the Lakes, in whose honour a strange and enigmatic association (known to us by a group of long inscriptions and subscription lists) met at the north-eastern corner of the Lakes.¹

Other examples have been given in the paper already alluded to (EXPOSITOR, June and August, 1905).

5. The Archangel of Colossae, who clove the remarkable gorge by which the Lycus passes out of the city, no doubt was the Christian substitute for the Zeus of Colossae, who had done the same in primitive time: Herodotus alludes to the cleft through which the Lycus flows, but does not mention the religious beliefs associated with it.²

6. The Ayasma at Tymandos, to which the Christians of Apollonia still go on an annual festival, was previously the wonder-working fountain of Hercules Restitutor, as we learn from an inscription.

7. In numerous instances the legends of the local heathen deities were transferred to the local saints, to whose prayers were ascribed the production of hot springs, lakes, and other natural phenomena. The examples are too numerous to mention. Sometimes they enable us to restore with confidence part of the hieratic pagan legends of a district, as, for example, we find that a familiar Greek legend has been attached to Avircius Marcellus, a Phrygian historical figure of the second century, and he is said to have submitted to the jeers of the mob as he sat on a stone. We may feel

¹ *Studies in the History and Art of the Eastern Provinces*, pp. 304-317.

² *Church in the Roman Empire before 180*, ch. xix.

confident that the legend of Demeter, sitting on the rock called *ἀγέλαστος πέτρα* and mocked by the pitiless mob, which was localized by the Greeks at Eleusis, had its home also in this district of Phrygia.

8. One of the most striking examples of religious continuity is the monastery of [St. Chariton near Iconium. It is near the base of the holy mountain of St. Philip. In it are shrines of the Panagia, St. Saba, and St. Amphilochius, and a mosque to which the Turks resort, and to which the Tchelebi Effendi sends five measures of oil every year. The son of a Seljuk Sultan fell over the cliff here, and St. Chariton caught him and saved his life.]

We can then trace many examples of the unbroken continuance of religious awe attached to special localities from the dawn of historical memory to the present day. What reason can be detected for this attachment? In studying this aspect of the human spirit in its attitude towards the divine nature that surrounds it, the first requisite is a religious map of Asia Minor. This remains to be made, and it would clear up by actual facts, not darken by rather hazardous theories (as some modern discussions do), a very interesting phase of history.¹

The extraordinary variety of races which have passed across Asia Minor, and which have all probably without exception left representatives of their stock in the country, makes Asia Minor a specially instructive region to study in reference to the connexion of religion with geographical facts. Where a homogeneous race is concerned, a doubt always exists whether the facts are due to national character—to use a question-begging phrase—or to geographical environment. But where a great number of heterogeneous races are concerned, we can eliminate all independent

¹ The observation and recording of all *turbes* may be urged on every traveller in Asia Minor, especially on the French students of the *École d'Athènes*, from whom there is so much to hope.

action of the human spirit, and attain a certainty that, since races of most diverse character are similarly affected in this country, the cause lies in the natural character of the land.

One fact, however, is far too obvious and prominent to be a matter of theory. In a considerable number of cases the sacred spot has been chosen by the divine power, and made manifest to mankind by easily recognized signs. An entrance from the upper world to the world of death and of God, and of the riches and wonders of the underworld, is there seen. The entrance is marked by its appearance, by the character of the soil, by hot springs, by mephitic odours, or (as at Tyana) by the cold spring which seems always boiling, in which the water is always bubbling up from beneath, yet never overflows.

One fact, however, I may refer to in conclusion, on a subject on which more knowledge may be hoped for. Throughout ancient history in Asia Minor a remarkable prominence in religion, in politics, in society characterizes the position of women. Most of the best attested, and least dubious cases of *Mutterrecht* in ancient history belong to Asia Minor; and it has always appeared to me that the sporadic examples which can be detected among the Greek races are alien to the Aryan type, and are due to intermixture of custom, and perhaps of blood, from a non-Aryan stock whose centre seems to be in Asia Minor; others, who to me are friends and φίλοι ἄνδρες, differ on this point, and regard as a universal stage in human development what I look on as a special characteristic of certain races.

Herodotus speaks of the Lycian custom of reckoning descent through the mother, but the influence of Greek civilization destroyed this character, which was barbarian and not Greek, and hardly a trace of it can be detected surviving in the later period. Lycia had become Greek in the time of Cicero, as that orator mentions. When,

however, we go to regions remoter from Greek influence, we have more hope of discovering traces of the pre-Greek character, e.g. the inscriptions of a little Isaurian town, Dalisandos, explored two years ago by my friend Mr. Hogarth, seem to prove that it was not unusual there to trace descent through the mother even in the third or the fourth century after Christ.

Even under the Roman government, and in the most advanced of civilized cities of the country, one fact persisted, which can hardly be explained except through the influence of the old native custom of assigning an unusually high rank to the female sex. The number of women magistrates in Asia Minor is a fact that strikes one on the most superficial glance into the later inscriptions. A young French scholar has recently collected the examples with much diligence, and has explained them as the result of an ingenious scheme for wheedling rich women out of their money. I did not discover in the book any proof that the writer was joking.¹

In the Christian period we find that every heresy in which the Anatolian character diverged from the standard of the Universal Church was marked by the prominent position assigned to women. Even the Jews were so far affected by the general character of the land, that the unique example of a woman ruler of the synagogue occurs in an inscription found at Smyrna.²

We would gladly find some other facts bearing on and illustrating this remarkable social phenomenon. My own theory is that it is the result of the superiority in type, produced among the Greek race to a noticeable degree by the character of the country in the character of the women.³

W. M. RAMSAY.

¹ Pierre Paris, *De Feminis in Asiaticis Civitatibus*, Paris, 1891.

² See my *Church in the Roman Empire*, pp. 161, 345, 360, 375, 438, 452-9, 480.

³ *Impressions of Turkey*, pp. 49, 168, 258, 270 f.