

# Theology on the Web.org.uk

*Making Biblical Scholarship Accessible*

This document was supplied for free educational purposes. Unless it is in the public domain, it may not be sold for profit or hosted on a webserver without the permission of the copyright holder.

If you find it of help to you and would like to support the ministry of Theology on the Web, please consider using the links below:



Buy me a coffee

<https://www.buymeacoffee.com/theology>



PATREON

<https://patreon.com/theologyontheweb>

[PayPal](#)

<https://paypal.me/robbradshaw>

---

A table of contents for *The Churchman* can be found here:

[https://biblicalstudies.org.uk/articles\\_churchman\\_os.php](https://biblicalstudies.org.uk/articles_churchman_os.php)

# Book Reviews

**BIBLICAL STUDIES : Essays in honour of William Barclay**  
edited by JOHNSTON R. McKAY and JAMES F. MILLER

*Collins 1976 223pp £4.50*

ISBN 0 00 215058 1

The fifteen essays of this volume are written by those with whom Professor William Barclay worked, or with whom he was associated, during his teaching career. As the editors point out, they cover a range of scholarly interests which in their very breadth and diversity faithfully reflect the many-sidedness of Barclay's own work. J. R. McKay begins with a short personal appreciation of Barclay, underlining especially his influence as a teacher and writer. Barclay communicated to his students especially the importance of words and their meanings, and the value of exegetical study. As a writer, he is always clear and easy to understand. Ronald Falconer offers us a portrait of Barclay the broadcaster. Barclay communicated to all sorts and conditions of men. The BBC staff at Glasgow, Falconer recalls, were fascinated by 'this extraordinary, fluent, forceful character, out of whom spilled exact knowledge, brilliant illustrations, humour, stories, entertainment in one vast inseparable and compulsive whole.' He adds: 'He was brimful with his subject. He was so much in love with it that his joy and happiness in what he was saying flooded over, infectiously, to his vast fireside audience.'

Professor R. S. Barbour discusses ways in which we may regard the Bible as the Word of God, when biblical criticism forced us to view it as a library of human documents. We ought not to try, he urges, to put the clock back. We cannot view it as our forefathers did. It does not speak inerrantly or infallibly to man. Nevertheless, revelation comes not through the word or act of God only, but through the response to it also; indeed, if the very reporting of the deed or act is held to be part of the response, it comes through the response only (p 31). Although he rejects the way in which the Christological two-natures model is sometimes applied to this subject, Professor Barbour concludes that in Christ himself we see how the human word can become one with God's word. Professor Robert Davidson enquires about the theological relevance of the Old Testament. The Old Testament is not a quarry from which to gather texts for sermons which are then expounded out of relation to their context. With reference partly to the writings of James Barr and of Alistair Kee, he argues that what is distinctive of the great Old Testament traditions needs to be heard afresh.

## CHURCHMAN

Two of the essays relate to eschatology or apocalyptic. Klaus Koch has spoken of an apocalyptic renaissance. Does this mean, Professor Hugh Anderson asks, that there is still a future for apocalyptic? He criticizes and rejects exaggerated claims for its importance to Jesus, to Paul, or to the early Christian community. But he notes that Kasemann, Pannenberg, and Moltmann rightly see some positive value in its correction of an unduly individualistic and inward pietism. Professor George Caird offers a valuable essay in which he briefly considers the problem of Jesus' apparent expectation of an imminent end of the world. Is this what Jesus really expected? We must examine the viewpoint from which language about future expectation was expressed. The divine retribution on Jerusalem was executed by the Roman armies. 'There is good reason to think that Luke's interpretation of Jesus was right' (p 77). Judgement, as in the Book of Daniel, is often set in the *midst* of history. The day of judgment which Jesus foresees is not that of the end of history, but that of the vindication of the sons of the kingdom against their Jewish oppressors. It is an act which was carried out in history by human agents. It is an error of 'word-token' logic to assume that simply because judgement is *often* conceived of as being at the end of history, it is *always* conceived of in this way.

Other essays are contributed by Charles H. Scobie, Neil Alexander, Ernest Best, Matthew Black, A. M. Hunter, William Neil, John C. O'Neill, George Johnston, and W. D. McHardy. On the whole, relatively few of these particular essays seek to develop strikingly original ideas and the reader who is simply looking for novelty may in general be disappointed. But the entire volume is marked by careful, balanced thought, and eminent practical common sense; and these are precisely the qualities which mark the work of Professor William Barclay, to whom they pay tribute.

ANTHONY C. THISELTON

## CLUES TO CREATION IN GENESIS P. J. WISEMAN edited by DONALD J. WISEMAN

Marshall, Morgan and Scott 1977 232pp £2.95

ISBN 0 551 05567 7

In the days of my youth I wrote two booklets: *How Moses compiled Genesis* and *Understanding the Pentateuch* (If anyone has a spare copy, I should be delighted, having lost or lent all mine). Whether I developed my ideas from Commander Wiseman, whether great minds thought alike, or whether we both had a common ancestor, I cannot now remember, but it is good to see Wiseman's two books republished as one.

P. J. Wiseman was a knowledgeable amateur. His son Donald is, of course, a professional, and his editorship of this new edition is a guarantee that any errors of fact will have been ironed out. This edition omits a few sections and adds useful appendices, and the editor has substituted Heidel's translation of the Babylonian Creation Tablets for Dr Langdon's. One sad mistake remains: the light of the sun takes nine minutes (not hours) to reach the earth (p 183).

To me Part I (originally *New Discoveries in Babylonia about Genesis*) is the more important. It argues the authorship of the different sections of Genesis from the phrase 'These are the generations of . . .' as standing at the end of a family record rather than at the beginning. These ancestral records were the material that Moses used. If only we could start afresh with our higher criticism, this straightforward theory might be taken more seriously.

Part II, the version of *Creation revealed in Six Days*, has never appealed to me in the same way, largely because of the rather forced, though possible, translation of *asa* (make or do) as 'showed'. Thus the six days are the days when God revealed the created order to Adam or Enoch. Although Wiseman argues against it, I prefer the days as vast periods of time, although I agree that the revelation was made directly by God to someone before the time of Moses.

J. STAFFORD WRIGHT

**A GUIDE TO THE BOOK OF EXODUS**

SPCK 1977 201pp £2.95

JOHN H. DOBSON

ISBN 0 281 02952 0

**THEOLOGY AS NARRATION : A Commentary on the book of Exodus**

GEORGE A. F. KNIGHT

Handsel Press 1976 209pp £5.00

Dr G. A. F. Knight and John H. Dobson have produced two unusual, and strikingly different, commentaries on Exodus. Mr Dobson writes in a series designed for theological education in the younger churches in Africa, Asia and elsewhere. Although he stresses that the question of authorship is less important than understanding the actual content of the book, he believes that Exodus was written before (perhaps long before) the time of David. For him, Exodus is primarily a record of what actually happened; and his task is to place the narrative in its historical and cultural setting, to discuss the questions of the nature of God that it raises, and to see the events described in the fuller light of God's revelation in Christ. He also brings out the point that the biblical story of a people emerging under God from slavery to freedom has much to say today to Christians in the Third World.

Dr Knight holds that Exodus was written around the year 515 BC by an author who drew upon traditional material, and who meditated

on the past and reinterpreted it in the light of the immediate post-exilic period. Dr Knight sees no incompatibility between this process, and divine revelation. His commentary is able to pay closer attention to the text and its inherent problems than is Mr Dobson's. For example, Dr Knight points out, as Mr Dobson does not, that even if the plague of the Nile turned to blood is explained in natural terms, the biblical text also states that water in all streams and wells throughout Egypt as well as in all containers, turned to blood. For all this, and without obviously appearing to try to be relevant for modern readers, Dr Knight's commentary goes far beyond the confines of ancient Israel and provides much religious insight.

The two works can be recommended for study groups. Mr Dobson's should be used where a straight reading of the text is required, that will lead to consideration of modern problems in Christian belief and practice. For a group that wishes to wrestle more closely with the text, Dr Knight's study will be rewarding, and it is to be hoped that it is, or will be, available in a cheaper edition than that reviewed.

J. W. ROGERSON

	<i>Hardback</i>	<i>Paperback</i>
<b>PSALMS 1-50</b>	243pp £8.50 ISBN 0 521 21463 7	£3.20 ISBN 0 521 29160 7
<b>51-100</b>	236pp £8.50 ISBN 0 521 21464 5	£3.20 ISBN 0 521 29161 5
<b>101-150</b>	193pp £7.90 ISBN 0 521 21465 3	£2.95 ISBN 0 521 29162 3
<b>J. W. ROGERSON &amp; J. W. McKAY</b>		<i>CUP 1977</i>

These volumes are a valuable addition to a familiar series of commentaries. The incorporation of the New English Bible text makes them appreciably longer than they would otherwise have been, and subsequent editions would do well to offer the Introduction and Comment in one volume. Both are worthy of as wide a general readership as is possible.

The same Introduction is printed in each volume, and it concerns the Psalter as a whole. A useful feature is the classification of psalms. Distinctions are drawn in a fairly conventional way, as, for example, between hymns and national psalms; but are extended to embrace church tradition, and are further analysed in some detail, giving on pp 13-15 a good bird's eye view of the breadth of spiritual interest to be found in the Psalter.

The authors are well acquainted with the various modern approaches, and make discriminating use of them in their interpretative comment. The main focus of interest, however, is the faith and

spirituality of the psalmists. Questions of historical setting, and the circumstances which gave rise to the growth of the Psalter, are by no means neglected, but the predominant concern is to uncover the continuing and contemporary value of these ancient texts.

The handling of the NEB text is judicious, sometimes showing dissent and sometimes appreciation. The absence of the supercriptions is a regrettable feature of the NEB. Though they may not be original, and though they probably tell us little about the circumstances of authorship, they are part of the process of interpretation discernible within the Scriptures, and it is refreshing to find a modern commentary making use of them. This sensitivity to different levels of meaning, from the original through the interpretative processes, is often evident. The comments on p 9 of the Introduction in relation to Ps.84 illustrate the point very well.

The commentary as a whole is well balanced, taking into account most of the needs of the general reader. Literal renderings of Hebrew phrases show the technical difficulties faced by the modern translator in the search for original meaning, but the spiritual and theological points of interest are generally close at hand.

The vindictiveness of some psalms is faced squarely, and in Ps.109 its suitability for public worship is questioned; but there is always some concern on the part of the commentators to render it intelligible. We are reminded in connection with Ps.58 that man has a constant tendency to underestimate the viciousness of evil, and with Ps.109 that the church needs to be reminded of God's hatred of evil.

A novel feature is the tabular approach to Ps.119, in which the eight main nouns pertaining to God's revelation are arranged horizontally, and the verbal forms vertically. Within this frame the connections are clearly set out. This helps to reveal something of the inner dynamic of the psalm, and also confirms the general impression that many of the verbs and nouns are interchangeable. At the same time a few firm and largely constant links emerge, as between, for example, 'to teach' and 'statutes'.

These books are an excellent addition to the series.

PHILIP BUDD

**THE OLD TESTAMENT PROPHETS**      E. W. HEATON

*Darton, Longman and Todd 1977*    178pp    £2.95    [*new and revised edition*]  
ISBN 0 232 51361 9

That this book, which first appeared in 1949 and was revised in 1958, should in 1977 be republished in a new updated version indicates that it is something of a classic; for, despite considerable revision, it remains recognizably the same book. All the best material is there, though in some cases arranged under new chapter headings. There is

## CHURCHMAN

a survey of the prophets' writings, vocation and preaching, followed by a skilful presentation of the main message of each in relation to the history of his day. The post-exilic section has been extended to include the development of apocalyptic, and an introductory chapter on making sense of the Old Testament, with all its 'sheer muddle', makes a plea that it should be read 'like any other book' and understood in its own terms. This is a valuable chapter, showing that the church needs the Old Testament, but that it must be committed to understanding the culture and history out of which its books came if their message is to be understood aright.

Intended for the student and the general reader, this book provides an excellent introduction to the prophets. Needless to say, in so small a compass generalizations are unavoidable and the viewpoint regarding date and authorship is that accepted by critical scholarship. On some issues one would have welcomed an indication that other opinions are held by responsible biblical scholars, but provided that the reader appreciates these limitations he will find this an interesting, informative and stimulating lead into prophetic literature.

The new format, with larger pages and clear print, is an improvement, and the graded bibliography is a spur to further study.

JOYCE BALDWIN

## A GRAMMAR OF NEW TESTAMENT GREEK

JAMES HOPE MOULTON

VOLUME IV: Style NIGEL TURNER

T and T Clark 1976 174pp £4.20

Technically Dr Nigel Turner adds a fourth volume to the great work of Moulton and W. F. Howard, for which he provided a third volume on NT Syntax in 1963. That volume goes naturally with the two original ones, but this fourth volume is really a work in its own right. In its patience and in its balanced assessment of evidence, it is worthy to stand in the sequence of that great work; but it has the added merit of reflecting the discussions on biblical and linguistic questions which have accompanied the various interpretations of the gospel made in the post-Moulton world.

On matters of detail, a reviewer devoid of Hebrew and Aramaic would be foolish to attempt to pronounce. There is a very fair footnote, characteristic of Dr Turner's approach, on the very last page of his work. He refers to Rydbeck's work *Fachprosa, vermeintliche Volkssprache und Neues Testament* as deserving close study, especially as our viewpoints are apparently at variance. Rydbeck puts the case for a close relationship of NT with contemporary secular Greek. Turner gives reasons for seeing distinctive 'Semitic', i.e. Hebrew and

Aramaic, effects on the language at specific places in the styles of the various authors. He takes the evangelists individually, Acts with Luke, and then Paul (not conceding a basic stylistic dichotomy), the Pastorals, Hebrews, James, 1 Peter, the Johannine Epistles, 2 Peter and Jude, and Revelation. It is a striking index of our changed approach that he looks for parallels to contemporary popular Greek style in James, 1 Peter and the Pastorals, rather than in John and Hebrews.

One particular point interested the reviewer: it was Turner's insistence that *tou* (alas these transliterations—what would Moulton have said?) with the infinitive is distinctly Septuagintal and Hebraic. Turner admits that it also belongs to the 'higher koine'. I would not question Turner's reason for its NT predominance, but it should be said that the construction is commoner in the 'higher koine' than in classical and early Hellenistic times—it seems to go 'underground' from Thucydides, popping up occasionally in Demosthenes. Turner is also right in saying that Paul follows Septuagintal Greek in putting *heneka* before its genitive, whereas Polybius and the papyri do the reverse. Yet is it notable that the classical rule was not absolute, and Plato and Xenophon could produce cases of Paul's usage! I do not infer from this that Paul had read Plato!

A review as brief as this can do no more than call attention to a valuable and important work. The 'Semitisms' in NT Greek do not seem astounding when one remembers that the synagogue diatribe was bound to be more Semitic than the ordinary popular philosophic address, which was a common feature of the Hellenistic Middle East; though in the nature of such sermonizing little of it remains in literature. The synagogue diatribe was based on the Septuagint. The early Christian believers, Jew and Gentile alike, came from this religious and cultural background and bore their Christian testimony—not seeking to be orators but to present the truth, using as many gifts of expression as they possessed. When we know more of the still unpublished Egyptian papyri in Greek, we shall be better able to estimate how far ordinary semi-literate and quarter-literate people of that day used the same speech as the NT writers. But whatever the truth of this, and however 'Semitic' NT language may prove to be, it remains the fact that the NT had to be written not in Hebrew, not in Aramaic, not even in Latin for the church in Rome—but in Greek.

J. B. SKEMP

## THE SUPERNATURAL IN THE NEW TESTAMENT

BRUCE N. KAYE

Lutterworth 1977 76pp £1.95

ISBN 0 7188 2234 X

This is not a book on mysticism. Neither does it explain, still less explain away, miracles in the NT. For the benefit of teachers and dis-

cussion group leaders, Dr Kaye has compiled a small collection of lesson material concerning supernatural stories in the Gospels and Acts. The author does not explain what may have happened, or why, but suggests the permanent spiritual significance of the events. He makes the point that 'the interpretation of the supernatural in the NT by NT writers moves away from the curious and spectacular to discipleship and the ethical'. But to make this point the writer so plays down the miraculous that I confess to being left with the unhappy impression that it does not really matter what actually happened (if indeed anything happened at all—probably nothing did) so long as we can deduce some sort of spiritual application for today. Perhaps the highly condensed writing is to blame. Certainly I doubt if I should have picked up all the author intended to convey in his piece on 'Peter's Penny' had I not previously read the source in J. D. M. Derrett's vastly longer version in his *Law and the New Testament*. But alas, there is not a footnote or a reference to be seen in all the 76 pages to direct the reader to fuller information. Deliberate, no doubt, but unhelpful. A couple of suggested group activities are added. But it will be a brave and persuasive leader in classroom or house group who can get his disciples to plough through 26 chapters of Matthew and Mark before tackling just one of those suggestions.

NORMAN HILLYER

**THE ORIGIN OF CHRISTOLOGY**

C. F. D. MOULE

CUP 1977 187pp £7.50

ISBN 0 521 21290 1

'I am concerned to challenge, in the name of the evidence, such a statement as that "the fundamental problem of a Christology of the NT . . . was that the view of Jesus found in NT Christology was *not historically true of Jesus himself*" (my italics).' With these robust words Professor Moule indicates the theme of his most recent book, which is a substantial contribution to the theme of NT Christology. He claims that in much recent writing we can find an evolutionary view of NT doctrine in which new species appear along the way; and he defends a developmental view, according to which later growth simply brings out more clearly what was latent and implicit from the beginning.

The book essentially falls into three parts. In the first, the author examines how Jesus regarded himself, and does so by an examination of four descriptions (not 'titles') which go back to Jesus' own lifetime: Son of man, Son of God, Christ and *Kurios*. 'Here we have a restatement of Moule's interpretation of the Son of man, based on Dan. 7 and fresh treatments of the other descriptions. He argues that in each case the use of the terms was dictated by what Jesus himself was; and he argues convincingly, albeit succinctly.

This conclusion is tested in the second part of the book by an examination of what Christ meant in the experience of the early church. Here it is the understanding of Jesus as corporate which is significant. The evidence does not depend on the use of titles, and it is spread throughout the NT. The combination of universal and particular in one person can only be described in terms appropriate to God himself. Here Moule goes into territory largely neglected in Christological discussion and more commonly traversed in ecclesiology. His claim is that the early church's experience of Jesus put him in a dimension beyond the human and the temporal.

The third part of the book reproduced a dialogue with Dr H. Willmer, first published in *Theology* in 1973-74, in which the question of the distinctiveness and particularity of Jesus is discussed and Moule defends his position *vis-a-vis* the problems raised by the question of the relation of Christianity to other religions.

I am probably too sympathetic to Professor Moule's position to be an effective critic of this book, which seems to me to be essentially right in its methods and conclusions. It is a good example of an attempt to avoid the impasse which has arisen in much discussion of the Christological titles, and in its correlation of the evidence in the Gospels and the thought of the early church it is reminiscent of a still valuable book from an earlier generation, James Denney's *Jesus and the Gospel*. It is full of valuable insights and sidelights on the NT. Perhaps my major criticism would be that it is too short, and that it could have been more convincing on certain crucial issues if the author had allowed himself more space. As a whole, however, it has a freshness and vigour which bring new life to what could be a hackneyed theme. This is an outstanding contribution to Christological study.

I. HOWARD MARSHALL

**THEOLOGY AND THE GOSPEL OF CHRIST : An essay in Reorientation** E. L. MASCALL

SPCK 1977 254pp £3.95

ISBN 0 281 03584 9

This is a 'Tract for the Times'. It is long, and is very far from being a popular tract. It is a powerful appeal, addressed to those who teach in our theological faculties and colleges as well as to those who guide theological education in ACCM and General Synod. It represents the mature thoughts of a brilliant man as he addresses himself to the urgent problem of the poverty of genuine theological thinking in our church today. It commends a view of theology as being done within God's church by committed Christians for the edification of pastors and people, and for God's glory. Certainly it is Anglo-Catholic theology at its best; but in most of what he says Dr Mascall speaks for

all orthodox Christians who, with him, are concerned both with the confusion caused by the 'unbelieving theologians' of today and with the lack of theological understanding in our parishes. Thus this is a book to be read; to be read soon; and to be read with care and with meditation. As a former student of Dr Mascall I feel honoured to be able enthusiastically to commend this book.

The areas covered are (i) the nature and task of theology, (ii) history and the gospels, (iii) Christology today. In the first, he regrets the low state of biblically-based theological thinking; in the second he attacks the scepticism of so many of our 'experts' in New Testament studies; and in the third he gives a spirited defence of a 'Christology from above' which is faithful to the insights of Chalcedon. Such theologians as B. Lonergan, Thomas Torrance, Jean Galot, John Meyendorff, and Louis Bouyer are commended, while such writers as Maurice Wiles, Denis Nineham, John Hick and John Robinson are strongly criticized. Buy, read and take to heart.

PETER TOON

### **JESUS BEFORE CHRISTIANITY : The Gospel of Liberation**

ALBERT NOLAN

*Darton, Longman and Todd 1977 159pp £2.40*

ISBN 0 232 51373 2

The bourgeois Jesus of nineteenth-century France and Germany is fast giving way in the twentieth-century to the proletariat Jesus.

Nolan, Provincial of the Dominical Order in South Africa, in one respect stands in the tradition of Renan: he is looking for the real Jesus behind the kerygmatic Christ. True, he does not drive the Tübingen wedge between Jesus and Paul, but rather between Jesus and post-Constantinian Christianity: 'My interest is in the man as he was before he became the object of Christian faith.'

Summarizing briefly, the author wants us consciously to repudiate the majority of Christologies elaborated by Western Christianity, in order that Jesus—as he was—should have 'the chance, once again today, to speak for himself.' Naturally, no one believes now that it is possible to approach Jesus with a totally open mind: 'to imagine that one can have historical objectivity without a perspective is an illusion.' But there are some perspectives on Jesus which obscure the true meaning of his mission—namely, orthodox ecclesiastical ones—and there are others which help to illuminate it.

Today, the supremely privileged place from which to hear and understand Jesus is among the downtrodden of the Third World. Their situation is analagous to those who most gladly heard and responded to Jesus: kept in a situation of abject poverty by military might, 'our present historical circumstances have quite unexpectedly provided us with a new perspective on Jesus of Nazareth.'

The book is an attempt, once again, to review the circumstances and purpose of Jesus' mission from this perspective. It is divided into four parts: Catastrophe, Praxis, Good News and Confrontation; which cover the response to all outcasts, his teaching on the Kingdom, and the final conflict with the entrenched powers.

The result is a basically refreshing, easily-flowing and imaginative interpretation of Jesus in his historical setting. Certain critical tools are used which, at times, certainly enable the author to avoid confronting texts which do not fit into his pattern. But they are never used for merely academic ends. Nolan's supreme purpose is to show that Jesus of Nazareth, and only he, can point the way to 'total liberation and fulfilment for mankind.'

Some systematic theologians may be scandalized by the portrait of Jesus that emerges; but to whom, after all, is Jesus really most accessible?

J. ANDREW KIRK

**PAUL AND PALESTINIAN JUDAISM : A comparison of patterns of religion** E. P. SANDERS

SCM Press 1977 627pp £15.00

ISBN 0 334 01227 9

This magisterial book is without question an important landmark in Pauline studies. Professor Sanders has chosen a title for it which deliberately echoes W. D. Davies on *Paul and Rabbinic Judaism* (1958); but his conclusions are very different from those of Davies, or indeed of any other writers on this complex subject known to me.

The two major sections of this work are chiefly concerned first with the character of Palestinian Judaism (that is, Judaism as reflected in material of Palestinian provenance) during the period 200 BCE - 200 CE; and then with the essential nature of Paul's theology, and its relationship to that form of Judaism. On the basis of a careful and exact examination of the evidence, supported by an impressive knowledge of the original sources, Sanders concludes Part 1 by claiming that the usual understanding of 'Rabbinic Judaism' as a legalistic religion of works is a complete misrepresentation. On the contrary, he argues, Judaism in the time of Jesus and Paul was a *positive* creed, centred in 'covenantal nomism' (election and ultimately salvation are the result of God's mercy rather than human achievement). Moreover, such a pattern featured in Judaism as a whole during this period, and even in the literature of Qumran; so that it is inaccurate to think of different 'Judaisms' then co-existing.

In Part 2 Sanders reaches rather more briefly the equally controversial conclusion that the controlling feature of Paul's religious understanding was 'participationist eschatology' (a salvific 'sharing' in Christ by faith, which is both present and future, and guaranteed

by the possession of the Spirit), rather than a juristic preoccupation with 'righteousness by faith'; and that this pattern was not established because Paul began with a problem (the human plight) and reached a solution (God's salvation in Christ), but the reverse. Thus Paul's type of religion is 'unique', and not based upon a reaction against contemporary Palestinian Judaism.

Here is a radical and much-needed reappraisal, which will be indispensable in future to every serious student of Judaism as well as Pauline Christianity. It is full of suggestive insights, fresh in treatment, clear in presentation, and readable in style. There are very full indexes, and a comprehensive bibliography. One of the most significant aspects of the book is its method; for Sanders insists—in line with his sub-title—that patterns of religion, in this case Judaism and Christianity, must be considered *whole*, rather than being treated as a piecemeal comparison of 'motifs'.

It is possible, nevertheless, that the thesis of this study will not meet with general scholarly approval, particularly from those writers with whom Sanders enters into polemical discussion! Some may not agree, for example, that the character of first century Judaism is uniform as he maintains; and others may wish to query his assertion that what Paul found wrong with Judaism—and the Jewish law—was simply that 'it was not Christianity' (p 552). On the latter point we may begin by asking, perhaps, whether Paul ever really ceased to be a Jew?

STEPHEN S. SMALLEY

**CHARISM AND SACRAMENT : A Theology of Christian Conversion**

DONALD L. GELPI SJ

SPCK 1977 258pp £3.95

ISBN 0 281 02977 6

This significant paperback by Professor Gelpi, a co-director at the Jesuit School of Theology at Berkeley, California, aims to explore the meaning and dimensions of Christian conversion; and in the light of that to explore the necessary and authentic relationship between charismatic piety and service, and sacramental ministry and worship in the church. The purpose of his wide-ranging reflections is to 'evoke fruitful dialogue between Catholic and Protestant and between the charismatic renewal and the Church universal'. His perspective for the task is the experiential approach suggested by the 'Process Theology' of the Whitehead-Pittenger school. The meaning and value of any theological doctrine or construction has to be clarified and tested by its impact in experience upon the emergent self of the Christian believer, as well as by its basis in sound exegesis of Scripture.

Gelpi's analysis of the need of fourfold conversion in the personality (emotional/affective, intellectual, moral/volitional, and religious/

spiritual) throws fascinating light on his discussion. Any minister would profit by his theological and pastoral insight, applied with great practical wisdom over a very wide field of Christian faith and experience and of church life and ministry. One is both refreshed by creative theological writing, and given a good understanding of the sort of thinking found increasingly in Roman Catholic circles today.

No reader of *Churchman* will agree with all the author's detailed conclusions, however. His grasp of the theological rationale of the atonement is inadequate; his dismissal of Satan, as well as Adam, as 'mythic', is unwarranted; his description of the ministry of pope, bishops and priests as 'the apostolate' is biblically unjustifiable; his equation of tongues plus interpretation with prophecy, and his analysis of prophecy as always abductive reflection, is inaccurate; and his attempts to harmonize his interpretations with the pronouncement of the official Roman pastoral *magisterium* are always spirited, but not always quite as convincing. Sometimes his use of terms will be unfamiliar to many Protestant readers. His experiential approach has led to great practical pastoral awareness, but unfortunately not to linguistic simplicity. Sections of spell-binding clarity and penetration are interspersed with quagmires of unnecessary process-theological and other jargon, which mars the clarity and readability of the book, and makes it unlikely reading for many lay people. Besides the dozen or more misprints, the binding is very poor, and double leaves keep falling out without any encouragement.

These defects should not deter the interested reader, nor detract from the overall challenge and stimulus of the work. Its central thesis is well-founded and irrefutable, namely that openness to the Holy Spirit of Jesus and all his gifts lies at the heart of all authentic sacramental worship and service. The church and its official ministry and worship must have the charismatic dimension, just as the latter greatly needs the teaching and oversight of ordained church leaders open to the Spirit.

JOHN P. BAKER

**THE WATER THAT DIVIDES : The Baptism Debate**

**D. BRIDGES & D. PHYPERS**

IVP 1977 208pp £1.60

ISBN 0 85110 395 2

The cover of this book is ornamented with the illustration of what look like five smooth stones, excellent for slaying giants or playing ducks and drakes. Perhaps they are meant to be blobs of water, highly magnified drops sprinkled on babies! But whatever they are, they do not represent the contents of the book; for while no giants are slain, there is also no playing ducks and drakes with a serious and pressing issue, and there is no doubt at all as to the clarity of the presentation and

argument. It is a joint work by an Anglican and a Baptist, at once frank and eirenical, concerned about the personal and pastoral problems created by the baptismal division for committed Christians in a mobile society; but extending the range of concern to the divisive issue now testing the constructive capacities of those in the ecumenical field, particularly as the churches face the demands of the Ten Propositions of the Churches' Unity Commission. There are three main parts to the book: the first briefly surveys the New Testament basis for baptismal doctrine and practice, and then sets out very fairly the two positions of paedobaptist and 'believer's baptism'. The second part surveys the history of the main formative periods of thought and influence in the controversy, briefly but with a satisfactory coverage of the contributory factors that have emerged in the course of time. Finally, there is a very proper posing of the continuing problems for those on both sides of the debate, affecting both their doctrine and practice; a drawing out of the central doctrinal emphases that, one way or the other, will affect the baptismal doctrine and practice; and a last chapter which looks at present attempts to resolve these matters, either as suggestions or as actual lived situations as in the Church of North India. There is a very good bibliography at the end which has very obviously directed the thinking of the writers; and a good index.

Nevertheless, Anglicans will note with some surprise the absence of reference to any of their standard works on doctrine, and particularly of sacraments, in the bibliography; and readers of this journal will note that no mention is made, say, of the work of Dr Griffith Thomas. If the authors had, for example, dipped into his *Principles of Theology* (2nd Ed. 1930) in pp 372-387 they would have found information from an Anglican evangelical theologian, who would have taught them the exegesis of 'baptism unto remission of sins' without having to resort to the Exclusive Brethren for a chance suggestion (p 146). And it would have saved them from the loose summary—and misleading one too—in their biblical section at the beginning which tells us that 'Christian baptism, like John's baptism, is a sign of repentance and forgiveness' (pp 19, 20). They might also have been more hesitant about accepting the doubtful reading of Acts 8:37 (the Ethiopian eunuch's profession of faith before baptism), which is absent from the great codices, important families of papyri, and versions, and in all modern English versions is properly relegated to a footnote. (It is odd to hear that 'many New Testament scholars' regard it as authentic when, if this were so, their views have made no impact on modern versions.)

Further reference to the same source would have assisted the writers in a more penetrating treatment of regeneration, and that with reference to baptism and to the use of prayer-book phraseology, in the service of Infant Baptism. There is also little reference to the

significance that infant baptism has, rightly ministered, of introducing the child into the active sphere of the Holy Spirit in the church, with a promise given and claimed in it of the Spirit's ministry through those of home and congregation. But there is a welcome critique of the proposals of the Ely Commission report, and of some evangelical support for its more radical recommendations. Perhaps the point could be even more firmly put that baptism as the initiation sacrament involves both the sign and the response of faith from the subject. The traditional infant baptism-confirmation pattern was designed with this in view for theological and pastoral reasons; no doubt modern conditions have created many problems in this, but this book rightly asks whether new suggestions in Anglican minds go far to meet these. It has no remarks on more recent Anglican views of initiation in the context of 'nurture', but no doubt much of its warning as to the need for some point in pastoral care of children that articulates a faith commitment would be again emphasized. There will be much to make Christians of all kinds face not only their traditional defensive arguments for their belief and practice with fresh care and assessment, but still more their deep basic understanding of the gospel; and also the nature of the church and its relation to society (family, community and nation), as all involved in the deceptively simple act of baptism. These, often unrecognized, lie like a river bed, beneath 'the waters that divide'; and congregations, ecumenical groups and inter-church discussions will find this book helpful in both perceiving the more radical issues in the debate and also in finding ways that may lead to turning the diverse river into one great baptismal pool.

G. J. C. MARCHANT

**DIVINE SUBSTANCE**      CHRISTOPHER STEAD

*Clarendon Press & OUP 1977* 315pp £12.50

ISBN 0 19 826630 8

This book is a 'must' for specialists but the general theological reader will find it heavy going.

Professor Stead has unusually wide qualifications for his subject. He has an expert knowledge of Greek philosophy from Plato and Aristotle to Neoplatonism, and makes skilful use of modern logical analysis. His discussions are always thorough and rigorous; though at points like the important distinction between numerical and specific identity, many readers would welcome a clear definition rather than a reference to a periodical article. He is a master in the art of the qualifier; always shrewdly and sometimes amusingly introduced, though its pursuit sometimes detracts from the clarity of the work as a whole.

The earlier chapters lay a solid foundation for the theological part of the work. As a philosophical term, 'substance' had many nuances

which depend upon the contexts in which it is applied in different systems. The author is less confident than many scholars that the Aristotelian distinction between first and second *ousia* in the Categories was normative for later Greek logic; though the designation of the concrete individual and the generic nature as 'substances' seems to cover a long-standing custom of later thought. After a thorough examination of the term *ousia* in the pre-Nicene Fathers, he passes to the use of the adjective *Homoousios* in the same period. Some readers may be surprised that the word is not evidenced in secular philosophy before Plotinus and Porphyry. The author rightly doubts whether its use in Valentinian circles influenced its introduction at Nicaea. Its Trinitarian application begins with Origen, though it is hardly a major theme in his theology. Professor Stead defends convincingly (against Bishop Hanson) the authenticity of the vital fragment of the Commentary on Hebrews. His treatment of the admittedly difficult evidence for the association of the word with Paul of Samosata and the Council which condemned him is unwarrantably dismissive, and the significance of the correspondence between the two Dionysii is much underexpounded.

In the chapter on Nicaea, Professor Stead restricts himself to documents closely related in time to the Council. This limitation is legitimate but it focuses attention on the word as an anti-Arian device and necessitates the omission of systems which made the rock of offence the headstone of the corner. At Nicaea the negated efficiency of the *Homoousios* was more apparent than its positive merits. These only emerged in the theologies of Hilary, Victorinus and the Cappadocians. We should have been even more in the author's debt if he had continued his survey to Constantinople. It was known in advance that Arius could not accept the word 'The *Homoousios* guaranteed very little', but that little was fatal to Arius. I do not follow the grounds on which the author excludes a generic sense of the word in view of the earlier evidence of Dionysius of Alexandria and the later elaborations of the Cappadocians. The evidence of Victorinus, who allows both *eadem substantia* and *simul substantia* as satisfactory equivalents, might even suggest that both senses were left open at Nicaea. Either way Arius could not accept it. Did the word contain two separate but related attacks on the Arian position? The explanatory gloss 'that is of the substance of the Father' covers the direct derivation of the Son from the Father and their ontological solidarity. But does the prefix *Homo-* also include parity of theological esteem? The author regards this as an indirect inference but not a primary affirmation, on the ground that the doctrine of the Trinity is necessarily asymmetric. The Father is the fount of deity within the Godhead. But Hilary found no difficulty in reconciling the equality of the Father and the Son with the distinctive roles of the Father as originator and the Son as recipient. On the vexed question of the immediate source of the

*Homoousios* at Nicaea, Professor Stead is notably cautious and reviews critically all the current theories. Certainly the role of Constantine was decisive, but was the Emperor the prime mover or the *sine qua non*? It is unlikely that the imperial neophyte had a theology of his own. The author dismisses the fashionable theory of Western influence on inadequate grounds. The traditional Western emphasis on the *una substantia* and the precedent of Dionysius of Rome may be more significant than he allows. The importance of the supporting role of Antioch (Eustathius and Marcellus) may still be suspected even though it is possible that they wished to go beyond the exclusion of Arius to the condemnation of Origenism. This may well be the meaning of the Sardican Manifesto and the curious complaint of Eustathius that the theologians were 'muzzled' at 'Nicaea'.

Professor Stead concludes that the use of substance language about the Godhead is still admissible though he inclines to approximate the statement 'God is substance' to affirmations like 'God is Light' and 'God is Spirit'. This is almost exactly the point made by Victorinus about A D 360!

H. E. W. TURNER

## THE ORIGINS OF LATIN CHRISTIANITY JEAN DANIELÉLOU

Westminster Press & Darton, Longman and Todd 1977 511pp £8.00  
ISBN 0 232 48197 0

This important book is the final volume of the late Cardinal Danielou's trilogy on the history of Christian doctrine before the Council of Nicaea. It is admirably translated and beautifully produced (apart from a few errors in Greek). Its price is £8 and not £12 as printed on the cover.

If Western writers who wrote in Greek are omitted, the evidence for the origins of early Latin Christianity is disappointingly meagre. The author extends this significantly from three sources: collections of testimonies or proof-texts often cited in a freer form than any received text, Latin translations of works originally written in Greek, and some tracts included in the writings of Cyprian to which he assigns an earlier date. This, taken with other evidence, suggests that the earliest phase of Latin Christianity was similar to the type of Judaeo-Christianity to which the first volume of this trilogy is devoted. Some important features, such as a strong emphasis on the unity of the Godhead, a tendency towards ethical rigorism and a marked eschatological perspective, cover the period as a whole and not merely its opening phase. Allegorical exegesis soon passes out of account and is replaced by a biblical typology which shows greater respect for the literal sense.

If, however, Latin Christianity had its characteristic emphases and independent development, it was never completely insulated from the East. The author stresses its indebtedness to the Asiatic theology of Theophilus, Melito and (in exegesis at least) Justin. No doubt Irenaeus was the main 'carrier' here. Both halves of Christendom tried to express Christian truths in terms drawn from pagan philosophy. Latin Christianity, however, found greater affinity with Stoicism than Platonism.

Tertullian was the great seminal figure in Western theology, corresponding to Origen in the Christian East; and to him the major and most brilliant part of the book is devoted. He liberated the West from undue reliance on the thought-forms of Judaeo-Christianity. His general philosophical stance was stoic rather than Platonist, though Danielou protests against the common assumption that he capitulated to Stoic materialism. His doctrinal works, though mostly directed against particular heretics, form a kind of *summa* of Christian theology covering the main heads of Christian doctrine. Particularly in his Trinitarian theology, Tertullian draws his technical terms from common use rather than from secular philosophy; indeed some seem to have been his own invention. This preference for concrete technical terms matches the sober realism of his exegesis. Without necessarily accepting the more conjectural parts of the author's interpretation here, we must agree with the author's estimate of the prime importance of Tertullian, as well as his failure even on his own terms to reach a satisfying conclusion.

The other distinctive feature of Latin Christianity during the period was the development of the doctrine of the church as a living and yet an authoritative society. The concept of the church as a society set within the world and yet apart from the world, and often in conflict with it, is traced from Tertullian through Novatian to Cyprian. The effect of changes in the relationship between church and state on the development of the doctrine of the church is carefully noted, as well as the more familiar theme of the changes in the ecclesiology of Cyprian arising from the controversies in which he was engaged. Yet there are common factors throughout the process: a deep pessimism about the future of the world; an ethical seriousness expressed alike in the puritanism of Tertullian, the rigorism of Novatian and the disciplinarianism of Cyprian; and above all an eschatological understanding of the church and its nature.

The learning and lucidity of the book are outstanding. As a quarry of information it will not quickly be superseded. Yet the author never loses sight of the wood in the trees; and the successive stages in the development of early Latin Christianity, and the significant differences between closely related figures, are clearly signposted. The reader will have only himself to blame if he gets lost!

H. E. W. TURNER

**THE BIBLE IN EARLY ENGLISH LITERATURE**

DAVID C. FOWLER

*Sheldon Press 1977 263pp £11.50*

ISBN 0 85969 117 9

To find anything more than rudimentary literary criticism of early English writing is like searching for the proverbial needle in the haystack. This book will not help. Indeed, despite its title, it is not until we reach page 87 that early English literature hovers into sight. Pre-Conquest poetry gets a cursory summary from pages 106 to 124, and even that includes *Beowulf*, whose claims to Christian associations are, to say the least, controversial. Nor can I be persuaded by the few lines of Mr Fowler's argument that the Old English elegies, *The Wanderer* and *The Seafarer*, belong to the Christian tradition. Literary criticism never gets much beyond syllable-counting (in lines of poetry) or vague general remarks such as those about the use of language of battle in *Exodus*. Despite long passages about Fairford Church windows and Gregory's Latin work on Job, no room is found for discussion, for example, of the *Andreas* or of Wulfstan's sermon to the English. Post-Conquest, we get some sample comparisons of biblical translation and then a whole, and largely irrelevant, chapter on Higden's *Polychronicon*. The best one can say about this work is that it contains some useful summaries and comparisons, but somebody else will have to work on the latter to bring out their literary value. The author speaks in the preface of using a zoom lens technique to concentrate on representative works, but in the end it is not the technique, but the result, that matters. We are promised a second part to the work, presumably to carry the topic down to 1500. It will need to be a lot better than this.

ARTHUR POLLARD

**THE CHURCH BEFORE THE COVENANTS**

WALTER ROLAND FOSTER

*Scottish Academic Press 1975 216pp £5.00*

An American Episcopalian here examines the Church of Scotland between 1596 and 1638. His sources are impressive: MS records of parish, presbytery and synod; courts ecclesiastical and civil; family papers; and more than 100 printed works. Professor Foster proves a surefooted guide through a crucial and confusing period when the kirk came to be administered both by bishops and by presbyterian courts (notably kirk sessions). Remembering the turbulent past (the heyday of the Melvillians) and the yet more turbulent future (the Covenanters), one finds the compromise improbable but working remarkably well. The terrible sentence of excommunication, for ex-

ample, was implemented through co-operation between bishop and presbytery, and the revival of episcopacy significantly did not call for 'reordination' of ministers (dear Anglicans, please note).

There are surprising features. Confirmation was seldom carried out. And less concerned with James VI's character than with his kingcraft, Foster permits that monarch to emerge rather creditably from this book. Other subjects dealt with at length include the training and settlement of the ministry, stipends, and parish life. By the end of the period under review we find that university education was the norm, and non-graduates rare in the ministry (Knox would have applauded the emphasis on education). While the book is admirably full of fascinating detail (more than 700 footnotes), it leaves bewilderingly unexplained the anti-Episcopalian uprising of 1638 which had been building up for some time.

J. D. DOUGLAS

**A DIFFERENT KIND OF GENTLEMAN : Parish Clergy as Professional Men in early and mid-Victorian England**  
BRIAN HEENEY

*Archon Books 1976 & Shoe String Press Illustrated £12.50*

Those readers of *Churchman* who feel that they have an honorary qualification for membership of Shoe String Press Inc. (the publishers of this book) may regard it as an expensive buy for 118 pages of text, with six more pages of short biographical notes. Many will prefer to borrow it. Those who do will be surprised to find how many of the modern preoccupations about the ordained ministry occur in this study of Victorian writers of pastoral theology. Dr Heeney draws on a number of writers of different traditions to illustrate his main thesis that, in the early nineteenth century, 'the Church of England clergyman was undergoing an important professional re-orientation' (p 95). In fact, there was pressure then, as there is today, for the ordained man to be 'a person with a distinct occupational role, requiring professional quality.' There is a strong social dimension to the ideal clergyman of the Victorian handbooks, which may surprise some, but with it a far stronger emphasis than today on the distinctiveness and separation from the world of the ministerial life. Whether Tractarian or Evangelical, the writers were reacting against their picture of the eighteenth century parson, too easily at home with the values of the squire. Of the evangelicals of the day, W. W. Champneys comes out as a leading practitioner and adviser on pastoral methods, and the younger Daniel Wilson is also mentioned (he should be distinguished from his father, also Daniel Wilson and vicar of Islington) on p 109 and in the index.

T. E. YATES

**THE LETTERS AND DIARIES OF JOHN HENRY NEWMAN**

**VOLUME XXIX:** The Cardinalate, January 1879 to  
September 1881

468pp £17.50 (published 1976) ISBN 0 19 920059 9

**VOLUME XXX:** A Cardinal's Apostolate, October 1881 to  
December 1884

488pp £17.50 (published 1976) ISBN 0 19 920060 2

**VOLUME XXXI:** The Last Years, January 1885 to August 1890  
with a supplement of Addenda to  
Volumes XI-XXX

439pp £18.50 (published 1977) ISBN 0 19 920083 1

edited by CHARLES STEPHEN DESSAIN  
& THOMAS GORNALL SJ

Clarendon Press & OUP 1976 and 1977

Although Newman first regarded the offer of the Red Hat as a 'piercing trial', he became reconciled to it once he was assured that he need not take up residence in Rome. The general public had no such hesitations. Newman's elevation was, to say the least, 'pleasing to English Catholics and to England itself.' His contemporaries eulogized him in many congratulatory letters. One Anglican priest friend wrote: 'I wonder if any man, at least of our time, was ever so loved by England.' He survived the visit to Rome, pneumonia included, and returned home to be feted in London and Oxford. Millais painted his portrait and exhibited it in Bond Street.

In February 1881 Newman was eighty. A year or more later he wrote: 'I am very well, as far as health goes—but I am more and more infirm. I am dim-sighted, deaf, lame, and have difficulty in talking and writing. And my memory is very bad.' He might have added his wearing elastic stockings for twenty-nine years. Nevertheless he remained incredibly industrious. The hours of letter-writing show us his pre-occupations—the state of Ireland; William Palmer's account of the Russian Church (it was ruled by a lay Vice-Patriarch who danced the Mazurka); work *On the Inspiration of Scripture* (Vol. XXX p 307 n. 3 should read RV not RSV); much correspondence with strangers, with friends and with publishers; many references to anniversaries and special intentions at Mass.

For Newman in his late eighties, the shades were lengthening and the fever of life was almost over. In April 1887 he told a friend that he had lost two inches in height in the previous year. He could not write without pain, nor read nor say Mass by candlelight. In the winter he was irked by much forced inactivity. One consolation! a *Life of the Cure d'Arts* was being read to him. Old friends were dying: Copeland, Ullathorne, Blachford. In these circumstances it is amazing that he had to concern himself at length with the Oratory School's Latin Play. But he was still working—revising his early work on St Athanasius and plunging into controversy with A. M. Fairbairn over a charge of

scepticism. Anne Mozley's forthcoming edition of a memoir and the correspondence of his Anglican period and various negotiations with publishers entailed much correspondence. Now at the last he was a living legend, flattered and appreciated more than ever. Here is his final letter. The long life is closed. He asked for these words to be inscribed on his memorial: '*Ex umbris et imaginibus in veritatem*'—'Out of shadows and images into the truth.'

A quarter of volume XXXI consists of letters which have come to light, as far afield as Finland and Philadelphia, too late for inclusion earlier in the series in chronological order. There is a pained letter to Newman's sister Jemima written some months after his conversion. There is interesting mention of the work of biblical translation in the 1850s. Newman reveals himself as an enthusiastic reader of Trollope. But generally speaking, these extra letters are for reference only. Taken out of context they are hardly riveting.

\* \* \* \*

Every letter is beautifully written and, as we have come to expect, wonderfully edited and produced. This mighty series, now concluded in respect of letters written in his Catholic period, enables the reader, like a Nonconformist minister in Norwich in 1882, to fall under the mighty spell of Newman's genius.

A warm tribute is due to the scholarship of Father C. S. Dessain, who died while the final volume was in the press. His outstanding work on the Newman Letters made him, as a *Times* appreciation put it, 'one of the great editors of our generation.' It is sad that he has not lived to continue collaborating with Father Gornall or to see publications of the ten projected volumes covering Newman's life up to 1845, for the present series only begins with that year.

ROGER JOB

## THE CHURCH IN EAST AFRICA : 1840-1974

W. B. ANDERSON

*Central Tanganyika Press 1977 197pp £2.25 paper £3.50 hard*

This welcome text book for schools and colleges captures something of the exciting buoyancy, deep convictions, enthusiasms and willingness to sacrifice which are hallmarks of this church. Mr Anderson writes from personal experience in East Africa and brings together for the first time in one volume a sympathetic but not uncritical account of the growth of the church in Kenya, Uganda and Tanzania. He shows how great is the impact of the Bible in the vernacular, the importance of laity in evangelism, the courage of Christians and their joyful, sometimes exuberant zeal.

It is a balanced, if rather brief, account of a big subject; yet your reviewer found several strange omissions. There is little sense of the missionary impact of the churches which took the gospel to Rwanda, Burundi and Congo-Zaire; no mention of Bishop Festo Kivengere or of the Diocesan Missionary Associations of Kenya. It is strange to talk of education but not of Carey Francis. The legacy of expensive medical institutions has not been questioned, and there is little discussion of Christian marriage. Neither the Church Army nor Christian Industrial Training Centres are mentioned. The author says relatively little about the proliferation of independent churches, and the slow rate of Africanization in some denominations.

These are matters of emphasis which could be corrected in subsequent editions of what is a valuable textbook. One also hopes that subsequent editions would mention the following books: *African Saints*, A. Luck (SCM); *Carey Francis of Kenya*, L. B. Greaves (Rex Collings Ltd.); *Christian Marriage in Africa*, A. Hastings (SPCK); *Kenya Churches Handbook*, ed. D. B. Barrett (Evangelical Press); *Medical Care in Developing Countries*, M. King (OUP).

J. WHEATLEY PRICE

**THE SECULAR JOURNAL**      **THOMAS MERTON**

Sheldon Press 1977 269pp £3.25

ISBN 0 85969 119 5

It is unkind to say that, if this book had been offered to a publisher by an unknown as journal jottings of his twenties, the publisher would not have risked money on it. But this book is by the late Thomas Merton; and when a hero has passed on, whether pop, film, military, poet, politician or anyone else, there is always scope for trivia to throw light on his or her development. Teilhard de Chardin and Thomas Merton are Roman Catholics who have helped many, and who consequently have attracted books by them and about them. The only Protestant I can recollect of similar attraction is C. S. Lewis.

Among the trivia there are two or three chapters of Alistair Cooke type, notably on Cuba; and again an immediate reaction to the reported reception of Rudolf Hess, since the journal covers the war period 1939-1941. There are several sound meditations on Christian doctrine, and a typical Merton assessment of his first residence in a monastic community. The final interesting chapter lists the books that were important factors in his conversion.

J. STAFFORD WRIGHT

**SIMONE WEIL : A Life**      **SIMONE PETREMENT**

Mowbray 1977 577pp £10.00

ISBN 0 264 66239 3

Immensely detailed, well written, well translated, well annotated, badly bound, this book tells the story of a woman who died at the age of thirty-four. That so brief a life should call forth so long a biography is in itself surprising. But this was no ordinary woman. It is good that Simone Weil's life should have been written by one who knew her intimately and was capable of entering into her thought and experience far more deeply than could most of her contemporaries.

For to many Simone Weil was—and to many she is still and will continue to be—an enigmatic figure. Very learned, a philosopher, a lover of the Greek and Latin classics, a student of Eastern religions, deeply sensitive to the beauty of nature, of art, of literature and of Gregorian chanting, she was a woman with the purity of a saint about her and the passion for truth of a martyr. She was a fighter. Her tongue could lash. She must have worried her parents almost to distraction. But human nature is complex, and that part of it which was Simone Weil was no exception.

Her death at an early age was due partly to tuberculosis but mainly to the fact that she would not eat. For many years she had been more than careless so far as she herself was concerned. She lived in the simplest fashion, preferring to sleep on the floor and, particularly in the war years, eating little out of a desire to live as her fellow-countrymen were living (or, rather, as she thought they were living). Her death, some would say, was due to disease; but it would seem that there was in it a large element of self-immolation, of mortification. She desired affliction.

She was a Jewess who spent the major part of her life in France. But she was an international figure, though it must be added that when, during the closing period of her life, she spent a short time in America and in London in order to promote her (abortive) plan for the formation of front-line nurses, her longing to return to France amounted to a passion. Here again, in this concept, there was an element of sacrifice amounting to a desire for self-immolation. But none of the war leaders would look at a concept which they could only conceive of as mad.

The philosophers and the politicians will find much of interest in this book. So will the students of Christianity and of religious experience. The more Simone Weil read and thought, the more she was led towards Christianity. Towards the end of her life she had an intense desire to receive Holy Communion. She went to Mass regularly. But, though she discussed the matter frequently with Roman Catholic priests and advisers, she never brought herself to the point of baptism. Why? No simple answer can be given to that question. Among the strands of the reasoning which held her back, two may be mentioned. One was that, at least at one stage of her life, she felt that

baptism would separate her from the great mass of unbelievers. Togetherness with others in trouble, be they factory-workers, oppressed natives in the French colonies, fighters in the Spanish Civil War, or whoever, was part and parcel of her creed and of her life. Another strand which held her back from being baptized was that she felt that she did not love God enough 'to deserve the grace of baptism.' But who of us does? And is not the heart of the meaning of baptism that God reaches out to receive us at the very point of our unworthiness? Was Simone Weil's God 'the God of the philosophers, he whom one seeks but who does not seek you?' And may that be a clue to the understanding of this life which was so great a mixture of glory and tragedy?

DONALD CANTUAR:

**C. H. DODD : Interpreter of the New Testament**  
**F. W. DILLISTONE**

*Hodder and Stoughton 1977 255pp £5.95*

ISBN 0 340 21592 5

Two years ago, Dr Dillistone produced a *Life of Charles Raven: Naturalist, Historian and Theologian*. In reviewing it, I said: 'The church has for many years been greatly indebted to Dr Dillistone for his theological writings. This is his first essay in biography. It is much to be hoped that it will not be his last.' He has fulfilled our hope—and done it beautifully.

It might be thought that the life of Dodd would be flat and uninteresting compared with that of Raven. Dodd, though his learning in his own field was immense, did not range out into the sciences as did Raven; nor was he a man of affairs in the church and in education as was Raven, the Master of Christ's and University Vice-Chancellor, and so on. But this *Life of Dodd* is the very reverse of uninteresting. The greatness of the book, to my mind, is that it succeeds *both* in revealing to us the character of the man whose story it tells *and* in expounding to us the thought which he himself expounded to succeeding generations of students and to readers of his books the world over.

The reading of this book brought back memories of this great little man: Dodd lecturing on the Mind of St Paul at Manchester University in 1931, just before he left for Cambridge to occupy the Norris-Hulse Chair with such distinction; Dodd as Director of the New English Bible, rarely missing a point as the work neared its close and his years advanced and his deafness increased; Dodd receiving copies of that Bible in Westminster Abbey in March 1970 and handing them to the representatives of the sponsoring churches and societies; Dodd in the nursing home at Goring-on-Thames in the Spring of 1973, still talking about the Bible as the closing months of his long life ran out.

## CHURCHMAN

Many will want to read this book: some because they knew Dodd well from lecture-room or seminar and want to catch a glimpse again of the small, dapper figure with the bird-like turn of the head; some because they owe a great debt to a man whom they may never have seen but whose thought has come through to them in the big books (such as his works on St John) and in the smaller books, such as *The Apostolic Preaching and its Developments*, which were none the less seminal to the thinking of students of the New Testament.

In 1970 Dodd's *The Founder of Christianity* appeared and was awarded the Collins prize. Clearly this was not one of the greatest of Dodd's works, and the judges were well aware of this. They awarded the prize because it seemed to them to provide an example of how a great scholar, one of the greatest New Testament scholars of his day, was able to set out the present position, as he saw it, of the bearing of modern scholarship on the person of Christ. After all, that had been Dodd's great ambition throughout his teaching career. Academic he certainly was, and he rejoiced in that. But all the time he had in mind the evangelistic and pastoral work of the church, for in his own person he combined those concerns.

How nice, as Dr Caird commented, to reach the position where you could 'wear your initials behind as well as in front of your name'—C. H. DODD, CH, DD! He bore his many honours lightly, for he was a humble man; but he richly deserved them all.

DONALD CANTUAR:

### WOMAN IN A MAN'S WORLD

Sheldon Press 1977 178pp £4.95

ROSAMUND ESSEX

ISBN 0 85969 129 2

What delighted me about this book was not so much the discovery that the redoubtable Rosamund and I had more in common than I had thought (we both did a bit of rowing at Oxford, both had an unfortunate accident with a vase of flowers at a harvest thanksgiving service, both formed similar views of some of the dignitaries of the C of E)—not so much that as the discovery that this unforgettable former editor of the *Church Times* had been driven throughout her career by concern for the poor; a concern that found expression in the work she has done since she left Portugal Street for Christian Aid.

Another revealing aspect of this autobiography is the light it sheds on women's ministry. Over the years Rosamund Essex has come to sense the compelling claims of ministry of word and sacraments (which she suggests should not be separated) on her personally. It would be a handsome accolade—and doubtless a spur to yet further effort—if Miss Essex became the first ordained woman in the Church of England.

I could not but reflect that to edit a religious weekly is to have the doubtful privilege of moving behind the scenes of institutional religion as well as meeting men and women of God.

JOHN C. KING

**MICHAEL QUOIST : A Biography**  
Hodder and Stoughton 1977 122pp £2.50

**NEVILLE CRYER**  
ISBN 0 340 20096 0

It is notoriously difficult to write a biography of a living person. Not only is it hard to assess the significance of a life still far from over; it is practically impossible to achieve the kind of intimacy which makes biography live. With Michel Quoist as his subject, however, Neville Cryer has two advantages. First, Quoist's discipleship has such clear definition that one feels time can serve only to underline its significance. Second, his own writings, and particularly his justly famous prayers, provide some of those fingerprints of the mind and spirit which can be deciphered by a gifted biographer about the business of a fully researched work.

Writing with clarity and economy Neville Cryer provides a highly readable impression of the man behind such famous titles as *Prayers of Life* and *The Christian Response*. It swiftly becomes clear that the man is greater than his books, and for those who admire his writing that will be praise indeed.

He emerges as a man of impressive scholarship (particularly in the field of sociology), world vision (with much practical involvement in work for the tragically poor of South America), and strong local commitment (he is parish priest in his home town of Le Havre). Such is the man who has introduced vast numbers of people to a new freedom and frankness in prayer. But is that sufficient reason for writing an early biography? Putting the book down, one becomes aware that here is a contemporary whose life and ministry reveal a very great deal about the world we live in, about the church's ministry in that world, and about the Roman Catholic Church since Vatican II. The wiser pronouncements of Popes, it seems to me, arise out of and find effect in the lives of men like Quoist. In getting to know Quoist we get to know a good deal about the work awaiting Christians today, and ways of getting on with it. That is why this is such a timely book.

DICK WILLIAMS

**FIRST LOVE : A Journey**      **LESLIE PAUL**  
SPCK 1977 215pp £4.95

ISBN 0 281 02975 X

Every so often one comes upon a book which is, in its own right, fascinating and yet with which one can detect virtually no sense of affinity. This, for me, is just such a book. I came to it immediately after

## CHURCHMAN

reading Michael Foot's *Aneurin Bevan*, so my mind was attuned to somewhat idealistic socialism; but there the similarity abruptly ends. From Nye, the *enfant terrible*, to Paul, the little boy lost, there lies a vast inchoate chasm. Not for Paul the harsh certainties brewed in Tredgar; instead a strange tentative wandering, a reeling from lost cause to lost cause (the Woodcraft Folk to the Personalist Movement—to name but two), the very incarnation of perceptive yet myopic oddity.

Mr Paul was, in the Twenties and Thirties—to use his own phrase—an 'aesthetic leftist'. From a rather dull Anglican childhood he moved to a Marxism of a part-atheist, part-pantheist flavour. He knew the 'death of things' and felt it deeply (the exact antithesis of the hymn's reminder that 'something lives in every hue, Christless eyes have never seen'). He saw that to be God-less was to exist in a world devoid of all true life, colour and vitality.

And so he came back to Christianity. A questing welt-schmerz-laden kind of Christianity. Agony at the world; joy in natural beauty. He does not much understand formal theology—or dislikes what he knows—and yet, for me, the whole book carries a sadness. Is it unctuous or patronizing to say that it is precisely the shapelessness of his theology and the lack of any sense of having been redeemed in Christ which reduces the prodigal's return to yet another lost cause? Again and again James Denney's words ring in my ears: 'It is better to be found in Christ than to be lost in God.' The apostle Paul knew that. The pilgrim Paul leaves one wondering.

MICHAEL SAWARD

### HEGEL'S PHILOSOPHY OF RELIGION

BERNARD M. G. REARDON

Macmillan 1977 147pp £8.95

ISBN 0 333 18659 1

### RELIGION, TRUTH AND LANGUAGE-GAMES

PATRICK SHERRY

Macmillan 1977 234pp £8.95

ISBN 0 333 19710 0

Both Hegel and Wittgenstein are thinkers whose intrinsic importance for the philosophy of religion is rivalled by their obscurity, and Macmillans have done the student a service by adding a volume on each to their Library of Philosophy and Religion.

In writing about Hegel, Bernard Reardon has in some ways had the easier lot. Hegel's interest in religion was explicit and his *Lectures on the Philosophy of Religion* form a copious source; though, as with Wittgenstein's later work, the fact that he left them unpublished does not make them easier to understand. Reardon's task has thus mainly been an expository one. After a chapter on Hegel's theological juvenilia he takes us through the main areas of his thinking, topic by

topic. For those without some previous knowledge of Hegel's ideas the going may be hard, since Reardon's method is to expound Hegel in terms of himself and his contemporaries rather than to attempt the hazardous task of trying to find a translation into present-day terms. Indeed, in the light of the final chapter no such translation is possible, for it remains lastingly obscure whether Hegel was a relatively orthodox Lutheran seeking to construct a world-view based on Christian insights, or a pantheist who successfully evacuated theological terminology of all genuine Christian content. Perhaps the extent of his influence has been due in no small measure to his ambivalence.

Wittgenstein in his later period had this much in common with Hegel: that he was seeking to do justice to the creative and corporate nature of thinking, as opposed to an image of the mind as essentially an isolated and passive recipient of impressions. Although sympathetic to religious belief, he was not a believer and religion was peripheral to his main philosophical interests, being mentioned mainly in pregnant *obiter dicta*. Rather than attempting to systematize these (an impossible task, since Wittgenstein's thinking was constantly developing), Patrick Sherry offers us a sketch of a philosophy of religion as seen from the standpoint of one who adopts the general philosophical position that Wittgenstein held in his later years, without suggesting that Wittgenstein actually held or would have agreed with the view that he represents. His purpose in writing is in large measure polemical. Wittgenstein's concept of 'language-games' has been much used, by D. Z. Phillips for example, as the basis for a counter-move against the verificationist critique of religion. According to this, a religion, like any other language-game, cannot be meaningfully criticized except in terms of itself. It is sufficient justification to point out that the game is played. As Sherry forcefully argues, however, this is not only self-stultifying but also a misrepresentation of Wittgenstein. For him, religion is not an example of a single language-game but a family of them, interlocking with each other and a variety of others; those of morality, for example. In terms of this interlocking, reasoned criticism is possible.

In any case, Sherry holds, the real problems for the philosopher of religion concern not verification but the establishment of concepts. Wittgenstein insisted on the importance of the *Sitz im Leben* of a language-game; and Sherry, following him, locates this for religion primarily in the cultivation of spirituality, defined as 'a way of life in which people attempt to acquire holiness and an awareness of the presence of God through prayer, meditation and other spiritual practices' (p 110). The practices presuppose the concepts, and provide an empirical anchorage and scope for at least a partial verification of them. Sherry admits to doubt whether they will bear the weight of traditional theology, as opposed to reductionist modernisms. Wittgenstein was unsympathetic to the cosmic dimension in Christ-

ianity and its ontological claims. Yet, stripped of them, Christianity is both intellectually and spiritually sterile. Hegel is a needed counterbalance here, right in principle if wrong in argument, both for believing in an Absolute and for identifying that Absolute with God.

FRANKLYN DULLEY

## ON SYNTHESIZING MARXISM AND CHRISTIANITY

DALE VREE

*John Wiley 1977 206pp £11.20*

The Christian-Marxist dialogue began nearly twenty years ago. Dale Vree is not at all impressed with its results; indeed he fundamentally questions the whole enterprise.

In this book he sets out to show that given the Christian and Marxist world-views, dialogue is impossible for both sides. Those who engage on it show they have abandoned their respective systems, ending up in hybrid and inconsistent positions.

The particular villains chosen to illustrate the point are the theologians Cox and Moltmann, and the heterodox communist Garaudy. The author reviews their attitude to Marxism and to Christianity respectively, and argues that in order to move the dialogue forward they have been forced to present, at best, a truncated view of their own traditions.

The book's main thesis is based on a number of unexamined premises. Basic to the argument is the assumption that both sides depart from a clearly definable orthodoxy, falling into 'heresy' or 'revisionism'. Vree undoubtedly performs a useful service in clarifying certain degrees of belief beyond which it is difficult to see how the adjective Christian or Marxist has any useful meaning. Nevertheless, to take as normative (i.e. orthodox) Christianity and Marxism what most Christians and Marxists 'most of the time, have believed' is to display either ignorance or insensitivity to the present epistemological debate, one might almost say struggle, on both sides. To start with, normativity cannot be established on the same principle for both belief-systems; and in the second place, orthodoxy is automatically identified with those power structures which historically, have claimed the right to dispense the truth—the (undivided ?) church and the centralized (in Moscow?) party system. In point of fact, there is little sociological (or theological) difference between certain church and party structures, as Berdiaeff showed long ago.

This basic assumption vitiates much of the book's argument, causing the author to do less than justice to the positions he examines. He even admits that it is hard to lump Moltmann and Cox together. But this is precisely the point: a slightly less historically-conditioned

approach to orthodoxy would allow the author to appreciate nuances and disagreements in what he imagines is a monolithic repudiation of basic Christian positions.

Certain parts of the book, notwithstanding, are very helpful; especially his analysis of classical Marxism-Leninism (generally, he does much better in his appreciation of Marxism, though he claims to be a Christian). But in the last resort he does little to clarify the issues in a creative fashion, for who would not prefer 'Socialism with a human face' to psychological re-education, even if the change in theory causes Lenin to turn in his grave? And why should it still be assumed that the European and North American tradition of Christianity defines orthodoxy ('most Christians, most of the time')? How long before 'most Christians' belong to very different historical, geographical and culture milieus?

J. ANDREW KIRK

**FOR BETTER FOR WORSE : A Symposium on Marriage**  
edited by CHESLYN JONES

*The Church Literature Association 1977 60pp £0.80 ISBN 0 85191 094 7*

This symposium is a revised version of that first published in 1971 in response to the Report *Marriage, Divorce and the Church*. The latter's controversial recommendation of the remarriage in church of divorcees, under certain conditions, runs counter to the 'official' position of the Church of England (Act of Convocation, 1957). *For Better For Worse* defends the 'official' position, and is a valuable exposition of the Catholic Anglican view of the metaphysical marriage bond and its indissolubility. But that view has its difficulties.

It is affirmed (J. H. Jacques) that 'one-flesh' implies indissolubility, but this is not argued, and it is not clear that divorce is never contemplated in the New Testament. E. W. Trueman Dicken explores the 'erosive process' by which the church's confidence in its discipline has been undermined, and rejects the thesis that the indissolubilist view of marriage is a 'product of the late Victorian age'. In fact, both indissolubilist and non-indissolubilist views have long histories, and more work needs to be done on the intention of the English Reformers in the marriage service, before the 'historic Anglican position' can be declared to be unambiguously one or the other.

Christ's teaching is referred to (Cheslyn Jones) as 'unusually specific and prescriptive'. But does Jesus give prescriptive legislation? Does he not rather declare God's creation intention for marriage, while also recognizing the failure of sinful people to live to God's perfection?

David Steven argues that it would be fatal to any pastoral ministry of reconciliation for the Church of England to remarry divorcees. To

## CHURCHMAN

be sure, there are different aspects of truth to be proclaimed by the church's discipline and pastoral practice: one is the call to God's standards and of the availability of God's grace in helping us towards them; another is the reality of sin and of the gospel of forgiveness. For some, reconciliation to God may be found through repentance and the grace to start again.

Someone who has once broken vows, says John Lucas, cannot be free to make new ones all over again. But is that so, and does that apply only to marriage vows? Any fault committed will surely reduce one's moral credibility for the next time, but if that were all that could be said, our sins would all accumulate against us. I thought the gospel was Good News precisely at this point.

In this thorny area of pastoral urgency and human pain, there is need for the church to be the bulwark of truth in a sea of uncertainties. There is need also for a ministry of hope for those who have failed. *For Better For Worse* is a clear call for standards; I am not sure that it says enough about gospel.

There is a chapter on remarriage in the Orthodox Church, and an appendix on the present Law of Divorce.

DAVID ATKINSON

## FREE FALL JO ANN KELLEY SMITH

SPCK 1977 138pp £2.50

ISBN 0 281 02978 4

Books on death and dying are bombarding us almost daily as researchers discover an area forbidden so long. Many of them cover this very personal subject in a detached clinical way. This book is different. 'It is not just a book on dying, it is almost a diary of a young woman and mother, wife and Christian, who is willing to share with us her struggle with her faith and her cancer'. So says Elizabeth Kubler Ross in her foreword.

How important for the priest, pastor, doctor or nurse to be told of the effect of radical surgery on a woman proud of her body. How vital to see the questioning of well-loved expressions of faith, and the anguish of man and wife as they struggle to understand their Christianity in the light of imminent death.

But by far the most important message of this book is that a patient, a parishioner, is a person—an individual who needs treatment, pastoral care, tailored for them. The patient is also, however, part of the community; family, friends, hospital staff and fellow church-goers need help to grapple with what is happening to their loved-one and to themselves.

Death is clearly seen not as a single act, but as a life-dominating process occupying every moment from the terminal diagnosis onwards. The real sadness of this process is seen in the continual efforts

to draw closer to loved ones thwarted by feelings of rejection towards those who continue to live. Only an eternal life that gives new life *now* can answer this.

A book that must be read, especially by professionals involved with dying people.

ALAN MAUDE

**THE CHRISTIAN MINISTRY**      CHARLES BRIDGES  
*The Banner of Truth Trust 1977* 390pp £2.95      ISBN 0 85151 087 6

It is interesting to reflect upon the continuing popularity of a work on the ministry first published in 1830. Its chief value is the introduction it gives, by means of extensive quotations, to past great writers on the subject: Augustine, Luther, Baxter, Alleine, Cotton Mather and a host of others. Naturally the book does not approach any of the burning questions of the twentieth century and yet it manages to challenge and encourage the minister in his work. Some of the advice is quaint: 'The importance of order also in the regulation of our servants is most obvious' or 'We would suggest also a monthly meeting at the parsonage, of the higher or middling females, for the purpose of working for the poor, or some other definite object'. The author is also wordy and repetitious. He continues to be useful, however, in his sharp perception into ministerial temptations, his stout plea for clear biblical preaching, and in his solid commitment to a person-centred pastoral ministry.

IAN D. BUNTING

**THE MARRIAGE SERVICE : Alternative Services, Series 3**  
AS 350  
*SPCK & privileged presses 1977*

After all the debate, amendments and snide chuckles in the General Synod, the Series 3 Marriage Service is at last here. Tastefully produced in a blue format to match the other Series 3 services, it offers couples of the seventies the opportunity to plight their troth (now 'this my solemn vow') in contemporary language. Welcome features are the compulsory requirements of a Scripture reading, the flexibility of structure (though that has been possible in 1662), the optional use of acclamations and, as in Series 3 Funeral Services, a useful selection of suitable prayers to cover various aspects of marriage. One can envisage the pastor (is it significant that the word 'priest' is used of the minister at this service?) using these prayers in preparation talks to find out what each couple want him to pray for, and why.

Obedience on the bride's part is now optional, as are the giving away and the exchanging of rings. It is disappointing that we are not yet as enlightened as the Roman Catholics who make rubrical allowance for bride and bridegroom to compose their own prayers for the occasion, and we could still learn from them in the presentation of the booklet, as their New Marriage Book includes a selection of hymns with symbolic directions for posture. It also remains to be seen how appropriate it is to have the introduction to the service *after* the sentence, greeting, collect, lesson(s) and sermon. This feature has appeared since the draft was published in GS 228, and could make the introduction an anticlimax.

DAVID H. WHEATON

**NEW WINESKINS : Changing the Man-made Structures  
of the Church**      **HOWARD A. SNYDER**

*Marshall, Morgan and Scott* 1977 192pp £1.95

ISBN 0 551 05562 6

What is the appropriate wineskin to contain the new wine of the gospel? Howard Snyder grapples with this question as it relates to the churches and their ministry. The traditional structures come in for trenchant criticism and, on the basis of New Testament models, new guidelines are suggested for rebuilding today's church. Proximity, corporateness, flexibility, cross-cultural commitment and the encouragement of spiritual gifts are the looked-for marks in the living local church.

So far so good, but the book is unbalanced in its critique of institutional religion in general and the institutional church in particular. It is not fair to blame David and excuse God for the building of the first temple. The tabernacle is not a 'truer' sign of the presence of God than the temple. Does the modern church really suffer from 'edifice complex'? It would do better justice to the evidence, and strengthen the author's case, if he gave a more sympathetic account of the contribution of religious institutions than the acknowledgement that they have a certain typological and eschatological legitimacy. The church building, like the temple, like the tabernacle, says something important about God and our relationship to him. It is a sign of the unity of God's people, a symbol of God's presence, a place for prayer, an expression of man's worship and a continuing reminder of the fact that God has spoken, acted and lived in the experience of our forefathers. It is this sense of history which is most lacking in current thinking about the church.

Of course any institution can ossify the faith it was set up to proclaim. We always need to hear prophetic voices like Snyder; but the cataclysm, all but recommended by him—church buildings sold, clergy earning a secular living, large congregations split up into small

groups—will not, of itself, achieve the growth anticipated. One cannot simply jump from biblical models to practical prescriptions. One cannot simply jump from the first century to John Wesley to the renewal movements of the late twentieth century and conclude that we now know God's way of doing things. Models are not blueprints. They illustrate truths about God's relationship to his people in Christ. Howard Snyder underlines some of these truths most helpfully and draws out their implications. This is a good book for the seventies. My guess is that, in the longer term, we shall see a reaction to present trends and we shall then need to turn to more basic theological considerations in making up our minds about the style of local churches.

IAN D. BUNTING

**HYMNALS AND CHORALE BOOKS OF THE KLINCK  
MEMORIAL LIBRARY** compiled by CARL SCHALK

*Concordia Teachers College (River Forest, Illinois) 1975*

**HYMN BOOKS AT WITTENBERG** edited by LOUIS VOIGT

*Chantry Music Press (Springfield, Ohio) 1975*

Both works are bibliographical catalogues of major hymn book collections in America and much of the information appears for the first time in such a classified form. Carl Schalk lists 557 items from the basic collections to be found at Concordia Teachers College, River Forest, Illinois; The Klinck Memorial Library; the A. R. Kretzmann collection; and the compiler's own private library of hymnological sources. Until this listing was compiled, the majority of these holdings were uncatalogued. There is a particular emphasis on American and German Lutheran hymn-books but the hymnic productions of most major denominations find their place.

Voigt lists 1084 items, chronologically organized under national and denominational headings, which are to be found in the collections of Hamma School of Theology, Wittenberg School of Music, and the Thomas Library, all at Springfield, Ohio. One major heading was unfortunately omitted: *General Synod of the Evangelical Lutheran Church in the U.S.A.*, which should be inserted between numbers 282 and 283. Voigt's catalogue similarly concentrates on American and German Lutheranism, but about half the items listed are English language hymn-books of more than twenty denominations.

Both catalogues cover similar ground but neither renders the other redundant. Schalk's bibliography presents the title-pages in full and gives a brief description of each volume, whereas Voigt's gives only short titles but covers about twice as many volumes and includes

## CHURCHMAN

invaluable indices of persons and places. Although both were originally intended to be finding lists for these particular collections of hymn-books, their wider usefulness cannot be over-estimated; the vast ocean of hymn book production, especially in the nineteenth century, is largely uncharted and these aids will be thankfully turned to by the hymnologist who finds himself somewhat adrift! However, it is a pity neither of the editors has cross-referenced his entries with existing bibliographical sources such as those of Wackernagel, Zahn, Fischer-Tümpel, the *Short Title Catalogue*, etc.

One hopes that other libraries, institutions and private collectors will be encouraged to produce bibliographies of their own holdings. To have accurate listings of, for example, the magnificent hymnological collection of Concordia Seminary Library, St Louis, Missouri, or the collection of hymn-books in Dr Williams's Library, London, or the Maurice Frost Collection, which is on permanent loan from the Royal School of Church Music at the Royal College of Music, London, would be of immense value for an accurate evaluation of the patterns of worship in previous generations and also for establishing inter-relationships between, and family trees of, particular hymn-books.

ROBIN A. LEAVER