REVIEWS OF BOOKS.

BONIFACE THE EIGHTH, 1294–1303. By T. S. R. Boase. Makers of the Middle Ages. Pp. xiii + 397. Frontispiece and map. *Constable & Co.* 15*s.* net.

A series which purports to present to the modern world an account of the outstanding personalities and formative influences of the Middle Ages is certainly to be welcomed. For much new information has been made available in recent years and its popularisation is now urgently needed. Not that the present series is popular in the ordinary sense of the term; but if this volume, the second of the series to be issued, is to be a standard for the future, then these volumes will undoubtedly make a powerful popular appeal. Primarily, however, they are obviously intended to be substantial contributions to historical knowledge, being based on careful research and adequate documentation.

The subject chosen for the present volume is certainly an attractive one. Boniface was undoubtedly one of the outstanding characters of the late Middle Ages. How far he was actually a "Maker" may be disputed, for the impression conveyed by the present book rather tends to picture him as the energetic preserver of established rights, power and privileges than a creative genius. But his forceful and energetic character and his resolute assertion of uncompromising claims makes it almost impossible for him to be excluded from such a series.

Two widely different aims dominated the career of Boniface. The greater and more creditable of these was his resolute maintenance of the full papal claims. The sonorous phrases of his famous Bull *Unam Sanctam* come down to us even to-day with something of the original thunder clinging to them. No one could have pitched higher the claims of the Roman See. But in spite of it all his life was a tragedy and no amount of glamour can conceal the fact. He lived at the end of one epoch and the beginning of another. He epitomises the age of the great popes, but he comes almost too late. Innocent III might thunder and men might tremble; but the thunder of Boniface seems almost like stage thunder against the accumulating forces of nationalism. Men began to estimate with a more critical acumen the real consequences of papal displeasure. The writer brings out well the degree of respect which the great leaders of the time paid to papal protests. It was unfortunate for Boniface that he had to deal with powerful forces which until his reign had been only slowly coming to maturity. The value of the present work, however, lies not merely in its clear delineation of the forces with which Boniface had to contend but in its picture of the man. In these pages we can see the fierce old Pope not as the history books generally depict him but as a man with many sides to his character. For it is easy to criticise and even to condemn such popes as these, but we must be just to

them. Boniface was a man of his age as is well shown by the second great aim of his career. Alongside of his official attitude as the guardian of papal rights we must place his persistent effort to augment the family fortunes. At times it is difficult to grasp which of the two aims seemed to him the more urgent. But the fact that they both existed in the same man adds a certain piquancy to his life. He was not so bad as he has often been painted; the writer makes this quite clear and produces evidence which is on the whole convincing. Boniface was so placed that he had to fight hard to attain his ends and fighting was not uncongenial to him. But he was no aggressor, attempting to blaze new trails of ecclesiastical authority. His attitude was defensive rather than aggressive. As the author says, Boniface was not uncritical of the Church, and even in the case of heresy, so long as it did not disturb the organised life of the Church he does not seem to have worried about it overmuch, though this, of course, may have been due to a certain obtuseness to the intellectual atmosphere of his time. This attitude is well shown in the historic dispute between the Conventual and Spiritual Franciscans, in which he is credited with rebuking the former with the blunt remark "they do better than you."

These considerations, however, cannot hide from us the fact that such a character was ill fitted to be a true "successor of the Apostles." His violence of temper and overweening desire to aggrandise his family do not go well with his exalted position. No doubt when one considers the dangers that beset the Church on many sides such a Pope was not without his uses, as Philip IV of France found to his cost. But it is a high price to pay for the preservation of an essentially spiritual religion.

This book with its studied moderation, and its careful adhesion to documentary evidence, will well repay the most exacting study, and we are grateful for its appearance.

C. J. O.

THE ARCHÆOLOGY OF HEROD'S TEMPLE. By F. J. Hollis, D.D. *J. M. Dent & Son, Ltd.* 18*s.* 6*d.* net.

Jerusalem, situated on a hill, must have been a wonderful sight in the days of Jesus with the vast Mount on which the Temple was built towering high above it. Where the Temple was and what it was like is the theme of this very scholarly and illuminating book. Modern excavations on the actual site of the Temple have produced a great deal of information and thrown a new light upon the details of the massive pile of buildings erected by King Herod on the Temple Hill. But even so, as Dr. Oesterley points out in the Foreword to the book, "experts have not yet been able to construct a plan of the Temple with architectural precision." The reason for this is that it is difficult to reconcile the chief ancient sources, Josephus and the Jewish Tractate Middoth in the Babylonian Talmud, with the archæological evidence. Josephus studied more to magnify the King's work than to give exact details, while the Jewish Tractate appears to have been religious in purpose and only gives

the measurements of the sacred courts, and, with one or two exceptions, completely ignores the great buildings which were erected around the inner Temple. Dr. Hollis feels that reliable information can be obtained from both these ancient sources provided that due allowance is made for a possible bias and inconsistency in each case, and if their account of the buildings and courts is carefully compared with the findings of exploration in the Haram esh-Sherif it is possible to offer a reconciliation between them and to make a fairly accurate plan of Herod's Temple.

A point which is emphasised is that the Temple with its surrounding buildings was a citadel capable of a prolonged defence when attacked, and this explains the large area of the Platform as it now exists. The Temple was a fortress and it was planned to be of sufficient size to garrison an army of defenders.

The position of the Holy of Holies and the great altar of sacrifice is carefully considered and conclusive reasons are given for upholding the ancient Jewish tradition that the Holy of Holies was built on the sacred rock and that the altar was placed in the threshing floor of Araunah, which is held to have been "on the fairly level hill-top surrounding the sacred rock but not on the rock itself." On these assumptions both Josephus and Middoth can be used to construct a plan of the Temple. Moreover, if the altar had been set up on the sacred rock, the Temple would have stood to the west of the Rock es-Sakara, and, as Dr. Hollis points out, this would have required enormous substructures at least 40 feet deep to carry the west end of the Temple and still deeper ones for the Porticoes in the Outer Court, and there is no trace of these to-day.

Another important question raised in this admirable book is the axis of the Temple and its Courts. Dr. Hollis offers reasons for supposing that Solomon's Porches stood originally where the east wall now is and that Solomon's Temple was erected with its axis at right angles to the Porches. If this is so, then the Temple stood with its axis at right angles to a line of direction from the sacred rock to the Mount of Olives, quite regardless of the fact that the direction of the Porches as a base line was not to north and south. The reason for this, he holds, was due to an ancient tradition of the sanctity of the Mount of Olives originally connected with Sun-worship. After the exile the Temple was built due east and west, no doubt to avoid any reference to Sun-worship. This offers an interpretation of the tradition preserved in the Palestinian Talmud Tractate Sukkah which reads "Our Fathers in this place stood with their backs to the Temple and worshipped towards the Sun, towards the east, but we belong to the Lord and our eyes are directed towards the Lord." That is to say in the second Temple they worshipped facing towards the Temple with their backs turned to the rising sun. This also seems to explain the curious gamma-shaped extension of the altar which Dr. Hollis contends was to the southward and eastward and required to bring the altar into the correct position on the new axis of the Temple.

It is true that in the plan of the Temple offered in this book the

Courts appear to be askew, yet they fit into the area which is known to be ancient in the Platform of the rock. Herod found the position of the Temple fixed, but the position of the walls built by him was largely determined by the configuration of the ground and the valleys above which he constructed his walls. In this reconstruction, with the Temple placed over the sacred rock, the buildings are found to fit the bedrock of the hill. In the arrangement of the Courts, the author has been able to show that the animals required for the sacrifices could be easily driven to the place of sacrifice without having to go up large flights of steps.

The position of the various Courts and the approaches thereto are carefully explained, and the book has a large number of illustrative plates which are of tremendous help to the reader to depict the wonderful pile of buildings which existed in the days of our Lord.

At the end of the book a new translation of the Mishnic Tractate Middoth with very full notes has been added and this will be a great help to students of the Mishnah.

In conclusion it must be said that Dr. Hollis has rendered notable service by this contribution to the archæological and architectural study of the ancient Temple and is to be congratulated on the excellence of the book. It is well written, well documented, attractively produced, illustrated with clear drawings and is provided with a good index of subjects. It will be of great interest to all who are keen to depict the scenes of our Lord's life on earth.

T. R. B.

ESSAYS IN CONSTRUCTION. By W. R. Matthews, M.A., D.D. *Nisbet & Co., Ltd.* 7*s.* 6*d.* net.

The Dean of Exeter's aim in this volume is to help the general reader, to interest him and to stimulate him to reflection on some of the ultimate problems of life. As he truly states: "One of the achievements of the Reformation—perhaps the greatest—was to destroy the idea that the clergy had the sole right of teaching divine truth and that it was the part of the layman to accept what he was taught." One of the difficulties of our day is, however, that the language of the theologians and philosophers has no apparent connection with the ordinary thought of the average layman. Such terms as: "Reality," "The absolute," "The altogether other," "Givenness," "Numinous," and other current expressions of the experts convey no idea whatever to the general reader. Any thinker who can enable a preacher or teacher to bring the ideas represented by these terms into some sort of connection with the thoughts of the people will perform a useful service. Dr. Matthews may help in this volume to produce some such result by leading laymen to face the ultimate problems of religion, but we fear that his efforts will be confined in their effect to a small number of the thinking laity. The confusion of thought at present existing allows many misconceptions to prevail as to the true nature of Religion. The Psychologists desire to treat it as an

illusion; the idea of God is merely a "projection," or a "Father fixation." Dr. Matthews makes clear the necessary distinction between mere illusion and symbolical knowledge. Much of our religion has to be expressed in symbol, and while illusion is simply error, "Symbolical knowledge is truth expressed in images which are inadequate but not completely misleading." We have to recognise the truth that "the native language of religion is symbol"; and Dr. Matthews is probably right when he says: "Perhaps it would have been better if dogmatic theologians had read more poetry." There are two realms of existence that require examination; that of Nature and that of Value. In Nature the fact of evolution has often been confused with theories about its causes, but it is not opposed to the idea of teleology and a creative mind; in fact it may be a most impressive witness for belief in God. Yet there is a realm of value into which evolution does not enter, and a man's place in this may be described as that of a Son of God. When Dr. Matthews turns to the examination of Historical Religion, he is faced with the question of the Personality of Jesus and His Finality as a Revelation of God, and with the whole problem of the Virgin Birth. He holds that "it is possible to believe the essential doctrines of the Christian faith while doubting or rejecting the Virgin Birth." He points out that the idea that the supernatural Birth of Christ was necessary in order that the inherited guilt of original sin might not attach to Him implied that original sin is propagated entirely by the male sex, and that the Roman doctrine of the Immaculate Conception of the Blessed Virgin Mary was a kind of wild logic which only succeeds in removing the difficulty one stage further back. He maintains that there is a religious value in the Virgin Birth. The problem of evil has, he says, been the cause of more defections from religion than all the writings of the atheists. It involves the question "What is the world for?" and leads on to the thought of the Victorious God, so that the Christian Message is a Gospel of Redemption and has its centre in the Cross, so that "when Jesus on the Cross as God and man ceases to be preached, the Gospel evaporates." It is not easy to follow the argument of the chapter on Magic, Rhythm and Sacrifice. The concluding chapters on Immortality and the Resurrection, in which he says "that if the belief in the Resurrection were abandoned Christianity would cease to exist," lead on to an assertion of the culmination that will come when the Christian Church has achieved its full stature, and the creative power of the Gospel has seen its widest scope. For those who desire an interesting and valuable survey of some of the most important tendencies of modern thought in relation to the Christian Faith, we can recommend the careful study of these essays of Dr. Matthews.

GREAT CHRISTIANS. Edited by R. S. Forman. *Ivor Nicholson & Watson.* 8*s.* 6*d.* net.

The lives of prominent Christians can serve the useful purpose of indicating the chief features of any age of Christianity. In the

selection of forty Great Christians to represent the last fifty years, the editor of this volume has been guided by a desire to be as nearly all-embracing as possible, to show how many-faceted our Christian religion is and to give the portraits of those for whom the sympathetic draughtsmen could be found. No doubt, as he says, a different selection could easily be made, and Evangelical Churchmen could have suggested a number of names beside that of the Bishop Chavasse who is the only Evangelical clergyman represented. Among the laity who have been more or less associated with the Evangelical School are Dr. Barnardo, Sir Edward Clarke, and Lord Russell of Liverpool. The advanced School of English Churchmanship has secured a full measure of representation in this selection. It includes Father Dolling, Bishop Gore, Canon Scott Holland, Bishop King, Lord Phillimore, the Rev. A. H. Stanton, and Bishop Weston. Other types of Churchmanship are represented by Miss Lily Dougall, Donald Hankey, Studdert Kennedy, Bishop Lightfoot, Forbes Robinson, and Bishop Westcott. Nonconformity is also strongly represented. Feminine activities are remembered by such names as Mrs. Catherine Booth and Miss Josephine Butler, and in the poetical world by Christina Rossetti. Dr. Clifford and C. H. Spurgeon represent the Baptists, Sir Robertson Nicoll represents the Presbyterians, Dr. T. Hodgkin the Quakers, Dr. R. W. Dale and Joseph Parker the Congregationalists, Hugh Price Hughes the Wesleyans, while other representative names are C. T. Studd, one of the Cambridge Seven whose self-sacrificing missionary work is well known; Margaret MacDonald, wife of the present Premier; Hale White, the author of *The Autobiography of Mark Rutherford.* The Roman Catholics are Lord Acton, Baron Von Hügel, and Father Tyrrell, none of whom can be regarded as typical representatives of the orthodox Roman system. These names indicate the intellectual, spiritual, and social activities of their time, and show that there was in it a vigorous Christian life although it expressed itself in such a variety of forms. It is difficult to say if the next fifty years will produce as many outstanding examples of Christian influence, but we trust that the period will be marked by a considerable effort to secure a larger degree of unity in Christendom, and a more successful application of Christian principles to all the spheres of life. These records are well and sympathetically written and should provide preachers with a supply of illustrative matter for their sermons.

HISTORY OF THE CHURCH OF IRELAND, FROM THE EARLIEST TIMES TO THE PRESENT DAY. Edited by Walter Alison Phillips, Litt.D., Volume I: The Celtic Church. *Oxford University Press.* 3 Vols. 31*s.* 6*d.* net.

In the year 1929 the General Synod of the Church of Ireland passed a resolution desiring that a strong body of professional historical Students should compile a standard history of the Church of Ireland with special reference to the origins and the continuity of its Faith and Order. The present work is the outcome of this

resolution. Last year, when the Church of Ireland celebrated the fifteen hundredth anniversary of St. Patrick's coming to Ireland, there were many discussions as to the authenticity of the history of St. Patrick, and it was hoped that a record of the early history of the Irish Church would settle many controversial matters, and that a standard history of the Church of Ireland would represent the general consensus of scholars. The present volume, which has been issued under the general editorship of Dr. Walter Alison Phillips, Lecky Professor of Modern History in the University of Dublin, is mainly the work of three Irish scholars who have already made their reputation as students of the early records of the Irish Church. Canon J. E. L. Oulton, Archbishop King's Professor of Divinity, contributes the opening chapter on the Church of Gaul. Canon Newport J. D. White, Regius Professor of Divinity in the University of Dublin, contributes the chapter on the Teaching of St. Patrick. The remaining five chapters on Pre-Patrician Christianity, The Mission of St. Patrick, Constitution and Character of the Irish Church, The Mission Work and Expansion of Celtic Christianity, and Services and Ritual of the Celtic Church, are the work of the Rev. J. L. Gough Meissner. Canon Oulton's chapter is a clear and adequate statement of the main features of the origin and growth of the Church in Gaul and its relations with the Papal See, its forms of worship, and its creed up to the fifth century. Canon White, in his chapter on the Teaching of St. Patrick, examines the various documents that give evidence of St. Patrick's teaching, and show his adherence to the great essential Articles of the Christian Faith, while at the same time there is no evidence of later doctrinal developments such as Transubstantiation. In fact, there is little reference to the Eucharist in contrast to the disproportionate position that it had in the minds of those who accepted that dogma. St. Patrick probably used a liturgy of the Gallican type, and the liturgy of the Church of Rome was not accepted in Ireland until the seventh century, so that the Roman conception of the nature of the Presence of the Lord at the Eucharist was not exactly that of the modern Roman Church. The doctrine of Purgatory and the use of Indulgences were unknown in St. Patrick's time. The Virgin Mary is not once named by St. Patrick. He also knows of no Intercessors for Sinners save Christ and the Holy Spirit, and this fact is a sufficient condemnation of the practice of the Invocation of Saints. The Veneration of Relics, of Saints, and of pictures is intensified in a society in which magic is allowed to control action. The conclusion is that St. Patrick's personal religion was so pure and intense that we can say with confidence that he was as free from superstition as any man of his age. It is clear that St. Patrick taught none of the doctrines which are distinctive of the modern Roman Church in Ireland.

When we come to the chapters of the Rev. J. L. Gough Meissner, which deal with the major portion of the period, we cannot ignore the fact that his work has given rise to keen controversy in Ireland. Mr. Meissner, who has already written a history of Celtic Christianity, has adopted certain views as to the influence of Scottish Christianity

upon Ireland which are regarded as distinctly original. They run counter to the views that have been held by a number of earlier Irish scholars, and some of those who cannot accept his theories complain somewhat bitterly that they should be laid down in the official history of the Church of Ireland. Mr. Meissner regards the Christian community of St. Ninian which existed in the neighbourhood of the Roman walls in North Britain as having exerted extensive influence in Ireland, and that Ninian was responsible for the founding of the greater part of the Christianity of that land. It is said that the evidence for this is inadequate, as the sources of information date from the twelfth century, and that Mr. Meissner's deductions from the identification of place-names with St. Ninian are largely fanciful. Authorities like Dr. Bury, Dr. Todd and Dr. Reeves differ widely from Mr. Meissner, but it must be recognised that there are considerable differences of opinion even among these scholars. Mr. Meissner tends to minimise the work of St. Patrick, and it is maintained that this is contrary to the bulk of the evidence. It is contended also that Mr. Meissner has given much too great weight to less reliable authorities of a later date, and that his obsession with the Ninian Church has coloured all his writing, with the result that his picture of St. Patrick and the early Celtic Church is unreliable. These questions of scholarship will have to be settled by the competent scholars, and no doubt, the whole subject will be discussed more fully in the near future. In the meantime, it seems regrettable that a work which was intended to be the standard history of the Church of Ireland should be received with so much controversy and should not commend itself to those who have made a special study of the period.

THE ROMANCE OF PARISH REGISTERS. By R. W. Muncy, M.A., Chaplain and Master at the Imperial Service College, Windsor. With a Foreword by the Bishop of Norwich. *Lincoln Williams, Ltd.* 6*s.* net.

The sense of tradition so lamentably lacking in the youth of to-day is well served by this most entertaining and instructive little book. It tells of the Jewish genealogical registers as well as those of the Greeks and Romans, and later of the Monastic registers, and the parochial registers of Spain in 1497. English registers begins from the Injunction of Cromwell of 1538, which ran: "That every parson vicare and curate keep one boke or register . . . which boke ye shall every Sonday take furthe and in the presence of the said wardens . . . write and recorde in the same all the weddinges christenynges and buryenges made the hole weke before." For the omission to do so a fine of 3*s.* 4*d.* was extracted "to be emploied on the reparation of the same churche." The Author roams freely over the country in his selection of interesting and amusing entries, and must be especially commended for his condensation of historical matter into nine chapters. It is a great pity that the excellent idea of including a list of printed parish

registers (presumably for the use of genealogists) was not checked. Apparently the list is meant to contain all published registers of Baptisms, Burials, and Marriages, but being somewhat well acquainted with the counties of Durham and York, we notice some omissions, and doubtless there may be others from the remaining counties. The registers omitted from the list are: Co. Durham; Gainford (Elliot Stock, 1889); Castle Eden (Dur. and Northm. P.R.S., XXIX); Whorlton (*Ibid.*, XIX). Co. York; Calverley (S. Margerison, 1880). With regard to the registers of St. Ken, Cornwall (p. 27), which were burnt in 1923, Messrs. Phillimore did not transcribe the baptisms and burials, and, as is their custom, only published the marriages. It is possible that the Bishop's Transcripts are extant, but the note relative to a modern transcription is misleading. Pickhill, Co. York, is again mentioned as "Prickhill," and Kirky Hill should read Kirkby Hill. With regard to "Curious Surnames" (p. 57) that of Hodgeskin means relative or kin of Hodge, i.e. Roger, and Grissel is doubtless the common old name of Grisel (diminutive of Griselda), while Easter was a common spelling of Esther. Feminine Christian names are in use as surnames at the present day, viz. Rose, Muriel, and Marga(e)ry, for example. We are sorry to spoil the Author's obvious suggestion in his mention of "Easter Christmas," but this bride undoubtedly bore the name of the Biblical book.

Mr. Muncy does not mention the latest "romance," namely the return to the parish of Poslingford, Suffolk, of the first volume of its registers which for a great number of years has been reposing in, and believed to be appertaining to, the parish of Heybridge, Essex. This volume of Poslingford dates from 1558. Meanwhile, the next book dating from 1678 was thought to be the earliest record extant in that parish. Want of space forbids details of these interesting facts. Mr. Muncy's book should prove a stimulation to the study of the interesting records of the past preserved in so many parishes.

M. S.

THE SOCIAL IMPLICATIONS OF THE OXFORD MOVEMENT. By William George Peck. Pp. x + 346. *Scribners.* 7*s.* 6*d.* net.

Mr. Peck has been in Anglican orders only five years, coming as a convert from Methodism. He is to-day an Anglo-Catholic rector, known in many quarters as a lecturer on social and religious subjects. He is evidently an industrious worker and reader, and himself persuaded of what he writes. This volume contains some useful information but is too obviously a case of special pleading. It does not convince one that social reform owes or will owe any great debt to the Oxford Movement. There have been and there will be individual social reformers owning allegiance to Anglo-Catholicism: there have been and there will be greater numbers in other branches of the Church.

F. B.